

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Preliminary Review Sheet**

HDC-2025-00035

Address: 931 Gordon Street

District: Old Allentown Historic District

Owner: Brandon Yautz

Applicant: JW Contractors

Proposal: Replace slate steeples roof

Building Description: This three story brick row is a composite of Queen Anne and Eastlake influences with a flat roof and spire of slate. The 1/1 sash windows have Eastlake lintels. The double glazed main entry has a transom.

Project Description:

Replace slate steeples roof with CertainTeed Carriage House Shingles, citing a current roof leak.



Google
Front Elevation, April 2024 (Google Maps)



Steeple Roof at Subject Property and Neighbor (Applicant)

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Preliminary Review Sheet**



Streetscape (Applicant)



Projected Work Area- Steeple (Applicant)



**Proposed Shingle – CertainTeed Carriage House Shingle
(Applicant)**



Current Steeple (Applicant)

Historical Architectural Review Board

COA Preliminary Review Sheet

Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.1 – Roofs

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.4 Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

3.1.5 Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

5/5/25 Observations & Comments: The slate steeple is a defining feature of the façade at 931 W. Gordon Street. Beveled and rectangular shingles create a dynamic pattern on the steeple.

While the proposed replacement product is of a similar beveled shape, replacement in-kind or with a synthetic slate would be appropriate. The size of the shingle also appears to be larger than the size of the slate shingle. More information would be helpful to understand if repairing the existing roof has been explored. If repair is not feasible, an appropriate alternative would be an alternative slate-look roof, such as GAF Slateline, or similar. Replacement materials should match the existing in color, pattern, shape, size, and profile.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommend denying.

5/5/25 Discussion:

The roofing contractor for the project represented the application. Applicant states that he was not able to source materials to match the existing slate. Mr. Jordan asked if repair was considered. The HARB discussed the feasibility of repairing the existing slate with the applicant, and potential alternative materials if repair is not feasible. A repair in kind could have a longer lifespan and be more durable than an asphalt replacement. The applicant was amenable to exploring the feasibility of repair with the owner and proposing alternative materials and methods.

5/5/25 Actions:

Mr. Jordan moved to table the application presented on May 5, 2025, one month. Mr. Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support and no abstentions.

6/2/25 Updates: Staff did not receive materials to review prior to the 6/2/25 HARB Meeting; discussion to continue with applicant at meeting.

Presenters:

- Brandon Jones presented the application.
- Jaroslaw Werel represented the application.

Historical Architectural Review Board

COA Preliminary Review Sheet

Discussion:

The applicant brought a sample of the existing slate which fell off the steeple roof. He noted that he tried to reinstall slate shingles, which broke in the reinstallation process. While reviewing the existing steeple more closely, the slate towards the bottom of the steeple were observed to be in poor condition. The applicant brought samples for potential alternate materials, including the material proposed at the May 2025 HARB meeting, and GAF Slateline shingles. Mr. Jordan noted that the Slateline shingles were not consistent with the shaped slate- the current configuration of the slate installation is a combination of rows of rectangular/straight slates and rows of beveled/scalloped shingles.

If the current slate is beyond repair, the applicant proposes to use two styles of asphalt shingles to create a similar pattern as the current slate; however, the colors for the different shaped shingles are similar but not a complete match. Mr. Encelewski noted that maintaining the patterning of the shingles would be great and acknowledges that the slate appears to be in disrepair. Mr. Hart expressed concern about the loss of slate materials throughout the districts is a major issue but would defer to the board about the best alternate material. Ms. Shreier has concern about mixing two product types to replicate the pattern. Mr. Huber expressed that maintaining the pattern would be important to maintaining the character of the steeple and that it should be reflected in any replacement. Mr. Hammond preferred the shaped asphalt alternate material. Mr. Jordan said that there is evidence that the roof is in worse shape than anticipated and noted that the patterning of the existing roof is important across the board. The applicant noted that mixing two product types is physically possible and is open to a variety of options as recommended by the board.

Four rows of Slateline and four rows of Carriage House to replicate original detailing.

Action:

Mr. Jordan moved to approve the application presented on 6/2/2025 for steeple roof replacement at 931 Gordon Street with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant, following section of the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, and found circumstances unique to the property in the unique patterning of the existing steeple:

- The proposed GAF Slateline and the proposed Certaineed Carriage House shingles are used in a unique pattern to replicate the existing pattern of the slate roof using four courses of Certaineed Carriage house shingles to one course of Slateline.

Phillip Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support and no abstentions.