

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA
December 7, 2020**

FINAL REVIEW

Address of Property: 347 N 9th St (Case # HDC-2020-000044)

Historic District: Old Allentown

Property Owner /Applicant: Christian Brown

Address: 345 N 9th St, Allentown, PA 18102

Building description, period, style defining features: This structure is a 3 story, 3 bay, semi-detached, corner, mixed use building with 2 story rear ell, Mansard roof, dormers, bracketed cornice, segmentally arched double hung windows and a period storefront on the 9th St façade. The building dates from c.1880 and is Second Empire in style. The building has a high level of historic integrity.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to:

- a. Replace asphalt shingles on mansard roof north and west facades with synthetic slate shingles to match east façade.
- b. Replace asphalt shingles on 3 dormer roofs with synthetic slate shingles to match existing.
- c. Remove asphalt shingles from sides of 3 dormers and replace with composite siding to match rear dormer.

Staff Approvals: 2020 Staff Approval

Repair and replace deteriorated asphalt flat roofing of the 3rd floor roof (not visible from street).

Violations: N/A

Background:

- 1999 COA

Approved Alterations: (1) demolition of the rear frame addition; repair of the newly exposed wall area, (if alternate treatment is warranted proposal is to be reviewed); (2) installation of replica wrought iron fencing along Gordon Street property line in location of removed addition; (3) replacement of the fire escape; removal if allowed by Allentown building code.

Approved Alterations: 1) Wood landing with wood railing or brick landing and steps with wrought iron railing if budget allows the expense. 2) Brick up a portion of existing doorway and install a window in the opening. 3) Remove stucco from brick and repair/repoint as necessary.

Approved Alterations: 1) Construct a small wood frame addition at rear; 2) construct an open porch at rear; 3) provide a basement entrance at rear; 4) addition of louvered wooden shutters at front facade, hung on operable hardware to fit the size of the window; 5) divide storefront windows into four and add wood panels under the windows; 6) remove aluminum hood from doorway at Gordon Street side; 7) install wrought iron railing at steps for side door; 8) fill in basement steps on Gordon Street; and 9) remove small third floor dormer window at rear of building.

Approved Alterations: Replacement of the wooden garage doors with an overhead steel door with either vertical raised panels or a cross-buck design, as per the specifications submitted with the application.

Approved Alterations: Install one double sided projecting business sign on the 2nd floor front of the building with powder coated wrought iron support brackets.

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment

Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5.1.11 Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 3. Roofing

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The proposed work is historically appropriate as submitted. Some clarification on the simulated shingle shape and exposure on the composite siding should be provided. Are the existing simulated slates rectangular? It is recommended that the exposure of the siding be approximately 4"-5"

Discussion: The discussion centered on the details of the synthetic slate to be used for the roof areas. Mr. Brown said he planned to use "Inspire" brand synthetic slate. The HARB commented that this is a good product and was hard to distinguish from real slate. The rolled ridge caps were pointed out. The HARB explained the historic importance of keeping them or replacing them in kind.

The applicant explained the sides of the dormers would be sided with the same fiber cement as the rear dormer. He was not sure the dimension of the exposure, but all agreed it should match the rear dormer.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Roberts adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to replace shingles at 347 N 9th Street was represented by Chris Brown.
2. The existing deteriorated asphalt shingles on the north and west Mansard roofs and the roofs on the dormers will be replaced with synthetic slate roof shingles (Inspire or equivalent). They will be rectangular in shape to match east façade.
3. The metal rolled ridge caps will be retained or replaced in-kind.
4. The existing asphalt shingles will be removed from the sides of the 3 dormers and new fiber cement siding installed to match rear dormer.
5. The exposure for the siding will be 4"+/-.

HARB Action: The proposal to issue a COA was unanimously approved. (4-0; motion carried: Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Roberts)

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA
December 7, 2020**

FINAL REVIEW

Address: 343-345 N 9th Street (Case # HDC-2020-00046)

Historic District: Old Allentown

Property Owner /Applicant: Christian Brown

Address: 345 N 9th St, Allentown, PA 18102

Building description, period, style defining features:

- **343 N 9th:** This structure is a 2 ½ story, 3 bay, attached red brick dwelling with gable roof, single roof dormer, corbeled brick cornice, 6 over 6 double hung windows, and paneled front and grocer alley doors. The house dates from c. 1885 and is Federal revival style. The façade has been renovated and the house has a high level of historic integrity. At the rear there is a 1 story garage with brick side walls, a garage door in poor condition and a man door. The garage is in deteriorated condition and dates from c. 1920-40.
- **345 N 9th:** This structure, nearly identical to 343 N 9th, is a 2 ½ story, 3 bay, attached red brick dwelling with gable roof, single roof dormer, corbeled brick cornice, 6 over 6 double hung windows, and paneled front and grocer alley doors. The house dates from c. 1885 and is Federal revival style. The façade has been renovated and the house has a high level of historic integrity. At the rear there is a 2 story garage with concrete block walls, a garage door in poor condition, and a mon door. The garage is in deteriorated condition and dates from c. 1920-40. The second floor section of the building is set back from the alley.



2019 Google photo



2008 Google photo



Proposed alterations: It is proposed do the following:

a. 343 Garage

- i. Remove man door
- ii. Install new wood/wood-look garage door with increased width (approx. 16')
- iii. Repair and repoint brick as needed
- iv. Reface header and trim with composite material
- v. Install new half round gutter and downspout

b. 345 Garage (lower)

- i. Remove man door
- ii. Install new wood/wood-look paneled garage door with increased width (approx. 16')
- iii. Expose concrete block walls, repoint, repair as needed. Seal and paint grey
- iv. Re-sheath and clad header area and side trim with metal vertical siding
- v. Install 5" half round gutter and downspout
- vi. Install new 1 x 8 composite board fascia

c. 345 Garage (upper)

- i. Expose concrete block walls; repoint, repair as needed. Seal and paint grey
- ii. Re-sheath and install new metal vertical siding above the garage door
- iii. Install three 3-light awning windows with proportions to mimic divisions in existing industrial windows
- iv. Install new half round gutter
- v. Install new composite fascia

Staff Approvals: (Dec 3, 2020) Replace deteriorated flat asphalt roof with new asphalt roofing material on the following detached garages (roof not visible from street):

- o 343 garage
- o 345 garage (1st and 2nd level roofs).

Violations:

Background:

343 N. 9th: 2010 – COA

Demolition of the Allentown Porch Roof, the concrete stoop and hand rail system

2014 – COA

1. The existing dormer will be expanded as shown in the drawings submitted, and a new, matching dormer constructed at 343 N. 9th St. Both dormers will have three double-hung, 6/6 aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided lights (SDLs).
2. The existing window and door openings will be restored with the exception of the two existing door openings that will be converted to windows as shown on the drawings.
3. All new windows on the first and second floors will be 1/1 aluminum clad wood double-hung windows
4. All new doors will be single-light aluminum clad wood windows.
5. Brickwork will be stripped, repaired, and repointed. All brick work must follow the guidelines found in Preservation Brief #2.
6. The future deck proposed between first and second floor of 345 N. 9th St. must be reviewed in the future when construction contemplated.
7. New gutter and downspout will half-round and round respectively.
8. A brick chimney or terra cotta chimney pot will be installed instead of the exposed metal chimney flue.

345 N 9th: COA 1998

APPROVED ALTERATIONS: Installation of a stationary transom with either a wood or vinyl frame, to be glazed with either plexiglass or glass over the storm door.

- COA 2010

Approved Alterations: 1. Demolition of the Allentown Porch Roof, concrete stoop and handrail system
2. Demolition of the garage with the exception of a 6' wall that will remain and be capped with brick.

- COA 2014

1. Part of rear garage will be demolished as proposed. The treatment of the newly exposed wall should be reviewed by HARB if anything other than the restoration of an existing wall is needed.
2. The front façade paint will be removed from all brick surfaces using non-abrasive, historically appropriate techniques.
3. Windows will be replaced with either 2 over 2 or 6 over 6 divided light wood windows. The existing wood frames will be retained and new windows installed so that the daylight openings are reduced as little as possible.
4. The original front door will be restored or replaced with a new door of the same design. A new door will not be pre-hung and must be installed in the original jambs.
5. The grocery alley doorway will be replaced with either an appropriate, restored, salvaged door or a reconstructed period style door.
6. The brick will be repaired and re-pointed using historically appropriate mortar mix.
7. The window sills will be replaced where necessary with solid wood with drip edges/grooves. Where ever possible the original wood sills will be repaired using epoxy consolidators and fillers.
8. The window header metal covering will be removed and wood headers restored.
9. Shutters will be installed, wood solid panel on first floor and louvered on 2nd floor.
10. Period light fixtures will be installed
11. A date plaque will be installed.
12. Restoration of third floor dormer will be done keeping with the style of 343 (with gable roof)
13. Once the rear additions are removed, applicant will return to HARB with the proposed treatment and finishes.

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment

Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 1. 4. Walls, Siding and Trim 6. Doors.

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The proposed work is historically appropriate but cut sheets for the garage doors should be provided.

The other items of discussion are the vertical metal siding above the garage door on the 345 and the configuration of the proposed windows on the second floor of the same garage. Since the area is of significant dimension (24" +/-) a paneled detail might be more historically appropriate than the vertical metal siding. The panels should align with the panels of the garage door and could be constructed of composite material.

The configuration of the new windows might be more than 3 lights if they are to reference the existing steel industrial sashes in the garage. More details are needed to understand the intent. Will there be 2 windows per opening? Will each window have 6 lights – 2 wide and 3 high?

Discussion: The items in question from the Consultants review were focused on. The applicant provided cut sheets for the garage doors and the proposed windows on the second floor of the 345 N 9th St property. All questioned the use of metal vertical siding for the areas above the garage door and on the rear wall of the second floor for the 345 N 9th St property. After some pondering a HARB member suggested beaded board. It was decided that this would be an appropriate option for these areas and the applicant agreed.

Mr. Brown further explained the windows for the second floor and how they recall the top section of the industrial sash found on the side of the first floor. The materials of the windows were reviewed and a fibrex option suggested as an alternate. The applicant said he would look into it.

The selection of garage door was also discussed, and the alternate suggested by the Historic Consultant reviewed. The applicant said he would look into the product and was willing to use if the cost viable. Otherwise the HARB thought the proposed steel paneled garage doors would be historically appropriate.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Brobst and seconded by Mr. Fillman adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to renovate garages at 343-345 N 9th Street was represented by Chris Brown.
2. The renovations to the garages will be as submitted with the following clarifications and modifications:
 - a. The new garage doors will be steel paneled doors as submitted or the recommended Clopay Coachman steel and PVC overlay doors which will create a more historic appearance.
 - b. If the Clopay garage doors are used a cut sheet showing the design should be submitted to the City for review and file.
 - c. Tongue and groove beaded board will be used above the existing garage door and on the second floor rear wall at the 345 N 9th St location. The beaded board will be painted.
 - d. The area above the garage door on the 343 N 9th St location will be flat composite material as proposed.
 - e. The new windows on the second floor of the 345 N 9th St garage will be Andersen 400 awning windows, approximately 36" x 20.5" in size, with Simulated Divided Lights(SDL) as proposed or Andersen's fibrex window in the same size and muntin type.
 - f. All other aspects of the proposal will be as submitted.

HARB Action: The proposal to issue a COA was unanimously approved. (4-0; motion carried: Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Roberts)

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA
December 7, 2020**

FINAL REVIEW

Address: 440 N 10th Street (HDC-2020-00060)

Historic District: Old Allentown

Property Owner: Juan De La Cruz

Address: 3126 Arcadia Ave, Allentown PA 18103

Applicant: Yvelissa Manzueta

Applicant's Address: 834 S Armour Ct, Allentown, PA 18103

Building description, period, style defining features: This structure is a one-story commercial storefront attached to a rear 2 story residential building. It has a flat roof, extended front parapet covered in sheet metal, a recessed entry on the left side of a large display window with 3 sheets of glass and historic paneling above and below the glass, a projecting traditional cornice above the storefront display windows, and the remains of a large projecting sign support by a bracket structure behind the parapet. The building dates from the early 20th century and is vernacular commercial style



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to install a hanging sign announcing the business (Note: approved by Zoning Hearing Board). The size of the sign proposed is 5' wide and 2' high. The new design is shown below. The sign is noted as being plastic.



Staff Approvals:**Violations:**

- 2018 (Zoning) – Using vacant furniture store for appliance warehouse with no zoning approval.

Background:

- 2003 COA

Replacement of two 6x8 foot plate glass windows on the front of the building with three 4x8 foot windows.

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment

Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 11. Signs

From 11/2020 meeting:**Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:**

The proposed sign has a mid-century modern feel to it. It appears that this is an existing sign from another location. It is not clear if the sign is internally illuminated, what size the sign is, and if the sign is single or double sided.

Without this information it is difficult to make an accurate evaluation of the proposal, but it appears the sign is about 52" long and about 20" high. The sign has a thickness of about 4"-6". Because of the thickness of the sign it may have been originally internally illuminated. It is also not known if the sign has color since the photo transmitted is black and white.

The sign might be historically appropriate if mounted on the metal clad parapet either as a projecting sign or a wall sign. The remains of the old box sign should be removed. The new sign should not be internally illuminated. Gooseneck lights could be installed to illuminate the sign. If the sign hangs from the existing projecting support, chains or similar strong method should be used to position the sign lower on the façade. The sign should be stabilized with tie-backs if hanging. All wiring should be concealed for gooseneck lights. Signs should not cover or conceal architectural features or ornament and signs should be mounted in a way that does not damage historic materials

Discussion: *The applicant described the sign she wanted to use and explained it would be hung inside at the front window in the center. It would not be illuminated. She would also have an "open" non-illuminated sign. She said the sign would be hung but did not have details on the hangers. The colors were confirmed to be red, white, and blue.*

The HARB told the applicant that the mid-century modern character of the sign was not historically appropriate for this storefront. Mr. Fillman suggested looking at other appropriate signs in the historic district, such as the sign at 11th and Turner. A more historic lettering style was recommended. The size of the proposed sign was discussed but the dimensions were not verified. Mr. Sadiua said the size of the sign was approved by Zoning, but the style of the sign was deferred to the HARB. Mr. Brobst recommended a new sign the same size as existing but thinner and with more historic character.

The HARB explained to the applicant that scaled drawings were needed and that a sign company could provide those drawings.

Motion: *The HARB upon motion by Mr. Huber and seconded by Mr. Fillman the proposal was tabled for a new sign design and scaled drawing.*

The proposal to table was unanimously approved. (6-0; motion carried: Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Roberts, Sell)

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: It was requested that a scaled drawing be provided to the HARB showing the new design. It is hoped the sign shown in the photo is a mockup of a sign and not permanent. If the sign is to be located on the transom panels is recommended to have the sign fit the divisions of the panels. In other words the proposed sign should extend from one vertical mullion to another and not stop in the middle of a

panel as the mockup does. The sign should be either shortened or lengthened to align with a vertical mullion. It is also recommended to fit the entire space, top to bottom, of the transom panel area. In conclusion a sign that would be slightly taller and slightly shorter would fit the architecture of the building better. The sign could also be lengthened if zoning approval still met for size.

The design of the sign would be made more historically appropriate with a different style lettering, reduced slightly in size to allow more space around the lettering, and not reversing the lettering and background for the telephone number. The addition of a pinstripe border is recommended and colors that are more compatible with the building and district. In particular the background color might be cream. The sign material should be a standard sign material such as HDU (High density urethane) or MDO (medium density overlay) or wood.

Discussion: The applicant said the sign installed was just a mock-up and temporary. Covering two or three panels of the transom was reviewed as suggested by the Consultant. Mr. Fillman, however, had a problem with covering any of the panels. Using the projecting sign structure above the cornice was briefly discussed again but placing a sign on the glass was also suggested. The HARB and applicant preferred the option of a sign on the glass. The size of the glass panels were estimated to be 40"-42". A stripe around a sign on the glass was recommended. The Historic Consultant offered to help the applicant with a drawing of an appropriate window sign. In order to help the applicant get a sign installed without further full HARB review, the HARB decided to give a conditional approval based on a sketch provided by the Historic Consultant.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Brobst and seconded by Ms. Roberts adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to install a hanging sign announcing the business at 440 N 10th Street was represented by Yvelisse Manzueta.
2. The new sign will be modified, with assistance from the Historic Consultant, to be located on the middle glass panel of the storefront.
3. The sign will be a white or off-white vinyl window sign.
4. The sign will have serif style lettering. "Copperplate Gothic" or "Engravers MT" fonts are recommended.
5. The sign will have a border stripe approximately 1/2" in dimension.
6. The sign will be approximately 3' x 4' in size or smaller if required by Zoning approval.
7. There must be 3" or slightly more between the window frame and border stripe of the sign on the sides. The sign should be approximately 1' down from the top of the window.

HARB Action: The proposal to issue a COA was unanimously approved. (4-0; motion carried: Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Roberts)