

Historical Architectural Review Board
FINAL Review Sheet

HDC-2024-00024

Address: 340 N 8th Street

District: Old Allentown Historic District

Owner: Richard A Reedy

Applicant: Holencik Exteriors, LLC

Proposal: Replace roof

Building Description: This 3-story Allentown brick row house, ca. 1888, is Eastlake/Second Empire in style. There is a Mansard roof with dormers. It has Eastlake curved decorative cornice with small scalloped cornice below. Carved brackets support the cornice. The windows have 1/1 sashes. The main door is double with a transom. The grocer's alley door also has a transom. The front door is decorative with scalloped wood above the door below the transom. There is painted brick and asbestos shingles in the rear. There are Eastlake lintels over windows which are 1/1 sahs. There is a concrete porch with knee walls.

Project Description:

This application proposes to replace the existing flat roofs with EPDM rubber roofing.



Roof Being Replaced (Applicant)



Roof Being Replaced (Applicant)



Roof Being Replaced (Applicant)



Roof Being Replaced (Applicant)

Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.1 – Roofs

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.4 Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

3.1.5 Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

3.1.8 Replace non-historic roofing materials in-kind or with recommended alternates. If the original material is documented, restoration of the original material is also an appropriate option but is not required. Original roofs may have been replaced long ago, yet asphalt shingles and similar alterations are still considered impacts to the overall appearance. Replacement materials should match the existing in color, pattern, shape, and profile. Greater flexibility is possible with non-historic roofing and using durable high-quality replacements is recommended.

Historical Architectural Review Board

FINAL Review Sheet

3.1.9 Consider roof ventilation alternatives carefully. Ventilation options are approved on a case by case basis and can include ridge vents, louvered vents, or soffit vents. Proper ventilation may extend the life of a roofing system, but in some cases it can lead to condensation problems with long-term effects on the roofing materials and structural components. Refer to Chapter 3.8 Mechanical and Utility Equipment for related guidelines about roof vents.

3.1.36 Repair and restore gutters whenever possible. Types of repairs include repainting wood or metal surface, installing new fasteners, sealing or soldering cracks and open seams, and relining built-in box gutters with new copper sheet metal.

3.1.37 Replace existing gutters in-kind when replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration. Replicate the original construction method of a historic gutter if feasible.

3.1.38 Replace existing downspouts, scuppers, collection boxes, and other drainage elements in-kind. Appropriate alternates to in-kind replacement are round or rectangular downspouts. Smooth surfaces are encouraged over corrugated metal. In the case of decorative scuppers, replicate the profile and details as closely as possible.

3.1.39 Consider alternate materials for gutters in locations that are difficult to access for maintenance or where original materials have demonstrated a pattern of deterioration over time. A fiberglass gutter is an acceptable replacement material for a wood built-in box gutter if it matches the original in profile, size, appearance, and finish.

3.1.40 Avoid vinyl gutters due to poor durability and non-historic appearance.

3.1.41 Install new downspouts in locations that are sensitive to the architecture and will be minimally visible. Run downspouts at secondary facades and along building or porch corners when possible.

3.1.42 Paint gutters and downspouts to blend in with the building exterior. Matching the existing building trim is usually the most appropriate color selection. Copper and terne-coated stainless steel systems should be left unpainted because they weather naturally and develop a protective patina.

Observations & Comments: The flat roofs are not visible from the public right-of-way. The only question I have after reviewing the material is if they plan to re-line the box gutter on the front elevation with EPDM rubber roofing. Based on the design guidelines, it would be recommended that they reline the box gutter with copper sheet metal rather than covering with EPDM.

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended to approve, with conditions related to box gutter clarifications.

Presenters:

- Jessica Stuck presented the application.
- Joseph Yenik represented the application.

Discussion: Clarification is required with the current configuration of the box gutter, since no photographs were provided. The applicant noted the current box gutter is lined with black EPDM with a white 3-inch drip edge.

Action: Mr. Jordan moved to approve, with conditions, the application presented on April 1, 2024, for replacement of roofing a 340 N 8th Street, pursuant to the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 – Roofs and find that there are no circumstances unique to the property. The following conditions were agreed to by the applicant:

- The box gutter is re-lined with black EPDM in-kind.

Mr. Huber seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.