HDC-2023-00040

Address: 745-47 W. Turner Street District: Old Allentown Historic District Applicant: Cola Realty LP, owner

Proposal: Legalize removal of decorative lintels and installation of capping (violation correction)

Building Description:

This 3-story brick row house, c. 1901 is an Edwardian house. The mansard roof has asphalt shingles, spires and dentilated cornice. The 1st floor has a picture window with beveled glass above, the 2nd floor has a bay window with stained glass transom and the 3rd floor windows are 1/1 with a wrought iron railing above the second-floor bay. All windows have Eastlake lintels. The main entry is a single glazed door with a concrete porch.

Project Description:

On May 12, 2023, staff issued a notice of violation for the removal of brick lintels and installation of capping at the third-story front façade windows of 745-47 W. Turner Street. This application seeks to legalize the work.



Front façade of 745-47 W. Turner Street, 2021. (Google StreetView)



Photo showing the temporary lintel repair at 747 and the fallen brick at the lintel of 745 W. Turner Street, 2022.

(HARB files)



Photo showing the capping installed over the lintels, 2023. (HARB files)

Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.2 – Wood Siding & Trim

- **3.2.5** Replace deteriorated materials in-kind if repair is infeasible. New materials should replicate the original as closely as possible in material composition, size, profile, shape, pattern, and appearance. If historic wood siding or trim was an identifiable or visually distinctive species, it is recommended that the same species be used for the replacement.
- **3.2.6** Avoid installation of aluminum, vinyl, or synthetic materials that were unavailable when a building was constructed. Aluminum, vinyl, fiber-cement, or other synthetic cladding are not appropriate for historic properties because of their visual impact and because their installation can cause other deterioration problems. It is not appropriate to cap or cover existing wood with these types of materials. It is not appropriate to remove original wood cladding or trim features and replace them with aluminum, vinyl, fiber-cement, or synthetic materials.

Chapter 3.3 – Masonry

- **3.3.2** Repair and restore existing brick masonry whenever possible. Attempt to repair deteriorated or damaged areas prior to replacement. Appropriate repairs include repointing (repairing mortar joints), crack repair, brick stitching, and select area replacement. Avoid removing excess material or a larger area than is required to complete the repair. New bricks should match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties.
- **3.3.5** Replace or rebuild exterior masonry walls or features with in-kind materials if repair is not feasible. Replacement masonry units should match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties. Replicate the existing brick bond (how the bricks are laid).
- **3.3.6** Preserve and restore decorative masonry elements that are important character-defining features, such as brick corbels and patterned brick courses. Avoid altering, concealing or covering, or removing decorative masonry.

Chapter 3.5 – Windows

3.5.15 Replace deteriorated window trim or decorative elements only as necessary to match the size, profile, and material of the original elements. For window lintels or hoods that project from the façade plane and are vulnerable to water collection, consider installing of metal drip edges to shed water away from windows. Copper is recommended and should be left to weather naturally; aluminum is acceptable and should be painted to match surrounding materials. Avoid encasing wood sills with metal or vinyl, as this will trap moisture and may cause more damage.

Observations & Comments:

The staff issued notices of violation on multiple occasions for the failing brick at the third-story lintels since 2021. In 2021, first and second notices of violation were issued, followed by a court filing in November. Because the court was unable to serve the owner, the court dismissed the case. City staff attempted to reopen the violation by issuing new notices in March and July 2022 and again in May 2023.

The lintels were historically comprised of a decorative carved wood lintel below an arched soldier course of brick. A crown molding separated the lintel from the turret cornice. While the crown molding remains, the brick collapsed and was removed. The owner temporarily inserted plywood above the carved wood lintel at 747 W. Turner Street, and staff questions whether the wood portion of the lintel remains behind the current metal capping. At 745 W. Turner Street, the carved wood lintel appears to have collapsed with the brick, and the lintel has also been capped.

The removal of the brick and wood lintels and installation of metal capping does not comply with the design guidelines. The guidelines recommend in-kind replacement and advocate against installing any type of capping, per Guideline 3.2.6.

Staff Recommendation:

Denial, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.2 Wood Siding & Trim, Section 3.3 Masonry, and Section 3.5 Windows.

HARB Discussion:

The HARB discussed Guideline 3.2.5, stating that the guideline requires replacement features to be replicated as closely as possible in material composition, size, profile, shape, pattern, and appearance. The HARB noted that the wood lintel would need to be curved and that the incised design would need to be replicated. The HARB also noted that the lintels failed at both buildings because of the arch and suggested that the mason investigate a method to properly install the brick and wood lintels to avoid a future collapse.

The owner agreed to reinstall the brick and carved wooden lintel over the third-floor windows.

Actions:

Mr. Encelewski moved to approve the application presented on 7/10/2023 for the legalization of the removal of the brick and wood third-story front façade window lintels and replacement of the lintels in-kind at the property at 745-47 W. Turner Street, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.2 Wood Siding & Trim, Section 3.3 Masonry, and Section 3.5 Windows, with the following conditions as agreed to by the owner:

• The brick and wood lintels will match the historic in material composition, size, profile, shape, pattern, and appearance.

Mr. Lichtenwalner seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.