Historical Architectural Review Board FINAL Review Sheet

HDC-2024-00024 Address: 1525 W Chew Street District: West Park Historic District Owner: DG Oak, LLC Applicant: KPMM Allentown Division, LLC Proposal: Legalize porch repair work

Building Description: This 3-story brick row house, ca 1902 is a porch style. The flat roof has a spire, dentilated cornice and a single chimney. The windows are 1/1 sash with brick lintels, and basement window grille. The main entry is a single door with a transom on a stoop with a balustrade.

Project Description:

This application proposes to legalize the replacement of the porch roof header due to rotting. The work will include removing the existing 2" x 10" x 8' header. A new 5" header will be installed and recovered with 1"x material that is ³/₄" solid wood. The installation will be caulked and painted to look exactly the same as it was prior to the work being completed.



Porch Elevation (Directory)



Repaired Porch (Applicant)

Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.7 – Porches & Steps

3.7.3 Repair and restore existing porches and steps whenever possible. Salvage, repair, and reuse existing components including deck floor boards, railings, balusters, posts, and decorative trim. Repair and restore basement level windows or metal grates that are part of the porch base.

3.7.4 Replace individual deteriorated components in-kind with new materials matching the original in material, composition, size, shape, profile, dimension, appearance, and finish. Custom fabrication is encouraged and may be necessary to provide an exact match. Where an exact match of the historic element cannot be found or fabricated, the new element should match the original as closely as possible.

3.7.5 Retain and repair original handrails or railings. Replace in-kind if repair is not feasible. Replacement handrails should match the existing in material, size, and appearance as closely as possible. Installation of handrails where they did not previously exist is generally not recommended due to the visual and physical impact on historic fabric; however, installation of a simple, compatible design may be acceptable for the purpose of safety and ease of access.

3.7.6 Consider restoration of previously altered porches with historically appropriate elements. Consult historic photographs to identify the original appearance. If the building is part of a pair or an attached row that was designed together, consult nearby buildings for examples.

3.7.7 Replace porches only if repair and select replacement is not feasible. A full demolition and rebuild is rarely necessary except in cases of severe deterioration and life safety concerns. Replicate the original design as closely as possible, allowing for structural and code requirements. Install flashing and waterproofing at all connections between the porch and main building.

3.7.8 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace with appropriate alternate materials that respect the original appearance and are durable. Composite wood decking is an appropriate alternate for tongue-and-groove wood floors if boards are similar to the original dimensions. Ceramic tile, carpet, or cementitious coatings over wood are not appropriate floor materials. Steel, iron, and aluminum railings are acceptable replacements. Vinyl railings and trim are not appropriate alternate materials for wood elements. Use of dimensional lumber for visible parts of a porch is not appropriate.

3.7.9 Avoid enclosing historically open porches on primary and highly visible facades. Enclosure with glass or screens at rear or non-visible features may be acceptable. Enclosure with walls or opaque materials is not recommended. Avoid removing, altering, or covering historic details.

3.7.10 Avoid removing a historic porch roof or full porch. Removal will negatively impact the building's historic character. Consult with Planning Staff and HARB about the reason for removal (i.e. cause of deterioration). A porch that was added after the original construction of a building may have gained significance in its own right. Porches can be appropriate for the building as a reflection of its development over time and as an expression of a later architectural style.

Observations & Comments: This is a relatively straightforward in-kind repair and appears to match the existing configuration well. Although no existing photographs were provided and it is not clear if there was any additional detailing at the header (similar to what is present at the adjacent porch header).

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended to approve.

Presenters:

- Jessica Stuck presented the application.
- Eric Luckenbach represented the application.

Discussion: Mr. Huber asked if there were any drawings of what the proposed replacement will look like. Ms. Stuck noted that while comparing existing photographs pulled from the City's directory, it appears that the work done matches the historic configuration.

<u>Action</u>: Mr. Jordan moved to approve the application presented on April 1, 2024 for replacement of a porch header at 1525 W Chew Street as submitted pursuant to the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.7 – Porches & Steps and find that there are not circumstances unique to the property.

Mr. Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.