



CITY OF ALLENTOWN

No. 30016

RESOLUTION

R78 - 2020

Introduced by the Administration on June 17, 2020

Denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness – 405 N. 9th Street

Resolved by the Council of the City of Allentown, That

WHEREAS, a Certificate of Appropriateness is required under the provisions of the Act of the General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania No.167, June 13, 1961 (P.L.282) known as the Pennsylvania Historic District Act; and City of Allentown has adopted a Historic District Ordinance, Article 1391, under the provisions allowed in the Pennsylvania Historic District Act; and

WHEREAS, the co-owners, James Villaume and Dale Fritchman applied to the Historical Architectural Review Board (HARB) for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the 3rd floor wood windows with vinyl to match the vinyl replacement windows previously installed on the 1st & 2nd floors of above-mentioned property, as described on the attached final report; and

WHEREAS, the HARB held a remote meeting via Microsoft Teams on said matter on June 1, 2020, where the applicants were in attendance via telephone /computing devices; and

WHEREAS, based on the statements and evidence presented, the HARB made the following findings of fact, as detailed in the attached case report:

1. The proposal to install vinyl windows on front facades is not permitted in Old Allentown under the Guidelines for Historic Districts.
2. Alternative aluminum clad and other approvable materials and possible window companies were suggested at that meeting.
3. The owner, however, stated that he will just fix and paint the windows.

WHEREAS, based on the above findings of fact, the HARB agreed on the motion that existing wood windows and sills should be fix and repainted, and the recommended to City Council denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness as detailed in the attached Case Report.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Allentown that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby denied for the above referenced alteration.

	Yea	Nay
Candida Affa	X	
Julio A. Guridy, VP	X	
Ce-Ce Gerlach	X	
Cynthia Mota	X	
Joshua Siegel	X	
Ed Zucal	X	
Daryl Hendricks, Pres.	X	
TOTAL	7	0

THIS IS TO CERTIFY, That the above copy of Resolution No. 30016 was adopted by the City Council of Allentown on the 15th day of July, 2020, and is on file in the City Clerk's Office.


 City Clerk

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA
June 1, 2020**

FINAL REVIEW

Address: 405 N 9th St, Allentown (Old Allentown Historic District) -- Proposes to replace the 3rd floor wood windows with vinyl to match the vinyl replacement windows previously installed on the 1st & 2nd floors.

Property Owner:	James Villaume /Dale Fritchman	Owner Address:	407 N 9th St, Allentown, PA 18102
Applicant:	(same as Owner)	Applicant's Address:	(same as Owner)
HARB Meeting date:	June 1, 2020 (Agenda Item #4a)	Case #	HDC-2020-00003

Building description, period, style defining features: This structure is a 3 bay, 3 story attached brick and stucco dwelling with very low sloped roof, bracketed cornice, segmentally arched windows on the first and second floors, grocer alley door, and vinyl replacement windows on the first and second floors. The first and second floors appear to be the original building height and the third floor appears to have been a later, but historic, addition. The original part of the building dates from c. 1875 and the third floor addition appears to be early 20th century. The building retains integrity.



Staff Approvals: N/A

Violations: N/A

Background:

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5.1.11 Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 5. Windows)**

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The Design Guidelines prescribe that if the repair of a window is not possible and replacement is required, the replacement window unit should match the historic window unit in design, dimension, and pane configuration. Replacement of historic wood windows on a primary facade with a new wood, aluminum clad wood, smooth fiberglass, or wood composite windows may be acceptable depending on the condition of the existing historic wood windows. Vinyl windows are not an approvable material for primary facades.

The submitted photo shows significant deterioration although it is not clear where the photo was taken. If the windows are beyond repair it is recommended to install aluminum clad wood windows (Harvey, Pella, Andersen, or equivalent) or smooth fiberglass or composite window (Andersen, Pella, Marvin or equivalent). The new windows should fit the existing openings without blocking. Window trim and sills should not be capped in aluminum.

Discussion: The applicants first asked that Mr. Fillman recuse himself from the review of their case. Mr. Fillman said he had no financial interest or other conflict of interest in the property and would not recuse himself. It was explained that there were 7 HARB members so that different opinions could be heard. No one person makes the decision on HARB cases.

Ms Jackson asked the applicant where the photograph submitted was taken. He said it was the interior windowsill. Ms Jackson said she thought the problem appeared to be the sill and not the windows sashes. The applicant asked when the HARB started not allowing vinyl windows on the front façade. The Consultant informed him in 2012 with the publishing of the new historic design guidelines. The HARB members agreed with the consultant that vinyl windows would not be approvable. Aluminum clad and other approvable window materials were reviewed and possible window companies. The applicant said one of the window companies he would never use and got agitated. He said he would just fix and paint the windows and hung up.

The HARB decided it should deny the vinyl window replacements even though the applicant said he would keep the windows and just paint them.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council **deny** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to install vinyl windows on the third floor at 405 N 9th Street was represented by James Villaume and Dale Fritchman
2. Vinyl windows on front facades are not permitted in the Allentown Historic District Guidelines.
3. The existing wood windows and sills should be repaired and repainted.

HARB ACTION: The proposal to deny a COA was unanimously approved. (5-0; motion carried: Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Roberts, Sell). The proposal was denied because it did not meet the Design Guidelines and because the applicant said he would paint the wood windows