



Allentown

435 Hamilton Street
Allentown, Pa. 18101

Minutes - Final

City Council

Wednesday, October 16, 2019

6:00 PM

Council Chambers

Confirmation Hearings - Public Works and Police Chief Appointments

Roll Call: Council President MacLean

[15-3196](#)

R80

Craig Messinger - Director of Public Works

Attachments: [R80 Public Works Director Appt](#)

[Craig Messinger Memo](#)

[Resolution #29864](#)

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that tonight he brings forth Craig Messinger as the Director of Public Works. He has been employed with the city for over 30 years. He has shown remarkable leadership and skills as he progressed through the managerial roles as Fleet Manager, Streets Superintendent, and Deputy Director of Public Works. In his current position as Acting Director of Public Works, he directs numerous Bureaus including Streets, Stormwater, Engineering, Fleet, Maintenance, Compliance, Solid Waste and Recycling, Traffic Planning, Engineering, Building Maintenance, and Technical Services. He stated that he is honored to submit Craig Messinger's name for the permanent Director of Public Works.

Mr. Craig Messinger thanked Mayor O'Connell for his confidence in him and nominating him for the Director of Public Works and anyone who may have spoke to City Council or will be speaking tonight on his behalf. He thanked his family and the large show of support from his fellow City of Allentown Public Works employees. He stated that he has dedicated the last 30 years of serving this city in a variety of capacities. He stated that they all worked together as a team. There are many accomplishments under his leadership during his time as Acting Director exemplified the quality of his work and the ability to promote excellence for a great city. He reviewed a few important highlights from the last few years that demonstrate his abilities to lead the department as the director. In 2014, he was tasked to create a Traffic Management System to alleviate potential gridlock for the opening of the PPL Center. Not only it was a great solution, it was developed and installed in a mere six months timeline. The system was an award winning success. The city received a

\$2 million grant to extend it further into areas in downtown Allentown. In 2015, he demonstrated his strong commitment to completed projects with integrity as he directly opposed the illegitimate Street Light Contract associated with the previous administration. That contract would have costs a minimum of \$4.5 million of taxpayer money. This project is now being designed and managed in-house since 2018 and has an estimated cost of \$2.5 million. As a result, the taxpayers are saving at least \$2 million. In 2016, he worked closely with his staff to modify the new garbage contract. They were able to save the city \$1.5 million per year over the previous contract. With a total potential savings of \$13.5 million over the life of the new contract. They have stabilized the garbage fee and have not had to institute any fee increase for Allentown citizens for nine consecutive years. In 2018 and 2019, the Public Works Department applied for and received multiple grants amounting to \$1 million for a \$1.2 million lighting project. The project will be designed and managed in-house to complete new and updated installations of LED lighting for the entire stretch of the American Parkway extending from Union Street to Airport Road. In Summary, these noted accomplishments have resulted in a combined total cost savings for the Allentown taxpayers of over \$18.5 million. These few examples, demonstrate leadership skills with the support and hard work from his entire department to continuously improve the contributions of the Public Works Department to our great city of Allentown.

Mr. Roger MacLean thanked Mr. Messinger. He stated that there are a lot of people here. He is not sure if everybody wants to talk between both candidates. He limited the talking to two minutes and suggested to keep it condensed. He stated that on the Resolution page, there are two different salaries.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated \$121,500.

Mr. Ed Zucal thanked everyone for coming and commended Mr. Messinger for the job he has done as Acting Director. He considered him his friend. Anytime he called Mr. Messinger he complied immediately assisted him, but as most of them read in the paper he agrees with what is in the Charter. He stated that in January 2018, he took an oath that he will abide by the rules of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and carryout the duties of the City of Allentown. He stated that he was approached by a city worker at Wawa on his way to work in the morning. He stated that he understood that Mr. Messinger is going to be brought forward for confirmation on October 16th. He went to his right-hand man Mike and asked him to tell him about it. He stated that he was told that you have to be an Engineer to hold this position. He looked it up and here is what he found. There is a little snap in what is creating this whole issue. In 2006, when Mr. Pawlowski wanted to pick Mr. Wernsdorfer as a Deputy Director and the prior Director.

Section 506 of the Charter, the Department of Public Works/City Engineer. In Webster dictionary the forward slash means also. As a police officer when you arrest someone for burglary, that crime has elements and the elements of that crime are the person must not have permission to be in there and once they are in there, they commit a crime. He stated that he believes the Charter as it is written. He read the Department of Public Works is mandated by this Charter. The Mayor shall appoint and fix the compensation of the head of the Department of Public Works/City Engineer. He or she shall perform the duties required through the Administrative Code or other action, or as may be required of a City Engineer by general law. Prior to 2006, when Mr. Pawlowski brought Mr. Wernsdorfer before the Council, there were three Directors over a span of several years. They were all Engineers. It wasn't until 2006 when Mr. Pawlowski wanted to bring Mr. Wernsdorfer forward and he did not have an engineering degree. All of a sudden there was a problem with the Charter. It was unclear. It wasn't unclear up into that point. Mr. Wernsdorger was never confirmed because he refused to move into the city. He asked Mr. Kloiber if he rendered an opinion. Is it reasonable to believe that a person could conclude that based on how the Charter reads and how he read it, that it could mean that you must also be an Engineer to hold this position.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that part of the opinion is deferring what was done in the 2006 opinion. They tried to deconstruct it. It ended up being a reasonable opinion. There are multiple interpretations. What you just said is a reasonable interpretation of the language.

Mr. Ed Zucal stated that the language never changed when those three individual were the Director and when Mr. Wernsdorfer was brought forward. In regards to the financial part of the confirmation Mayor Pawlowski brought Mr. Messinger up for Confirmation on October 13, 2016. He stated all but he, Mr. Robinson and Dr. McGuire were all the same Councilmembers. Mr. Hendricks made some very valid points. We are only a few weeks away from the Budget being brought out. We have an obligation to the citizens to be fiscally responsible. Presenting an increase of \$121,500 when the medium income in the City of Allentown is \$38,000. Many times we make hard decisions here and his colleagues not always agree with him and he doesn't always agree with them. As the Mayor says, we can agree to agree, agree to disagree, disagree to disagree and then we go home.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that it is not a \$121,500 increase.

Mayor Ray O'Connell thanked Mr. Zucal and stated that he did his homework. He went back to the Home Rule Charter which was a memo received on October 16, 2019 from our Solicitor. Ambiguities in the Home

Rule Charter does not preclude City Council from preceding with the present nomination should they decide to do so. However, if it proceeds, the administration and Council shall clearly show how the Engineering function is handled within the city to make sure that those functions are indeed and will continue to be handled by a professional Engineer as licensed by the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. In the Department of Public Works we have two Engineers. We have Mark Geosits and Nelson Varughese. Anything that has to be signed off in the department of Public Works by an Engineer, we do have two people in that department to do so.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that the bottom line is that City Council at some needs to do something to clarify this in the Charter. It is too late for this year since he is done in January someone will have to take that ball and carry it.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that Charter and the Administrative Code.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that the 2006 Decision from Federal Judge Perkins ended with a statement that this piece of ambiguous language in our City Charter and Council to immediately seek to rectify it. Only one member of this board was on in 2006. Over that 13 years, there has been multiple opportunities, at least seven municipal elections when for free we could have put something on the ballot. To clarify what Mr. Zucal has said, just because it has never been dealt with before in terms of a Public Works Director that did not have the City Engineer certificate did not mean this ambiguity did not exist. It wasn't a long period of time. There were only two Mayors during that period of time that has been in place. Mayor Pawlowski was the third. Just because something was done by Mayor Pawlowski that is now a convicted felon does not mean that everything that was done was bad. He stated as someone who has known Judge Perkins all of his life because he went to school with his daughter. He has always known Judge Perkins to be an honorable human being who does things in a straight forward manner. He found a quirk in the law that fit the situation. He asked Mr. Kloiber if there are other reasonable interpretations of using the virgule. How many different legal interpretations of virgule?

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that he looked at length on that and there are eight to nine different ways that the slash can be used. We have legal writers who discuss how there is no place in formal legal writing for the slash because it is inherently ambiguous. The Home Rule Charter clearly creates a Department of Public Works, it does not unequivocally establish that the Director of Public Works must be a professional Engineer. The Solicitor's office recommended in 2006 that Council take appropriate action to clarify this language to remove the ambiguity. The Solicitor's office reiterates that same recommendation.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that while Mr. Zucal's opinion is that it should be a City Engineer. There is one acceptable interpretation of this. It is equally as acceptable for other members of the public and the administration to assume that it does not state that. Council and the administration had 13 years to fix this and they chose not to. He asked his colleagues since he will not be on Council in January to please, fix this.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that is correct.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that there are also many reasons that you can make that it would not be wise to have the Public Works Director be the City Engineer. There are two separate legal opinions that both stipulate that this is an acceptable and reasonable interpretation of the Charter. As our Solicitor stated, there are eight different interpretations of this particular grammatical quirk in the law. This is a sloppy use of grammar in a document to use this particular piece of punctuation. He stated that the Charter is not a well written document. It is reasonable to vote for Mr. Messinger in terms of being an Engineer because we have two qualified Engineers under him and the city has other options that we can take if need be. As far as the salary goes, this is 2019, you have to pay for quality and we have to recognize that we are competing for talent with not just for Salisbury, Whitehall and Bethlehem, but we are competing with cities our size all throughout the mid-Atlantic and we have to pay competitive salaries. He stated that he argues that the salary is not as high as it could be for both the position and the person that the Mayor has nominated. As far as Mr. Messinger's qualifications and qualities, he is by far the most dedicated and hardworking public servant that he ever had the good fortune to know. He thanked him for his dedicated years of service. He stated that Mr. Messinger stood up to a corrupt Mayor who was running a bunco organization, a scheme that paralleled with size and scope. He stated that he will be voting yes and encouraged his colleagues to vote yes.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that is a fair way of describing what they said.

Mr. Julio Guridy thanked Mr. Messinger, the public, and the Mayor. He talked about the Home Rule Charter and the additional salary increase. He stated that Mr. Robinson reminded him of that those were the same words that former Mayor Pawlowski said when he introduced Mr. Wernsdorfer. Mr. Wernsdorfer was acting and was never confirmed by Council.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that he was confirmed for 11 months, but never moved into the city.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that he was confirmed by a 4 - 3 vote for the

position of Director of Public Works. He never moved into the city so he ultimately had to leave because he did not fulfill the obligations of moving into the city.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that you are right Mr. Robinson. Nothing happened after that because before that every Public Works Director was an Engineer. Mr. Rich Young was also an Engineer. We didn't have to cross that line until now. He stated that he promised to introduce a Resolution to change that. He stated that he talked to Mr. Kloiber today at length about this issue. He is not opposed to this part in regards to the interpretation of the Charter for the Public Works Director to be a licensed Engineer. He stated that issue of the salary increase is what he has the biggest concern. People called and said you just gave us a 27 percent tax increase and increasing the salary almost 20 percent. It is out of class, \$110,000.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that it is \$110,000 out of class.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that he wants to make sure that people get paid according to their class. We have to fix that. We have to correct that.

Mayor Ray O'Connell asked Mr. Guridy if he knew the range of the salary. The range is from \$80,000 - \$146,000.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that is ridiculous to have such a range on a class.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that \$121,500 for the quality of the gentleman that sits before you is a deal.

Mr. Courtney Robinson asked who approved that salary range.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that it was not approved by Council.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that the ranges are in the budget every year.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that the average salary for a person living in Allentown is \$39,000. It is still low. He wants to see when we increase salaries, we increase those who are making the lower amount of money in the city. To give somebody a \$20,000 increase in two years. We need to work on that issue a lot more than just giving salaries. That was before and we need to change it.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that they are getting to where they were. If you want to talk about salary ranges and make a motion, please. Let's not talk about salary ranges here.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that President MacLean is correct. That is for another night. The bottom-line is he is bringing Mr. Messinger forward as a Director of Public Works at \$121,500. You vote yes or you vote no.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that he will make an amendment.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that Mr. Guridy can make the motion now or have all the Councilmembers have a chance to speak and then have a chance to make the motion at that point.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks stated that he is glad the legalese issues are over with and he will go there. We are extremely fortunate to have a large number of dedicated employees working for our city. Craig has provided invaluable service for over 30 years to our city and ranks up there as one of the most dedicated a loyal employees we have. He stated that he has been with the city himself now for 41 years. From day one as a police officers he was in contact with Mr. Messinger regarding traffic issues as he stated that he was the Captain for the city's Police department. In his private time, he has contacted him regarding issues with the streets, and he always provided great service, quick service, and has always reliable. He stated that Craig deserves this slight increase and he deserved to be confirmed tonight.

Ms. Candida Affa stated that as far as voting for salary, when Mr. Fitzgerald became Chief he never stuck his foot in the city and Mr. Guridy, you approved him for \$140,000 salary. Mr. Messinger has one of the most complexed departments in this city. To lose Mr. Messinger as the city's Public Works Director would be devastating to the city. We know how well, just as a citizen he has run the city from the sewers, from the lights, to the streets. Never once in four years as a Councilperson that he has not taken her call and done exactly and answered any question she proposed. Mr. Robinson nailed it. Mr. Messinger did not know when he left the office and got reprimanded for not doing what he was told to do if he was going to have a job. As far as the salary is concerned, \$18.5 million Mr. Messinger saved this city and we don't want to give him \$121,500.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated for the record, we are going from \$110,000 to \$121,500.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that when we voted for Mr. Fitzgerald, the idea was that he was not going to take a pension or the health benefits. It turned out that may not have not been the truth, but that is what Council was told.

Mr. Joseph McMahon stated that he has known and worked for every Public Works Director since 1982. Some were Engineers, but they were not the City Engineer. He stated that Craig is the hardest working

individual to sit in that seat since 1982. He may be the best manager to sit in that seat. He might not be an Engineer. He is not going to design your bridges for you, but other people can do that. What you need when you have 170 people is a great manager.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that she has a lot of respect for Mr. Messinger, but she has been battling with the raise. He is very knowledgeable and has the respect of his staff and the respect that we have towards him. He is right on top of things. He is always there and does a great job. He is well worth it, but where are we going to find the money. Where is the money coming from.

Mr. Joseph McMahon stated when you have a good manager, a good manager knows where to save money. You can put someone there, but you may not get the return on investment that you will make tonight.

Mr. Roger MacLean asked for clarification if the position is budgeted for 2019.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that there is money in the budget.

Ms. Cynthia Mota asked of what. What is the amount of money?

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that it is budgeted.

Mr. Edward John White, 1922 W. Highland Street, stated that he is speaking as a resident and taxpayer in the city. You have a city Solicitor, make sure you understand his opinion. He spent 25 years as a practicing attorney and spent most of his day researching the issues regarding the Charter, Pennsylvania Law, and the Administrative Code. There is nothing prohibiting the appointment of Mr. Messinger as Public Works Director. He stated that he and his wife pay taxes and own a home on the west end. The amount of salary increase that has been requested by the Mayor to give the best person of the job a comparable salary for the job that he is doing now as the new Director of Public Works amounts to 12 cents per taxpayer.

Mr. Patrick Palmer, W. Allen Street, asked how much Craig was making before. He asked what is the normal increase when a person changes jobs. It is only an eight percent increase. He is going to move into the city. He stated that he knows that Craig is right for the job.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated \$110,000 and his new salary is \$121,500.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated it depends.

Mr. David Melman, Environmental Advisory Council (EAC), appreciates Craig Messinger's leadership on environmental issues and his willingness to involve the EAC and work with them on important environmental issues. He opened up his meetings to the EAC. The EAC wholeheartedly endorses him as Director of Public Works.

Mr. Glenn Hunsicker, South Allentown, stated that Craig does a good job. He is looking at the finance part of it. This is not a one year increase. You are talking about a three year increase. It is too much. It shouldn't be a 10.5 percent increase.

Mr. Jason Hertz stated that he works in the Streets Department and he owes everything to Craig. He stated that about 13 years ago he was going to leave the Streets Department to go to the Parks Department as an Arborist. Craig pulled him to the side and said he sees an operator in him. He stated that he saw potential in him and from that moment on he moved up as an operator. As far as being a manager, Craig is the best at it. As far as the City of Allentown, he can't recognize it. As far as the Street Lights, the Streets, the Programs, and the way people talk about the city is not a joke anymore. As a taxpayer in Allentown he is willing to give Craig more.

Mr. Jeremy Binder, 1553 W. Turner Street, thanked Council and supports Craig. His 30 years and tenure with the city, his experience, his wisdom is invaluable. He stated that as a resident and a taxpayer, he has no issue seeing him being compensated. It is 2019, we need to be attracting qualified candidates.

Mr. Jim Gentile, president and founder of Northstar Construction, stated that he worked in seven states and one territory and worked in every municipality around here. There is not a better staff led by Craig Messinger in any township. He stated that they get answers to what they need and it is fair, honest and hard. For five and a half years, you have been under paying him and asking him to do something and not giving him the title to do it. He stated that he has been doing construction projects in the city for 33 years and nobody has been doing a better job.

Mr. Shawn Doyle, Construction Inspector - Engineering Department, stated that he works in the Engineering Department. The supplication of him being an Engineer does not apply in his position. He works hand and hand with Mark Geosits. They have a strong relationship. There is nothing that Craig doesn't look into. Anything that he ever had or experienced with Craig has always been done quickly, considerably, and professionally. He has been doing more than one persons job for a number of years before

they got Mark Shahda in that position.

Ms. Cheryl Hockney, 1231 W. Walnut Street, stated that she has been a resident for 32 years. She asked if there were any paid Train Conductors on the city payroll. So we don't have engineers. If we want to talk semantics. Her interaction and personal experience with Mr. Messinger has been recent and positive. She talked about the issues that were addressed by Mr. Messinger. She asked Council to please endorse Craig Messinger.

Mr. Shane Fillman, 416 N 8th Street, stated that he has been a resident in Allentown his entire life and a resident owning his own property for 29 years. The two gentlemen before you tonight are major asset to the administration and to the residents of city. They have been very responsive to emails. Craig has been professional and responsive.

Mr. Joseph Hoffman asked Craig if he gets the position and you have actual licensed professional Engineers under you. What happens if the two of you disagree. If they need to sign a document that requires a licensed Engineer and you are their boss.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated that Engineer signing that document is responsible for it. They are the person responsible for it. If there is a disagreement, it is the Engineer that signs it. At this point, we have not had any disagreements with any of the documents to this day. We are working closely. He stated that he understands that it is the Engineers license.

Mr. Joseph Hoffman stated that he wanted to make sure that was clear and said that he believes Mr. Messinger will be a good guy for the job.

Mr. George Grazer stated that he can speak for Craig's heart and character working for the city. He stated that he has been with the Parking Authority since 1985 and they work hand and hand. Under the other administration, this guy knew what he had to do. He stood up for it and said he was not going to do his job. It is a no brainer. If you take the slash out of the mix, half are for it and half are against it. Take that out of there and look at the man for the job. Is he worth it, yes. Can we afford to lose him, no, we can't?

Ms. Milagros Canales, president of Old Fairgrounds and mom to the children for Snow Angels, stated how important Mr. Messinger was to the Snow Angels project. Every year, he reaches out and ask if she got her salt and snow blower. The snow blower was broken and his staff fixed it for them. Without Craig last year, they would not have been able to do the things they did last year. This man has worked hard behind the scenes

doing things in two positions. She stated that Center City and Old Fairgrounds love Craig. He does a really good job.

Mr. Hamp Smith stated that he hears a lot about Mr. Messinger and what good he does and the charges in the city. He asked if Mr. Messinger qualifies for everything in the city's Charter.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that they have two Solicitor's Opinions and they have one sitting here that says yes.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that you don't have to be a professional Engineer to be the Director of Public Works.

Mr. Hamp Smith stated that all he knows is the Charter and Mr. Messinger fits that mold because he has been doing an excellent job. There are people that go for positions and have to meet certain qualifications.

Mr. Tom Hahn, Eastside Allentown, asked about the Salary Study. Part of the blame for the confusion rest on the past Council and the present Council. You are paying two Engineers and that is included in the salary. What is the total cost to have two extra Engineers and Consultants and what it does in the budget?

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that he doesn't have the number in front of him, but it is in the budget.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that the Engineers are in the budget.

Ms. Cynthia Mota asked if someone could tell Mr. Hahn what he wants.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that the budget is online.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that we are not talking about the budget. That's coming in 2020. We are talking about Craig Messinger, yes or no for Director of Public Works.

Ms. Brenda Fernandez, Southside Allentown, thanked Craig for being a man of his word.

Mr. Ryan Hunsicker, SEIU Chapter Leader, stated that it is the job description for the Public Works Director. Like other city employees, including himself has job duties, job qualifications, and minimum qualifications. Some employees are denied jobs because they don't have those qualifications. When you look over the Page 2 in the minimum qualifications you will see a degree required for this position. He stated

that he has no ill-will to say about Craig Messinger. The job description is the job description. He asked Council to read it and consider them.

Mr. Courtney Robinson asked Mr. Hunsicker if he is speaking on behalf of himself or the union. When you read the minimum qualifications, education and experience. Section A: Bachelor's Degree with a major in Civil Engineering or Section B: any equivalent combination of related education and meaningful experience may be substituted. Section C: extensive municipal Public Works and Engineering Experience and graduation from a recognized college or university with a major in Civil Engineering or any equivalent combination of experience and training which provides the required knowledge, skills and abilities. You don't want to say a 23 year old kid that came out of college is so much better to run this department than a 55 year old guy who has 30 years of experience. It requires a degree or comparable experience. He asked Mr. Hunsicker if he is saying since he doesn't have a college degree, he is not qualified to sit on this Council.

Mr. Ryan Hunsicker stated that the minimum education and experience dictates the salary. If you have a degree for this job and purpose that gets you to call for more money. It constitutes the monetary value of the job.

A motion was made by Julio Guridy, failed for lack of second that this Resolution be amended to bring Mr. Messinger's salary down to \$115,000

Enactment No: 29864

Yes: 7 - Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, Courtney Robinson, Cynthia Mota, Daryl Hendricks, Julio Guridy, and Ed Zucal

Enactment No: 29864

[15-3195](#)

R81

Glenn Granitz - Police Chief Appointment

Attachments: [R81 Police Chief Appt](#)

[Glenn Granitz Memo](#)

[Resolution #29865](#)

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that at this time it is his honor to enthusiastically bring forward Glenn Granitz, Jr. to become the city's Chief of Police. Glenn Granitz joined the department in 2001 and graduated from the Allentown Police Academy. He was assigned to the Criminal Investigations Division in 2005. In 2008, he joined the Lehigh County Homicide Taskforce and was involved in multiple homicide arrests and convictions dating back as far back as 1998. Captain Glenn Granitz was promoted to Lieutenant in May 2015, was assigned to the Third Platoon. He was promoted to Captain in August 2017, serving Center City overseeing the 4th Platoon and all offices assigned to patrol the Center

City area, including Center City Bike Unit. Glenn Granitz holds a B.S. from St. Joseph's University and a M.S. in Criminal Justice Administration from the University of Cincinnati. He has taken three courses towards his doctorate and is currently obtaining a Bachelor's Degree in Human Resource Management. He is honored to bring forward Glenn Granitz, Jr. as a permanent Police Chief in the City of Allentown.

Mr. Glenn Granitz thanked Mayor O'Connell for supporting him in this endeavor. He thanked his family and the many men and women of the Allentown Police Department and the Community Groups. He thanked City Council for their time this evening. He thanked the Police Administration and the two Assistant Chiefs Gail Struss and Stephen Angelo and the Captains. Most of whom are here tonight. They have made the last five weeks almost seamless as the Allentown Police Department has moved ahead. He thanked the various department heads within the city. As he assures everyone in the room that they have a great working relationship and there are many men and women to be proud of the city. The last five weeks have been a blur. They have set a tone in the city in the last five weeks. His commitment to working hard has never been tested as much and the hours that they have put in as a team has increased. The credit to some of the successes in the last five weeks go to the many men and women who are on the street right now and the community members in this room who have trusted us with information allowing us to make arrests. He stated that it is a dream for him to be here. He stated that he is not looking to go to far away places or looking for something better or bigger. This is what he has dreamt about since he was a child. This is the building that he played in and the place that he was dropped off at with when his mom had to go to work and his dad was working overtime as a detective in APD. He stated that this is where he wants to be. His career and some of his qualifications have put him in a position to lead this department into the future. The Mayor hit on it, but he will tell them that his experience as a detective is vast and he enjoys great working relationships with the prosecutors office and many people with the community of law enforcement. He stated that after working homicides and beginning to work with the youth and community services division gave him a whole new perspective on what policing was about. He went back to the street as Lieutenant, the Commander of everything that is going on and that is one of the most important positions in the whole department and then becoming the Captain of Center City put him in a unique position to work with people and deal with crime on a daily basis. At each of these levels, he stated that he has met and exceeded expectations. He apologized to his wife and kids because they don't see him as often as they probably should. He stated that his education and training and the many schools that the taxpayers of Allentown have provided him, he does not take lightly and for that he said thank you. He stated that the best part of his career is the

relationships they have built. He stated that he considers many people in this room as friends more than acquaintances, but people that have a mutual respect for one another. We have the ability to say yes to one another and just as importantly, they have the ability to say no. He stated that his focus coming up will be communication both on how they share information, how they receive it and how they follow through. He stated that if they have been watching them in the last five weeks he has set the tone in that area. Presence, community engagement, and new initiatives are also something that you have seen a taste of. He stated that he can't take credit for those things. He can take credit for allowing the men and women of the Allentown Police Department to do the things that will work. Things like the Truck or Treat or the Senior Academy are not necessary his ideas. They are ideas of the men and women of APD. He promised to bring fairness inside and outside of APD. He stated that he doesn't have an agenda other than making the city safer and making a great working environment for our men and women. APD will attack violent crime. That includes collaboration with multiple agencies. Many of the things that are already in the works and that includes a focus on Community Policing. All of these points and all of this focus will help us retain and attract the quality officers, the diverse group of officers that the APD needs to move ahead. He stated Ladies and Gentlemen, our city is changing. We are in the middle of a moment here and stated that he believes that they all can make a difference. Not one person, not the Chief of Police, not one Police Department is going to do that alone, but we are a team and looking around, he likes this team. It helps to have Bill Belichick, but it also helps to have Tom Brady. In closing, he hopes tonight that they accept him as their Police Chief. He stated that he learned something a long time ago and that is one day at the end, he will first be known as a dad, a husband and then he hopes a good Police Chief. That is what he aims for.

Ms. Candida Affa thanked Glenn Granitz for his service and all the officers. She stated that they had her back for many years when she owned a bar, and she will always have their back. You were a wonderful Chief, and as Captain they sat at Nick's and ate fried chicken together. As Chief, are we going to do the same?

Captain Glenn Granitz stated absolutely. They should go for Steak Night as well.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks stated that he has spoken to a number of officers that worked under Glenn Granitz and all expressed great respect for him. The most important thing he represents and has proven to be, you find in that very first paragraph. His professional summary. The word community is written three times. There is nothing more important than our community and how our Chief of Police and all the men and women of the Police

Department need to react to the community or interact with the community. He acknowledge that Glenn Granitz has done a great job in that respect and stated that he will definitely be voting for him.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that he respect the Chief very much. He stated that the Chief is a person of the community. He has been in this city for over 38 years and living in the city and he has never seen with all due respect to the former Chief, a Chief of Police that has been in the community as much as Glenn Granitz. He stated that he and Glenn Granitz have had several conversations about his job and the future, and what he wants to do and how long he wants to stay. He stated that he knows that Glenn Granitz is the right person for the job. One thing he would like to see in Glenn Granitz is to continue to diversify the police workforce that represent the people that live in the city. He stated that he has been looking for this vote for a long time and is happy to cast his vote as soon as he can.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that she is so happy. Glenn Granitz, we all know that you are well qualified. You are a man that is extremely fair. A man that the community trust and that the community loves. You know children by their first name. Three years ago, she was working as a substitute teacher and she will not name the school. They were bragging about a family that comes in and helps out in different schools. When she asked who were they talking so highly about, they said Captain Granitz and his wife. Everybody speaks so highly of you. She stated that she knows that he does a lot of great things for people and things that aren't publicized. She believes that the city would be a lot safer with him as the Chief of Police. She stated that her son Alani is high functioning and autistic. Every time he misbehaves she tells him to remember what Glenn Granitz spoke to you about. He has been behaving a lot better. She thanked Glenn Granitz for that.

Mr. Ed Zucal congratulated Glenn Granitz for getting to this point. It has been a long road for us to get here. We know what the last 18 months was like. What the city was like and we all needed a change. We needed a positive change. Anybody can put on the uniform, but it takes a great person to lead. As well as Mr. Hendricks, numerous officers have called him on the phone calling him, thanking them for getting them where they are today. He stated to Granitz that he knows he has been putting in a ton of hours. You are trying to play catch up. He told Glenn Granitz to be careful that he doesn't burn himself out. We need you not just for today. We need you for a little while.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that this is actually probably one of his favorite nights when he looks back on the last two years. Because both votes are for dedicated and committed Public Servants. He stated that he

has know Glenn Granitz for a few years now. They became friends when he was running for City Council and they would see each other at community meetings. He stated that the Chief is an exceptionally dedicated Public Servant. At the same time, he finds a way and God only knows how he does to balance time with his official duties and volunteering in the community. With being a good neighbor and also being a great father and husband. He thanked Glenn Granitz family for letting the city have him. He said what a special thing they have in Glenn Granitz and sharing him with us. This is going to be a good thing for the City of Allentown. He stated that he is not going to go as far as Ms. Mota by saying make sure Allentown is a safer city. No matter what we will face over the next few years, he has no doubt in his mind that this body, the City of Allentown and the community at large are going to know exactly what is going on. That is the route of Community Policing. He stated that finally there will be some stability in the department. It will be an exceptionally important change. He stated that he hopes to see more Facebook Live Informational videos in the future talking about crime prevention in the city. He stated that Glenn Granitz salary is a smaller salary than his predecessor and ask if he had any ideas on what he is going to divert that into for any type of programming for the city.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that it is already saved thanks to him.

Captain Glenn Granitz stated that he and the Mayor discussed some initial things. They discussed some of that money for a diversion for a beginning of a Gun Buyback Program and communication is a strong point in mind. He stated that he will be coming to the people of Allentown and communicating the need for them to help support that.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that is fantastic and something that he is a big proponent. That is a great effort to show the community proactive work. He encouraged his colleagues to vote yes.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that the city had from the beginning of the year until around August 20, 61 - 62 shooting incidents. Since that day up until this day we had 29. What are we doing?

Captain Gllen Granitz stated that the Police Department has done a series of sweeps. There are targeted enforcement operations. Many people will know that in the room because when the helicopters goes up. Those two rather extensive sweeps involving a number of different agencies were very successful. Arresting over 40 high level offenders. They have increased their work with the US Marshals. They were here at the Thursday meeting with the Command Staff. They are targeting offenders that are wanted for serious crimes, felonies and parole violations and people the Police

believe will re-offend. As recently as this afternoon, he had meetings with Vice and Drug Taskforce personnel. He stated that they are more than happy to collaborate. District Attorney Martin has been very helpful. One thing you can expect from APD and the city going forward into next year, as they begin this new model of community policing. You can see us address the violence in these neighborhoods. Both by officers in the neighborhoods and using other resources. Next year the APD will be participating in using the School Resource Officers as the model.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that he is glad to hear that. The police were doing it, then the School District didn't have the time for it.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks asked Mr. Granitz to explain what that is.

Chief Glenn Granitz stated that the Program is Gang Resistance Education and Training. That is targeting our youth. Generally, it is the fifth grade level. If you think it is too early, it is not too early to begin that conversation. He thanked the District Attorney's office for spearheading that with the grant. Allentown Police Department will step up and resume their roles and get a handle on the issue again.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that discipline will become an issue that you are going to have to deal with. Hopefully, it is few and far between. He asked for Glenn Granitz' thoughts.

Chief Glenn Granitz stated that he thinks that one thing about his communication style is explaining where he stands and what needs to be done. He stated that he has been the gentleman that had to arrest police officers on the criminal side of things. Other than crimes against children, it has been the least favorite of his job. He stated that he doesn't sleep well at night, however, he will tell them a police officer that does not do the right thing, does not have room to be here with him, while he is doing the right thing.

Mr. Roger MacLean asked where are you with overtime.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that they are ok.

A motion was made by Ed Zucal, seconded by Cynthia Mota to Suspend the Rules to change the Mayor's proposed Police Chief's salary of \$127,760 to the salary of the former Chief made in the amount of \$131,000.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that in regards to the budget. Is that in the budget to make that change.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated \$127,760 to \$135,000. He consulted with the

Director of Finance. He stated that they have something in city government called the vacancy factor. Looking at the vacancy factor and we are down two and a half months, we definitely have money in the budget.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that it is a salary increase at the end of the year, for next year.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that is coming. That is not tonight. That is speculation. The motion on the floor is to take \$127,760 to \$135,000. Because of the vacancy factor, we have the money to go from \$127,760 to \$135,000.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that Glenn Granitz is worth it.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks asked what was the previous Chief's salary.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that it was \$131,300.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks stated to be fiscally responsible here, he can agree to the \$131,300.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that he feels like they are in the Twilight Zone. They just argued and talked about Craig and everyone was saying how it was fiscally irresponsible and now we are saying we can do it.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that the Chief has been working.

Ms. Candida Affa stated for 20 years. Craig Messinger has 30 years.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that it is two different jobs. He is putting his life everyday at risk and he has little kids.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated that there is still opportunities for other members of Council to talk about the motion and the amendment.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that he believes in paying employees a good living wage or beyond a living wage. He certainly thinks that either salary that Chief Granitz will be fine. He supported the motion. He stated that it is a little disturbing because we know coming into this that there are seven votes and there are a bunch of community members who are in support of this. Both Confirmations have now been stained by the efforts to gain political points. He stated that he is just disturbed by that.

Enactment No: 29865

Ms. Candida Affa stated that she agrees with Mr. Robinson. She stated that Glenn Granitz probably deserves more than Mr. Messinger, but as Mr.

MacLean stated it is like the Twilight Zone. This man came down from his salary and negotiated it to come down. You said it was fiscally irresponsible. Yet, you are giving the Chief a \$3,000 raise.

Mr. Roger MacLean asked if there were any other questions from Council or the public.

Mr. Patrick Palmer stated that he doesn't know what the Chief was making previously. He stated that he talked to him at 6:00 AM and then at 12:00 AM. He stated that he is pretty sure based on overtime that he was getting, the city is getting off on a steal. He feels that he should make the same amount as the previous Chief was making.

Robert stated that Chief Granitz is his friend. He stated that when he was being bad, Chief Granitz helped him get back together.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that he is glad he did that.

Mr. Richard Lovell stated that he is a resident in the district in Allentown with the most shootings. He stated that it hasn't been a shooting in Allentown since Glenn Granitz has been the Chief. We based the last salary on how much money was saved to the city. He stated that they should base Glenn Granitz' salary on how many lives have been saved for the city. He stated that they should base Chief Glenn Granitz salary on how many lives have been saved in the city.

Mr. Louis Perez, 1329 W Hamilton Street, stated that the value Chief Granitz has him being on one end of the spectrum, this former officer knows him. He stated that he was one that would not want to face the police, but Zucal and Glenn are the type of men who would build that bridge between the criminals, the people that are trying to right, and bringing that safety to our community.

Ms. Enid Santiago, 1243 S. Jefferson Street, thanked Chief Granitz for the amazing work he does in the city day in and day out. She stated that she is disappointed that some members are taking the time to argue making this man's salary the same as the last person that was in office that should have never been in office as long as he did.

(Name not provided) stated that she feels for Council. She serves on two nonprofits board of director and understands what it means to have a fiduciary responsibility. She stated that they have her understanding. She stated that she lives in a neighborhood that in the last seven years or so is just been run over with nuisance complaints. Violent crimes are not prevalent in the neighborhood. The concept of Community Policing has

now become an object. It is no longer intangible. It is tangible. It is especially important that all the leadership across all departments need to at the end of their workday experience the same frustration and the same challenges along with the benefits of urban living that all of us resident do. It is very important that our Captain and now our Chief actually lives in one of our neighborhoods and out on our streets because at the end of the day all of you need to here the same sirens that you do. Please support the nomination for Captain Granitz to become our permanent Chief.

Ms. Candida Affa stated that she supports it 100 percent. She hopes that they understand it has nothing to do with the money. She stated that she would give the Chief probably even more because she thinks he deserves it. She stated that the same thing as Mr. Messinger. She stated that she felt disturbed tonight that two of the three that did not want to Confirm Mr. Messinger because of the money issues, were the two that brought up the fact that they want to give Chief Granitz a raise.

Mr. Julio Guridy stated that he never said he was against Mr. Messinger. He never said he was going to vote against him. He stated that he was looking at the finances that is all.

Mayor Ray O'Connell stated that Ms. Mota asked why it wasn't negotiated. It was negotiated in his office. That is his job as Mayor to negotiate with anyone that he brings forth as director.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that Mr. Messinger is well worth it, but the Chief is putting his life there on the street. She feels that the city is a lot safer with him. He has little kids. She stated that she was not aware that he was going to get less money. She stated that she doesn't see it in her papers.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that it is right on the paperwork.

Mr. Ed Zucal stated that he knows it looks like they are giving Chief Granitz a raise. He stated that Mr. Hendricks motion was to give him \$131,300. The exact same amount the other Chief was getting. With Mr. Messinger, they were talking about \$11,500 additional to what he was getting.

Ms. Candida Affa asked why was it not negotiated?

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that is a good question. Why was that not negotiated.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that if there was a previous Public Works Director, they would have been at that salary too. Mr. Granitz agreed to \$127,760.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that first of all, he don't know where some of the speakers, including Ms. Santiago thinks he doesn't agree with it. Three times when he spoke he said he is fine with giving him more money. He had an issue on how it was done. He stated that he supports giving the Chief more money. That is not the issue. He stated that if either of them would have come to any of them and said they think he should make more money. He stated that he highly doubt there is a single person here that would have disagreed with them.

Ms. Cynthia Mota stated that it is, what it is. We are talking about the salary right now. She stated that she doesn't see why they have an issue.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated that he agrees with Mr. Robinson. This is something that should have been discussed beforehand.

Mr. Courtney Robinson stated that this is something in which he doubts that one person would vote against it. He doubts one person would have a problem with it.

Mr. Matthew Kloiber stated for procedures. There was an amendment made, then there was an amendment to the amendment. Council needs a second for the amendment to the amendment.

A motion was made by Daryl Hendricks, seconded by Julio Guridy, that Council Amend the Amendment to change the salary from \$135,000 to \$131,300. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, Courtney Robinson, Cynthia Mota, Daryl Hendricks, Julio Guridy, and Ed Zucal

Enactment No: 29865

To Vote on the Initial Amendment as Amended to change the salary in the Resolution to \$131,300. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, Courtney Robinson, Cynthia Mota, Daryl Hendricks, Julio Guridy, and Ed Zucal

Enactment No: 29865

Mr. Edward White stated that it is demaying to see what this has evolved into and he wants to bring them back. Everybody just take a moment and reflect on why we are here to Confirm those qualified candidates for permanent Chief of Police for the City of Allentown. He stated that he has known Chief Glenn Granitz since 2004 and had the privilege to serve as an assistant baseball coach under him when he was a detective in the Allentown Police Department. He stated that he got to see his future leadership qualities. He was strong, decisive, compassionate, and wasn't afraid to disagree, but he cared about the kids and continued to do so for the last 15 years. He is a true community police officers and servant. That

is why he is the best person for the job.

Mr. Binder stated that he is excited to see Chief Granitz be Chief of Police. His style and the way he has been running and the fact that he is living in his neighborhood.

Ms. Enid Santiago thanked Mr. Granitz for the community work. Thank you for stepping up. Thank you for never saying no and thank you for making the call and actually showing up and appreciating the diversity. She stated whatever Chief Granitz needs, he knows that he has it. If Chief Granitz needs them to show up for any reason, they are still going to show up and make sure they support the people that should be in office.

Mr. Patrick Palmer stated that it has been a long road to get here. There has been all kinds of Charter readings and fun stuff. He agrees with Ms. Mota. He lives on Allen Street and at one point he could step out of his house and to the left see a pool of blood. At another time he stepped out of his house and on the right he sees a broken window with bullet holes. He is not getting that anymore. Chief Granitz is the definition of community policing.

Ms. Pam Rogers, N. Front Street, stated that she met Glenn Granitz a year ago at their city meeting. He has been faithful and comes all the time. One time something was going on in the city and Facebook was lit up. She sent an email asking should she need to be worried and he stated go to bed, we got this. She stated that the APD did, and she slept like a baby that night and she feels confident in him.

Mr. Roger MacLean asked if there were any other comments from the public.

A motion was made by Roger J. MacLean that this Resolution be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, Courtney Robinson, Cynthia Mota, Daryl Hendricks, Julio Guridy, and Ed Zucal

Enactment No: 29865

ADJOURNED: 8:14 PM