

**Historical Architectural Review Board  
COA Final Review Sheet**

---

**HDC-2023-00074**

**Address: 1539-51 W. Chew Street**

**District: West Park Historic District**

**Applicant: Russell Pacala, Spillman Farmer Architects**

**Proposal: Convert church to mixed use and rehabilitate envelope**

---

**Project Description:**

This application proposes to adaptively reuse the former church building at 1539-51 Chew Street and convert it into office, community, recovery, and living space for Ripple Community Inc. The conversion would require the removal of several stained-glass windows and replacement with aluminum windows, roof and gutter repairs, masonry repointing, accessibility updates, door replacement, the addition of exterior lighting, new signage, replacement of railings, installation of a stone stoop at the front entrance, installation of an ADA entrance at 16<sup>th</sup> Street, relocation of HVAC units, landscape improvements, and the removal of non-historic fencing. Much of the church's exterior would remain intact, and the adjacent parking lot would remain. At its October 2023 meeting, the HARB reviewed a preliminary application for the work. This application seeks final approval.



**Front façade of 1539-51 W. Chew Street, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**



**South and east elevations of 1539-51 W. Chew Street, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**

**Historical Architectural Review Board  
COA Final Review Sheet**

---



**View of the church from 16<sup>th</sup> and Chew Streets, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**



**View of the church and parking lot from Monroe Street, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**



**Windows on the west elevation to be replaced, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**



**Windows on the east elevation to be replaced, 2023.  
(Google StreetView)**

# Historical Architectural Review Board

## COA Final Review Sheet

---

### Applicable Guidelines:

#### **Chapter 3.1 – Roofs**

**3.1.3** Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

**3.1.4** Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

**3.1.5** Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

**3.1.6** Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

**3.1.7** If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

#### **Chapter 3.3 – Masonry**

**3.3.3** Repair and restore existing stone masonry. Attempt to repair deteriorated or damaged areas prior to replacement. Appropriate repairs include repointing, crack repair, Dutchman repairs (in-kind localized patching), and patching with compatible compounds. New masonry unit should match the existing in type of stone, color, profile, dimension, and surface texture.

**3.3.4** Repoint brick and stone masonry with a compatible and historically appropriate mortar that matches the original in composition, strength, hardness, and texture. Match new mortar joints to surrounding areas in width, tooling profile, and color. Cut back and repoint mortar joints using hand tools only; mechanical grinders and similar power tools are not recommended as they can lead to excessive damage.

**3.3.6** Preserve and restore decorative masonry elements that are important character-defining features, such as brick corbels and patterned brick courses. Avoid altering, concealing or covering, or removing decorative masonry.

#### **Chapter 3.5 – Windows**

**3.5.7** Repair, restore, and reuse original windows prior to replacing them. Where one component of a window is deteriorated or broken, repair or replace the individual piece rather than replace the entire window unit. Repair or selectively replace in-kind existing hardware to ensure window operability, including sash cords, weights, and pulleys. Repaired windows have been shown to achieve energy performance levels comparable to replacement windows.

**3.5.8** Replace windows in-kind if original windows are deteriorated beyond feasible repair. Wood is the preferred material for most replacement windows. Replacement windows should match the original as closely as possible in material, size, type, operation, profile, and appearance. Replicate the existing dimensions of glazing, configuration of muntins, or unique decorative lights. Match sash and frame thickness and window depths. For existing non-original windows, it is preferred to replace with wood windows rather than new alternate windows.

**3.5.9** Replace windows with alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Replacement windows must match the original as closely as possible in type, size, operation, profile, appearance, and configuration of lites and muntins. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an appropriate alternate because they can replicate the original appearance and

## Historical Architectural Review Board

### COA Final Review Sheet

---

material. Composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exterior surfaces can be appropriate alternates if they match the original appearance, but are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. Vinyl windows are not appropriate due to short lifespan, poor performance, and inability to match historic profiles.

**3.5.10** Preserve the ratio of window openings to solid wall surfaces. Increasing or reducing openings can impact the proportions of a facade and can look out of place within the larger streetscape. Changing the size of openings will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a façade.

**3.5.11** Retain the historic pattern of window openings (fenestration pattern), especially on primary facades. Avoid inserting new windows into a facade or infilling existing windows. The position, number, and arrangement of windows defines the rhythm of a facade and can be a character-defining feature of an architectural style or a type of building use. If creating new openings or infilling existing ones is necessary for a project such as an adaptive reuse, locate openings on side or rear facades.

**3.5.15** Replace deteriorated window trim or decorative elements only as necessary to match the size, profile, and material of the original elements. For window lintels or hoods that project from the façade plane and are vulnerable to water collection, consider installing metal drip edges to shed water away from windows. Copper is recommended and should be left to weather naturally; aluminum is acceptable and should be painted to match surrounding materials. Avoid encasing wood sills with metal or vinyl, as they will trap moisture and may cause more damage.

### Chapter 3.6 – Doors

**3.6.5** Repair and restore historic doors whenever possible rather than replace them. Historic doors include front doors, rear doors, and grocer's alley doors. Original materials should not be discarded. If repair and reuse is not possible, salvage may be an option and the existing feature used as a template for replication.

**3.6.6** Repair, restore, and reuse existing door frames, jambs, threshold, fixed transoms, and similar components. Existing components are usually historic wood. Replace in-kind if existing materials are severely deteriorated. Replicate the profile and width of door frames, jambs, and transoms in order to preserve the solid-to-void ratio of the entrance.

**3.6.7** Repair, restore, and reuse hardware whenever possible. Replace hardware in-kind if necessary. New hardware should match the original hardware as closely as possible if the original hardware remains. If not, hardware that is compatible with the era of construction and style of the building is recommended. Avoid replacing historic hardware with digital locks, combination locks, keypads, or similar technology.

**3.6.8** Replace doors in-kind if repair is not feasible. Replacement doors should duplicate the original in material, design, size, profile, and operation. Original doors may be used as a template for replication. Wood is the most appropriate material for residential doors. Paneled wood doors should have the same number, size, and profile of panels as the historic door. If the original design is unknown, the building's style and date of construction should inform the appropriate replacement.

**3.6.9** Replace with durable alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Composite wood doors and fiberglass doors are acceptable replacements if new doors match the original in size, style, configuration, detail, and appearance. However, these products are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. They have shorter lifespan and deteriorate when exposed to moisture, weathering, and temperature variation. For replacement doors, avoid metal doors (including metal doors that imitate paneled wood), as they do not have the same appearance and texture of historic wood. Avoid pre-hung doors (doors that are purchased already installed in a frame) when replacing a door, because these require the removal of historic fabric and can change the size of the opening.

## **Historical Architectural Review Board COA Final Review Sheet**

---

**3.6.10** Preserve the size of the existing door opening. New doors should be custom sized if necessary. Avoid enlarging or filling in original door openings to fit new stock sizes. This alteration will impact the historic character of the building. This action will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a facade.

**3.6.11** Consider replacement of a previously altered door with a historically appropriate wood door.

### **Chapter 3.8 – Mechanical & Utility Equipment**

**3.8.1** Limit the number of roof and wall penetrations when designing and installing new HVAC systems. Penetrations, whether located on a roof or exterior wall, increase the risk of water infiltration and damage to the building envelope. Properly flash and waterproof all penetrations.

**3.8.4** For mini-split or wall-mounted systems, place wall-penetrating units on rear or non-visible facades. Place units at grade adjacent to rear or non-visible facades.

**3.8.5** Screen mechanical units at grade with landscaping features or historically appropriate fencing if units cannot be placed out of view from the street. Install equipment, dunnage, and related mounting systems in the least invasive method feasible so that the alteration is reversible in the future.

### **Chapter 3.12 – Fences & Streetscape Features**

**3.12.21** If in-kind replacement is not feasible or new fixtures are being installed, select new fixtures that are compatible with the scale and style of the building and its primary facade components (usually windows and doors). Small, simple, and discreet designs are generally the most appropriate.

**3.12.22** Attach all fixtures in such a manner that does not damage historic materials or obscure architectural features. Fixtures attached to masonry walls should be anchored into mortar joints, not the masonry units.

**3.12.23** Conceal conduit and wiring to the greatest extent possible and paint any visible wiring to match the background material. Exposed conduit at primary facades is not appropriate.

**3.12.24** Avoid installing floodlights and spotlights. They are not appropriate on primary or highly visible facades. They are not recommended for rear facades because they can be disruptive to neighboring buildings. Exceptions may be made on a case by case basis where security is necessary.

### **Chapter 3.13 – Commercial Storefronts**

**3.13.11** Repair and restore original or historic signage whenever possible. Replace in-kind if materials are severely deteriorated. It is rare that original or historic signage remains intact within the historic districts today, but any example should be preserved.

**3.13.12** Locate new signs in historically appropriate locations, such as the sign band directly below a cornice or the ends of a facade at the second story.

**3.13.13** Reuse existing hardware, supports, and brackets if possible to reduce the number of new holes created in exterior walls. Patch and repair holes or similar damage caused by previous signs installations.

**3.13.14** Attach signs in a method that does not damage historic materials. For signs attached to a masonry facade, anchors should be placed in mortar joints, not in the masonry unit. Installations should be reversible and should only require minor repairs or patches if removed in the future.

**3.13.15** Scale signs to be compatible with the proportions and scale of the storefront and building. Compatible proportions should minimize the visual impact of the sign when looking at the building or streetscape. Small signs are usually the

## **Historical Architectural Review Board COA Final Review Sheet**

---

most appropriate. The size of signs and lettering should prioritize pedestrians rather than vehicles. Text heights between 6 and 12 inches is generally recommended.

**3.13.19** Design signs to complement the architectural character of the building and the surrounding historic districts. Individual expression and creativity are encouraged while respecting the primary of historic character. Simple fonts are recommended and both serif or sans serif fonts can be appropriate. Use colors that promote legibility and complement the building's existing color scheme; muted tones, colors found in nature, white, and black are generally appropriate. Avoid excessively ornate fonts, a mix of many different fonts, and bright, neon, or high-contrast color schemes.

**3.13.20** Coordinate the fonts and color palettes used if multiple signs are proposed for an individual building.

**3.13.21** Use high-quality and durable materials. Wood was the most common material historically for signs, especially projecting and hanging signs, and is appropriate. Metal brackets and hardware are appropriate. Metal lettering and signs, pigmented glass, and painted lettering are also appropriate. Box signs are not recommended, and internally-illuminated box signs are not permitted by the Zoning Ordinance. Avoid vinyl and plastic lettering and signs.

**3.13.27** Use sign illumination and lights that are simple and complement the historic building and district. Simple gooseneck lights mounted above the sign are recommended as historically appropriate shape and profile.

**3.13.28** Direct lighting toward the sign and avoid excessive illumination of areas outside of the sign. Uplighting is not appropriate.

**3.13.29** Conceal wiring, conduits, and similar equipment. Paint any elements that cannot be concealed to blend in with background materials.

**3.13.30** Attach light fixtures that are not integrated into the sign in a method that does not damage historic materials or features.

### **Chapter 3.14 – Accessibility & Code Required Work**

**3.14.3** Identify character-defining features and original materials so that work will not result in their damage or loss. Retain historic materials, building elements, and features whenever possible.

**3.14.4** Design and construct modifications in such a manner that they do not destroy, remove, or obscure (within reason) historic materials. Consider provisions for reversibility so that modifications can be easily removed without damaging historic fabric in the future.

**3.14.6** Select exterior finishes that match the historic building or are visually compatible, or paint when possible without causing damage to the underlying material.

**3.14.7** Document historic and existing materials in the area of proposed work prior to construction in photographs and/or drawings. Submit documentation to Staff to include in the property file.

**3.14.8** If adding handrails to historic properties becomes necessary in order to address accessibility and life safety issues, design simple handrails that do not detract from historic railings and so they do not detract from the character-defining features of the property. Simple wood or metal railings are appropriate options.

**3.14.9** Provide access through a primary entrance whenever feasible. As often as possible, the accessible route should be the circulation route used by the general public.

## Historical Architectural Review Board

### COA Final Review Sheet

---

**3.14.10** Retain original and historic doors, locations and proportion of door openings, and hardware whenever possible. If removal of doors becomes necessary, retain frames and jambs in place. Significant permanent changes to original doors, porticos, or stairs at a primary entrance are not recommended.

**3.14.11** If use of the primary entrance is not feasible, provide alternatives to develop at least one accessible entrance on a secondary facade, located close to the primary entrance.

**3.14.12** Avoid rear or service entrances as the only accessible means of access.

**3.14.13** For accessible entrances not at the primary entrance, provide directional signage that complies with all regulations while being minimally visually intrusive.

**3.14.14** Design alterations, modifications, and new entrances to be compatible with the building's architectural style and materials, and that is visually cohesive.

**3.14.15** Provide compliant thresholds, hardware, and similar details that are compatible with the historic building in appearance and finish whenever possible, or are simple and visually cohesive. Modify existing door sills or thresholds to accommodate ground level entry if ramps and/or lifts are provided at the building interior.

**3.14.16** Modify sidewalk or walkway elevations a few inches, where possible to provide an accessible entry and meet all code requirements at ground level entrances.

### Chapter 3.15 – Demolition

**3.15.14** If demolition is pursued, salvage building features and historic materials that are suitable for reuse. Architectural salvage is a responsible environmental practice and is encouraged so that historic materials could be reused at other historic buildings. Demolition work must comply with all applicable codes and health and safety regulations.

**3.15.15** If demolition is pursued, document the building thoroughly prior to demolition. Photographs and measured drawings (plans, elevations, sections, and details of unique features) or similar documentation should be submitted to Staff for inclusion in the property file.

### Observations & Comments:

This review contains several items that comply with the design guidelines and do not warrant full discussion, provided further details are submitted to staff for final approval. This work includes the following: roof and gutter repairs, masonry repointing, removal of the non-historic fencing, and the removal of asphalt paving and installation of grass. Staff has the following comment on the remainder of the proposed scope:

#### *Windows*

The applicant has updated the windows proposed to replace the stained-glass windows, which are identified in note W7 in the drawings. The change includes an adjustment to the operable window and mullion placement within the window system resulting from energy code requirements. Staff finds the change to be relatively minor and has no objection.

The applicant also provided two options for the double-hung sash windows at the building's lower level. The historic windows include a three-over-three configuration, and the applicant proposes to maintain the placement of the muntins to replicate the historic appearance. The difference in the options is material, with a proposal for an aluminum-clad wood window and a fiberglass window. Staff notes that Guideline 3.5.9 gives preference to the aluminum-clad wood window though fiberglass is also acceptable. Staff supports the use of either option.

#### *Mechanical & Utility Equipment*

The revised application includes the heights and locations of the HVAC units with proposed landscape screening. The plans include fourteen units that would be 37-inches high, with two larger units (53-inches and 72-inches in height) at the

## Historical Architectural Review Board COA Final Review Sheet

---

center and rear of the building. Landscaping would be used to screen all units. The plan complies with the guidelines, which advocate for using vegetation and landscape design to mitigate the visibility of HVAC systems (p. 70).

At the rear elevation, the plans show four new penetrations and note that the vents and louvers will be painted to match the masonry. The roof would also include three penetrations on each side of the ridgeline that would be painted black to minimize their visibility.

### *Fences & Streetscape Features*

The application proposes to locate a dumpster with a retaining wall along Monroe Street adjacent to the parking area. The gate and material for the retaining wall have been provided. The application proposes to install a PVC plank gate in a woodgrain texture finish. The retaining wall would be comprised of a split-face block in a gray-beige color to complement the masonry of the historic structure. Staff finds that because the dumpster area is located at the rear of the side yard, the design and materials would not have an adverse impact on the church building, are appropriate, and comply with Guideline 3.12.12.

### *Accessibility & Code Required Work*

On the 16<sup>th</sup> Street elevation at the southwest corner, a new ADA entrance is proposed where a secondary entrance currently exists. In the preliminary review comments, staff recommended lowering the existing doors and inserting a secondary transom between the relocated door and existing transom. The applicant has provided details that show the alteration of the entryway with the lowered door and additional transom. Staff finds that the proposed design largely complies with Guideline 3.14.10 and would have the least visual impact and would preserve the most historic fabric.

At the primary entrance, the application proposes to install a new stone stoop for safety reasons and code compliance. New railings would replicate the existing in design. Staff finds that, provided the stone stoop matches the original in color, texture, finish, and overall appearance, the work will comply with the guidelines in Section 3.14.

### *Exterior Lighting*

The application has been updated to include a lighting plan. The light fixtures proposed at the entryways include a design compatible with historic buildings and complies with Guideline 3.12.21. A simple exterior light is proposed to illuminate the signage near the corner of 16<sup>th</sup> and Chew Streets. Other lighting includes spot lighting, which Guideline 3.12.24 advises against in most cases. Staff requests clarification on whether the lighting identified as SL3 would be up or down lighting. In general, staff considers the floodlights to be acceptable, provided they are mounted inconspicuously and appropriately. Staff notes that to comply with Guideline 3.12.22, all fixtures should be attached in a manner that does not damage historic materials or obscure architectural features. All new fixtures should be anchored into mortar joints rather than the historic stone. Additionally, Guideline 3.12.23 recommends concealing all conduit and not leaving any conduit exposed at primary facades.

### **Staff Recommendation:**

Approval, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, 3.3 Masonry, 3.5 Windows, 3.6 Doors, 3.8 Mechanical & Utility Equipment, 3.12 Fences & Streetscape Features, 3.13 Commercial Storefronts, 3.14 Accessibility & Code Required Work, and 3.15 Demolition, provided the following:

- The stained-glass windows proposed for replacement should be documented prior to removal and salvaged to the greatest extent possible;
  - The existing conditions of the 16<sup>th</sup> Street entrance should be thoroughly documented prior to any work commencing to comply with Guideline 3.14.7;
  - Floodlights should be mounted inconspicuously and appropriately;
  - All new light fixtures should be attached in a manner that does not damage historic materials or obscure architectural features;
  - All new light fixtures should be anchored into mortar joints rather than stone; and
  - All conduit should be concealed at primary facades.
-



# Historical Architectural Review Board

## COA Final Review Sheet

---

### **HARB Discussion:**

The applicants clarified the questions raised in the staff overview and stated that the flood lights would be down lit only and would provide no up lighting. Mr. Didra elaborated that the gate would be the 4-inch slat wall Madison style gate in a black powder coat.

Mr. Jordan asked whether any specific requirements should be noted regarding the staff's recommendation to attach the lighting in an inconspicuous location. Ms. Keller responded that the lights could be placed at locations such as around window sills, though she noted that the lights are not proposed at the front façade and that those proposed on the elevation facing the parking lot do not concern her. Mr. Didra explained that the lights would be included on the 16<sup>th</sup> Street elevation and would be mounted at approximately 12-feet in height to provide illumination to the pedestrian walkway and outdoor area. He added that the fixtures selected would be architecturally neutral. Ms. Keller stated that the comment comes directly from the design guidelines and that she included it since the lights are not shown in elevation.

The HARB commended the applicant for the sensitive reuse of the building.

### **Action:**

Mr. Hart moved to approve the application presented on 11/6/2023 for the conversion of the church building to mixed use and the rehabilitation of the envelope, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, 3.3 Masonry, 3.5 Windows, 3.6 Doors, 3.8 Mechanical & Utility Equipment, 3.12 Fences & Streetscape Features, 3.13 Commercial Storefronts, 3.14 Accessibility & Code Required Work, and 3.15 Demolition, with the following conditions:

- The stained-glass windows proposed for replacement should be documented prior to removal and salvaged to the greatest extent possible;
- The existing conditions of the 16<sup>th</sup> Street entrance should be thoroughly documented prior to any work commencing to comply with Guideline 3.14.7;
- Floodlights should be mounted inconspicuously and appropriately;
- All new light fixtures should be attached in a manner that does not damage historic materials or obscure architectural features;
- All new light fixtures should be anchored into mortar joints rather than stone; and
- All conduit should be concealed at primary facades.

Mr. Huber seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.