

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA**

**August 5, 2019
FINAL REVIEW**

Item #2 - Case # HDC-2019-00035 – Proposal to renovate the building

Property located at: 532 Law Street

Agenda #2

Historic District: Old Fairgrounds

Case # HDC-2019-000035

Meeting date: August 5, 2019

Property Owner: RACA

Owners Address: 245 N 6th St., Allentown,
PA 18102

Applicant: Kelly McEllroy

Applicant's Address: Same

Building description, period, style defining features: This structure is a 3 story attached red brick dwelling with a Mansard roof, dormer with paired 1/1 double hung windows, segmentally arched masonry openings with 1/1 double hung windows, and a full front porch with decorative brackets, unique wood railings and turned porch posts. The house dates from the late 19th century and is Queen Anne in style. The house, although in deteriorated condition, has a high level of historic integrity.









Proposed alterations: It is proposed to renovate the building. The exterior work includes the following:

1. Install EPDM roofing on rear porch roof with 1.5" of polyisocyanurate insulation board (currently asphalt shingle)
2. Reframe and roof front porch roof with EPDM roofing with 1.5" of polyisocyanurate insulation board (currently asphalt shingle)
3. Install vinyl clad wood windows with simulated or true divided lights; paint all wood casings and trim
4. Install basement single light vinyl hopper windows; repair surrounding brickwork; install new metal grate where missing
5. Install a metal bilco style door to cover the rear exterior stair to basement
6. Replace existing front door in-kind described as a 1-5/8" 4 panel door with half-light. Prep and stain
7. Scrape and paint all painted wood including front porch woodwork, underside of porch roof, all windows and doorways.
8. Install exterior wall sconce, horizontal mailbox, and 4" high street number
9. Replace existing gutters (currently built-in) with new half round gutters and round downspouts. Material to be painted aluminum.

Staff Approvals: HDA-2019-00014 – 3/15/2019 Replace existing deteriorated scalloped slate shingles with asphalt scalloped shingles that closely resemble slate.

Background: n/a

Violations: n/a

Guideline Citation: **SIS 6** Deteriorated features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment **Allentown Guidelines for Historic**

Districts: 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 3. Roofing, 4. Walls, Siding and Trim, 5. Windows, 6. Doors, 7. Porches and Stoops, 12. Lighting

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The general renovation approach is historically appropriate, but a number of the items described in the contractor contract and specifications need to be modified or clarified:

1. The front and rear porches have pitches that appear steep enough for shingles. Fiberglass shingles (3-Tab or GAF Slateline or equivalent in antique slate color) are recommended. It is not clear why insulation is specified for the porch roofs – the added thickness is not historically appropriate.
2. It is also not clear why the front porch needs to be reframed. If necessary, the new framing must not alter the historic woodwork, built-in gutter, or the exposed roofing boards
3. New windows must be aluminum clad wood windows not vinyl clad wood windows. The windows were 1/1 double hung and the neighboring properties all have 1/1 double hung windows. The new windows should be 1/1 double hung. No divided lights needed.
4. The basement windows should also be aluminum clad or full aluminum. Single light hopper windows would be historically appropriate as well as installing a salvaged iron grate. Brick repairs around the basement windows should follow Preservation Brief #2
5. Rear basement Bilco style door is not highly visible.
6. The existing front door should be retained and repaired.
7. Light fixture specification should be submitted for approval by staff
8. Existing built-in gutters on the front of the house should be retained, rebuilt as needed, and lined with new EPDM or copper. Half round gutter would be historically appropriate at the rear of the building.
9. The front slate mansard needs repair or replacement. If repair is not possible, the slate could be replaced with real slate or a fiberglass shingle with a similar scalloped shape such as CertainTeed Carriage House shingle in a slate gray color (or equivalent).
10. This house is the mirror of 534 Law St. The porch fascia on 532 Law St may be identical to 534 and it should be investigated if the current flat board is laid over open work matching 534. If so, removal of the flat board is recommended.

Discussion: Mr. Kimmerly explained that the Mansard roof had received a staff approval for replacement with Carriage House shingles as recommended by the Historic Consultant. The applicants were receptive to the recommendations in general. The items discussed included using GAF Slateline shingles on the front and rear porch roofs without insulation underlayment, aluminum clad 1 over 1 windows (Harvey Industries or equivalent) on floors 1-3, aluminum clad, fiberglass, wood, or full aluminum basement hopper style windows, and restoration of the front

door and box gutters. With further discussion of the proposed rebuilding of the front porch roof, it was concluded that only several damaged rafters and roof boards would need replacement. The HARB asked that the applicants limit the work to those replacements and that they match the existing rafters and deck boards. With the restoration of the front door, it was pointed out that a separate mailbox would not be needed since the door had a mail slot. At the end of the discussion the Historic Consultant explained further the suggestion to investigate the porch fascia to see if the open decorative fascia existed under the existing flat board. The applicants said they would investigate.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Brobst and seconded by Mr. Huber adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to renovate the building at 532 Law Street was represented by Scotty Smith, Kelly McEllroy and Kevin Park.
2. The proposed work will be undertaken as defined in the application submitted and summarized below:
 - a. New asphalt/fiberglass shingles will be installed on the front and rear porches. The shingles will be either 3-Tab or GAF Slateline (or equivalent) in antique slate color. No insulation will be installed on the porch roof decks.
 - b. Only damaged joists and roof boards will be replaced on the front porch. The joists and roof boards will match the existing joists and roof boards in material, size, and detail.
 - c. New 1 over 1 aluminum clad wood windows will be installed in the existing openings. The windows must fit the opening exactly and all wood casings and trim will be painted.
 - d. New wood, aluminum clad wood, fiberglass, or full aluminum hopper style windows will be installed in the basement window openings. The surrounding brickwork will be repaired and repointed following Preservation Brief #2. A salvaged or new cast metal grate will be installed over the basement windows where missing.
 - e. A metal "Bilco" style door will be installed to cover the rear exterior stair to basement
 - f. The existing historic front door will be retained and repaired.
 - g. All painted wood including front porch woodwork, underside of porch roof, window and door trim will be repaired in-kind and painted.
 - h. A new exterior wall sconce and 4" high street number will be installed. The light fixture and street number will be submitted for staff review.
 - i. The existing front gutters (currently built-in) will be retained, repaired, and relined. New half round gutters and round downspouts will be installed at the rear of the building. Material to be painted aluminum.
 - j. The deteriorated slate roof on the front facing Mansard roof will be replaced with new CertainTeed Carriage House shingles.
 - k. The front porch fascia will be examined to see if fretwork (matching the neighboring porch) is intact beneath the flat board. If existing and in repairable condition, it will be revealed, repaired and painted.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (7-0; motion carried; Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Olson, Roberts, Sell)