

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA  
June 1, 2020**

**FINAL REVIEW**

**Address:** 405 N 9th St, Allentown (Old Allentown Historic District) -- Proposes to replace the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor wood windows with vinyl to match the vinyl replacement windows previously installed on the 1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> floors.

<b>Property Owner:</b>	James Villaume /Dale Fritchman	<b>Owner Address:</b>	407 N 9th St, Allentown, PA 18102
<b>Applicant:</b>	(same as Owner)	<b>Applicant's Address:</b>	(same as Owner)
<b>HARB Meeting date:</b>	June 1, 2020 (Agenda Item #4a)	<b>Case #</b>	HDC-2020-00003

**Building description, period, style defining features:** This structure is a 3 bay, 3 story attached brick and stucco dwelling with very low sloped roof, bracketed cornice, segmentally arched windows on the first and second floors, grocer alley door, and vinyl replacement windows on the first and second floors. The first and second floors appear to be the original building height and the third floor appears to have been a later, but historic, addition. The original part of the building dates from c. 1875 and the third floor addition appears to be early 20<sup>th</sup> century. The building retains integrity.



**Staff Approvals:** N/A

**Violations:** N/A

**Background:**

**Guideline Citation: SIS 9.** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5.1.11 Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 5. Windows)

**Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:** The Design Guidelines prescribe that if the repair of a window is not possible and replacement is required, the replacement window unit should match the historic window unit in design, dimension, and pane configuration. Replacement of historic wood windows on a primary facade with a new wood, aluminum clad wood, smooth fiberglass, or wood composite windows may be acceptable depending on the condition of the existing historic wood windows. Vinyl windows are not an approvable material for primary facades.

The submitted photo shows significant deterioration although it is not clear where the photo was taken. If the windows are beyond repair it is recommended to install aluminum clad wood windows (Harvey, Pella, Andersen, or equivalent) or smooth fiberglass or composite window (Andersen, Pella, Marvin or equivalent). The new windows should fit the existing openings without blocking. Window trim and sills should not be capped in aluminum.

**Discussion:** The applicants first asked that Mr. Fillman recuse himself from the review of their case. Mr. Fillman said he had no financial interest or other conflict of interest in the property and would not recuse himself. It was explained that there were 7 HARB members so that different opinions could be heard. No one person makes the decision on HARB cases.

Ms Jackson asked the applicant where the photograph submitted was taken. He said it was the interior windowsill. Ms Jackson said she thought the problem appeared to be the sill and not the windows sashes. The applicant asked when the HARB started not allowing vinyl windows on the front façade. The Consultant informed him in 2012 with the publishing of the new historic design guidelines. The HARB members agreed with the consultant that vinyl windows would not be approvable. Aluminum clad and other approvable window materials were reviewed and possible window companies. The applicant said one of the window companies he would never use and got agitated. He said he would just fix and paint the windows and hung up.

The HARB decided it should deny the vinyl window replacements even though the applicant said he would keep the windows and just paint them.

**Motion:** The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council **deny** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to install vinyl windows on the third floor at 405 N 9<sup>th</sup> Street was represented by James Villaume and Dale Fritchman
2. Vinyl windows on front facades are not permitted in the Allentown Historic District Guidelines.
3. The existing wood windows and sills should be repaired and repainted.

**HARB ACTION:** The proposal to deny a COA was unanimously approved. (5-0; motion carried: Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Roberts, Sell). The proposal was denied because it did not meet the Design Guidelines and because the applicant said he would paint the wood windows