

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Final Review Sheet**

HDC-2023-00077

Address: 1529 Turner Street

District: West Park Historic District

Applicant: Marie Boland, Owner

Proposal: Remove slate shingles; install asphalt shingles

Building Description:

This brick 3-story row house, ca 1909 is a Colonial Revival. The mansard roof has red slate shingles, a double dormer with diamond shaped muntins/1 sash windows, barrel roof, projecting cornice with brackets and a shared chimney. The 2nd floor has a projecting cornice with brackets, a bay with 1/1 sash windows and wooden panels above. The 1st floor has a picture window with stained glass transom and brick lintel. The wooden porch has stone pillars, classic columns, wrought iron railing, projecting cornice and bull-nosed concrete steps. The main entry is a single glazed door and transom. There is a boarded-up basement window and below ground basement door.

Project Description:

This application proposes to replace the historic roofing at the property at 1529 W. Turner Street. The applicant proposes to remove the existing slate from the front and rear mansard and replace it with CertainTeed Carriage House asphalt shingles in the Georgian Brick color. The applicant also intends to replace the rubber front porch roof and rear low slope roof.



**Front roof plane of 1529 Turner Street, 2023.
(Google Street View)**



**Rear roof plane of 1529 Turner Street, 2023.
(Applicant)**

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Final Review Sheet**



**Front porch roof of 1529 Turner Street, 2023.
(Applicant)**



**Front porch roof of 1529 Turner Street, 2023.
(Applicant)**



**Top of dormer of 1529 Turner Street, 2023.
(Applicant)**

Historical Architectural Review Board

COA Final Review Sheet

Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.1 – Roofs

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

Observations & Comments:

The proposed shingles comply with Guideline 3.1.6, which states that the replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance. Staff suggests that the applicant clarify the extent of repair in relation to shingles on the dormer. The color of the proposed shingles is similar to the original terra cotta slate roof. The shape of the proposed shingles is also consistent with the shape of the historic slate shingles. Staff finds the proposed shingle to be appropriate.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs.

HARB Discussion:

Ms. Boland clarified that the dormer cheek walls would be reshingled with the rest of the roof. The HARB agreed that the proposed shingle would be the best match in asphalt to the historic slate in dimension, shape, color, profile, and overall appearance.

Action:

Mr. Hart moved to approve the application presented on 11/6/2023 to remove the existing slate shingles and install CertainTeed Carriage House asphalt shingles at the property at 1529 W. Turner Street, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs. Mr. Lichtenwalner seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.