

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Preliminary Review Sheet**

HDC-2024-00015

Address: 1515 Linden Street

District: West Park Historic District

Owner: City of Allentown

Applicant: Bryne Heffner-Bair

Proposal: replace single doors on bandshell at West Park

Building Description: This structure is the West Park Band Shell building. It is a 2 story detached structure with flat roof with semi-spherical roof over the stage, deep classical cornice, stucco front with pilasters and arched proscenium, wood siding on the remaining facades, 4 doors of various styles, 6 over 6 wood double hung windows on the sides and rear, The structure dates from the late 19th/early 20th century and is Classical in style.

Project Description:

This application proposes to replace all the single doors on the band shell with solid steel doors due to vandalism in the park.



Door 1



Door 2



Door 3



Door 4

Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.6 – Doors

3.6.5 Repair and restore historic doors whenever possible rather than replace them. Historic doors include front doors, rear doors, and grocer’s alley doors. Original materials should not be discarded. If repair and reuse is not possible, salvage may be an option and the existing feature used as a template for replication.

3.6.6 Repair, restore, and reuse existing door frames, jambs, threshold, fixed transoms, and similar components. Existing components are usually historic wood. Replace in-kind if existing materials are severely deteriorated. Replicate the profile and width of door frames, jambs, and transoms in order to preserve the solid-to-void ratio of the entrance.

3.6.7 Repair, restore, and reuse hardware whenever possible. Replace hardware in-kind if necessary. New hardware should match the original hardware as closely as possible if the original hardware remains. If not, hardware that is compatible with the era of construction and style of the building is recommended. Avoid replacing historic hardware with digital locks, combination locks, keypads, or similar technology.

3.6.8 Replace doors in-kind if repair is not feasible. Replacement doors should duplicate the original in material, design, size, profile, and operation. Original doors may be used as a template for replication. Wood is the most appropriate material for residential doors. Paneled wood doors should have the same number, size, and profile of panels as the historic door. If the original design is unknown, the building’s style and date of construction should inform the appropriate replacement.

3.6.9 Replace with durable alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Composite wood doors and fiberglass doors are acceptable replacements if new doors match the original in size, style, configuration, detail, and appearance.

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Preliminary Review Sheet

However, these products are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. They have shorter lifespan and deteriorate when exposed to moisture, weathering, and temperature variation. For replacement doors, avoid metal doors (including metal doors that imitate paneled wood), as they do not have the same appearance and texture of historic wood. Avoid pre-hung doors (doors that are purchased already installed in a frame) when replacing a door, because these require the removal of historic fabric and can change the size of the opening.

3.6.10 Preserve the size of the existing door opening. New doors should be custom sized if necessary. Avoid enlarging or filling in original door openings to fit new stock sizes. This

Observations & Comments: The proposed doors have 2 flat panels and are fabricated of steel, finished white. The 2 panel design is close to what looks like the historic door design.

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended to approve

Presenters:

- Christine Ussler presented the application.
- Mandy Tolino represented the applicant.

Discussion: There was a lengthy discussion of the proposed door replacements. The material of the proposed door replacements was discussed. It was verified that steel was proposed. It was also verified the doors would be pre-hung in steel frames. The applicant proceeded to describe the security issues confronting the city at the band shell. The doors were continually battered and broken into. Alternatives to the steel doors were discussed. The best option would be to use thick, solid wood doors with 2 or 3 panels with a 3 point locking system. The applicant felt it important to use steel doors with steel frames. The HARB was sympathetic to the security issues but felt they could not approve materials and frame types that clearly did not meet the Historic District Design Guidelines. The HARB agreed the best option would be to deny the proposal, but to convey to City Council that this might be a case where they could not follow the HARB's recommendation due to security concerns.

Actions: Mr. Jordan made a motion to DENY the application presented on March 4th, 2024, to replace all the single doors on the band shell with solid steel doors at 1515 Linden Street because it did not comply with the Guidelines for Historic Districts and there were no know unique circumstances that would apply.

Mr. Huber seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.