

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA
January 10, 2020
FINAL REVIEW**

Case # HDC-2019-000054 - Proposal to amend previous COA issued in April of 2009

Property located at: 326 N 9th Street

Agenda #1

Historic District: Old Allentown

Case # 2009-23

Meeting date: January 6, 2020

Property Owner: Redevelopment Authority
City of Allentown

Address: 435 Hamilton St, Allentown, PA

Applicant:

Applicant's Address:

Building description, period, style defining features: This structure is a 3 bay, 3 story, semi-detached brick rowhouse with Mansard roof, center tower-roofed brick wall dormer, projecting cornice with large pressed metal end brackets with finials, corbeled brick and terracotta details, 1 over 1 double-hung windows with segmental arches, full-front porch with ornamental woodwork (mostly remaining), turned posts, turned scrollwork, wood deck, and concrete steps. The side façade exhibits similar high style detailing. The house dates from c. 1892 and is Queen Anne Eastlake in style. Victorian divided upper sashes with colored glass in the dormers, as described in city records, do not appear to be remaining on the facades.





Proposed alterations: It is proposed to amend previous COA issued in April of 2009. Proposal to substitute CertainTeed Carriage House shingles, Stone Gate Gray color for repair and replacement of slate shingles on the front mansard roof. Install wood aluminum clad windows (Harvey Majesty) on the front and side of the house instead of repair wood windows or replace wood windows with wood windows. Replace porch railings and balusters with railings and balusters to match as closely as possible; instead of repair existing porch railings or match existing.

Staff Approvals: HDA-2018-00011 – 1/31/2018. Install temporary chain link fence around property, to remain until restoration work is completed.

Violations: September 30, 2004 – Installed round hand railing on top of existing porch railing.

Background: 1979-24 – Demolish the garage at the rear of the property. Demolition of a section of the rear porch on the second floor. Repoint brick and repair roof and cornice. Upon a recommendation by HARB, City Council approved a certificate of appropriateness by Resolution No. 24499, July 18, 1979.

1980-86 – Install aluminum siding on rear addition, rear fascia and rear porch. Upon a recommendation by HARB, City Council approved the certificate of appropriateness by Resolution No. 24794, December 17, 1980.

2004-51 – Continue previously installed round handrail above the existing porch railing (violation). Construct a bead board basement door over the open bulkhead basement door to eliminate the need for the round hand railing. Upon a recommendation by HARB, City Council approved a certificate of appropriateness by Resolution No. 27974, December 15, 2004.

2009-23 – Complete historically appropriate restoration of the building per plans prepared by historic preservation architect. Upon a recommendation by HARB, City Council approved a certificate of appropriateness by Resolution No. 28562, April 15, 2009.

Guideline Citation: SIS 6 Deteriorated features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 3. Roofing, 5. Windows, 7. Porches and Stoops

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:

The proposed modifications to the original COA appear to be historically appropriate, but retention of all existing sound porch railing, trim, brackets, and scrollwork is recommended with missing elements milled to match.

1. Aluminum clad wood windows, 1 over 1, meet our guidelines and are generally approved by the HARB.
2. Replacement of the slate shingles on the front mansard with CertainTeed Carriage House shingles are historically appropriate if the slate beyond repair (see image below). The Stonegate Gray color is historically appropriate. Note the side Mansard roof slates were replaced with a brownish architectural shingle in the past.



3. The replacement of porch railings with railings and balusters to match as closely as possible should be reconsidered to repairing existing and installing new railings and balusters to match where needed.

Discussion: The applicant further explain the proposed modifications to the original COA work. He said he proposed to repair the tower roof slate with slate salvaged from the mansard and to replace the front slate mansard and the side and rear asphalt shingle mansard roofs with the CertainTeed Carriage House shingle.

The porch railing replacement was also clarified. The applicant said he was planning to retain all the front porch historic millwork and balustrades and install a new wood balustrade to match the existing as closely as possible on the south side of the porch where the balustrade was completely missing. He also went on to say he proposed new balustrades to match the front as closely as possible on the rear two story porch after the removal of the rear one story addition (as approved in the earlier COA). The HARB agreed with the applicant's approach for the rear but asked that the front balustrade be milled to match the historic balustrade.

The applicant explained the request for window replacement rather than repair was mostly for energy efficiency reasons. They wanted the utility costs for the house to be as reasonable as possible for any future occupants who would likely have low or moderate income levels.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Huber and seconded by Mr. Fillman adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to amend previous COA issued in April of 2009 at 326 N 9th Street was represented by Scotty Smith from RACA.
2. The front and side mansard roof will be replaced with CertainTeed Carriage House shingles in Stone Gate Gray color. Salvaged slate shingles from the front will be used to repair the steep tower roof of the front dormer.
3. Aluminum clad wood windows (Harvey Majesty) will be installed on the front and side of the house.
4. The historic front balusters and other wood work on the front porch will be retained. The new balustrade needed for the side of the front porch will be milled to match.
5. The railings and balusters on the back porch will be replaced with railings and balusters to match the front as closely as possible.

The proposal to recommend amending the previous COA was unanimously approved. (6-0; motion carried; Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Olson, Roberts, Sell)