



CITY OF ALLENTOWN

29775

RESOLUTION

R16 – 2019

Introduced by the Administration on March 6, 2019

**Certificates of Appropriateness for work in the Historic Districts:
317 N. 8th St, 415 N Lumber St, and 32 N Howard St.**

Resolved by the Council of the City of Allentown, That

WHEREAS, Certificates of Appropriateness are required under the provisions of the Act of the General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania No. 167, June 13, 1961 (P.L. 282) and City of Allentown Ordinance No. 12314; and

WHEREAS, the following owners and/or applicants propose exterior alterations of the listed properties as indicated on the attached Case Reports:

Bruce Beers
317 N 8th St.

Michael Irwin
415 N Lumber St.

Karim Nema, Applicant for George Nameh, Owner
32 N Howard St.

WHEREAS, on February 4, 2019, the Allentown Historical Architectural Review Board recommended approval of the above applications or offered modifications, which were subsequently accepted by the property owners, to City Council; and

WHEREAS, after reviewing the above-mentioned HARB Case Reports, it is the opinion of City Council that the proposed work is appropriate.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Allentown that Certificates of Appropriateness are hereby granted for the above referenced work.

	Yea	Nay
Candida Affa	X	
Julio A. Guridy	X	
Daryl Hendricks	X	
Cynthia Mota	X	
Courtney Robinson	X	
Ed Zucal	X	
Roger MacLean, Pres.	X	
TOTAL	7	0

THIS IS TO CERTIFY, That the above copy of Resolution No. 29775 was adopted by the City Council of Allentown on the 6th day of March, 2019, and is on file in the City Clerk's Office.


 City Clerk

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
FINAL REVIEW SHEET
February 13, 2018**

ITEM #3 – Case #HDC-2019-00004– Proposal to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house.

Property located at: 32 N Howard Street

Agenda #3

Historic District: Old Allentown

Case # HDC-2019-00003

Meeting date: February 4, 2019

Property Owner: George Nameh

Owners Address: 229 Clover Ln,
Whitehall, PA 18052

Applicant: Karim Nema

Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 3 story, 2 bay semi-detached bricktoted dwelling with mansard roof, wall dormer with paired double hung windows and front facing gable, a full-front porch with replacement posts and guard. The house dates from c. 1890 and is Eastlake Queen Anne in style.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house.

Staff Approvals: 7/30/2003 - Repair of rear porches and railings.

5/4/2005 - Replace shingles on front porch roof, replace vinyl soffit on front porch ceiling, replace posts on existing rear deck, replace gutters & downspout

Violations: n/a

Background: n/a

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5.** Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternate Materials, 3. Roofing **Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:** The existing porch roof slope appears to be of sufficient slope for shingles. The historic roof would have been either slate or metal flat seamed. The roof shingles are difficult to see from the street due to the narrow street dimension and the raised level of the porch. The roof shingles installed without HARB approval are brown architectural fiberglass shingles. The color and texture are not historically appropriate, but the roof is difficult to see.

Instead of requiring the shingles to be replaced it might be more beneficial to require the front guard/railing to be replaced with a historically appropriate guard/railing. There should be a traditionally detailed top and bottom rail and 1 ½" – 2" square balusters. All painted wood work should be scraped and painted. The door should also be painted a single color (white grid should match the door color).

If the Mansard shingles are replaced in the future, they must be replaced with a slate look shingle such as GAF Slateline fiberglass shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Discussion: Ms. Jackson said she did not support the idea of allowing the inappropriate roof shingle to remain even though she liked the idea of improving the porch guard/railing. She thought it important to follow the rules; the Design Guidelines do not allow "architectural" type roof shingles. Mr. Renault and Mr. Huber also agreed with Ms. Jackson on the importance of replacing the non-compliant roofing shingles. Mr. Sell said he thought the existing shingles could remain because it was very hard to see them. Mr. Fillman liked the idea and upgrading the front porch guard/railing, but in the end agreed the Guidelines needed to be followed. Ms. Olsen expressed concern about new roof shingles being different from all the other shingles on the house and neighboring house. Mr. Kimmerly said the roof material that was previously on the roof was 3-tab asphalt shingle. It was decided the applicant could use 3-tab shingles in dark gray or black which would meet the Design Guidelines and be less expensive than GAF Slateline shingles. After discussing options for dates by which the work would need to be completed, it was decided that the work must be completed by May 30, 2019.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house at 32 N Howard Street was presented by George Nameh.
2. The "architectural" style shingles installed without HARB were not approved.
3. The existing non-compliant shingles must be replaced with new 3-tab shingles in black or dark gray color.
4. The new roof must be installed by May 30, 2019.

The proposal to recommend a COA was approved. (6-1; motion carried; Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Renault, Roberts, Sell: Olson opposed the replacement because the new shingles would not match the rest of the house or the neighboring house.)

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
FINAL REVIEW SHEET
February 13, 2018**

ITEM #2 – Case #HDC-2019-00003– Proposal to replace current windows in front of the house which are a violation with vinyl windows to fit the original openings.

Property located at: 415 N Lumber Street

Agenda #2

Historic District: Old Allentown

Case # HDC-2019-00002

Meeting date: February 4, 2019

Property Owner: Michael Irwin

Owners Address: 415 N Lumber Street,
Allentown, PA 18103

Applicant: same

Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 2 ½ story, 2 bay attached brick dwelling with a gable roof, corbeled brick cornice, single roof dormer, 1 over 1 double hung windows (replaced without HARB approval), front door with inappropriate white storm door, and grocer alley door. All masonry openings have segmental arches. The house dates from c. 1887 and is Federal in style with Victorian details.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to replace current windows in front of the house which are a violation with vinyl windows to fit the original openings.

Staff Approvals: December 9, 2002 – Replace 3 front window and 2 rear windows same size and configuration vinyl windows.

January 22, 2013 – Maintain front storm door.

Violations: September 10, 2003 – Windows installed are smaller than the opening size.

August 3, 2018 – Windows installed are smaller than the opening size.

Background: 1984-21 – Proposal to add 2 story addition to the rear of the building. Withdrawn 4/20/1984.

1984-60 – Proposal to replace asbestos shingles on rear of building with redwood siding.

Recommended for approval by HARB. City Council approved by Resolution 25397, September 19, 1984.

HDC-2013-00008 - January 22, 2013 - Proposal to maintain the full-view Pella storm door with addition of wood blocking at top. HARB recommended to City Council to approve a COA for existing storm door may remain in place, but it must be painted to match the trim color of the house. The four existing front windows will be replaced with new 2 over 2 double hung vinyl windows with exterior adhered muntin bars. The new windows must fit the size of the historic

windows openings. It is recommended that the vinyl windows be a color other than white. City Council approved by Resolution 28925 February 25, 2013.

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5.** Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternate Materials, 5. Windows

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: Vinyl windows are not included in the potentially approvable replacement windows for primary facades. The existing vinyl windows are a violation. They replaced wood 2 over 2 double hung windows and do not fit the existing masonry openings correctly. New replacement windows should fit the existing masonry openings more closely and should have exterior applied vertical muntins in each sash to recreate the original 2 over 2 appearance. The windows should be one of the approvable materials: wood, aluminum clad wood, smooth fiberglass, or wood composite.

The existing aluminum storm door was approved by HARB but required to be painted to match the existing trim color. This should also be done as soon as weather permits. It is recommended to remove the white mini blinds in the storm door which obstruct the view of the primary door.

Discussion: The applicant said he was willing to install the recommended aluminum clad windows instead of vinyl windows. He also agreed to install the windows with 2 over 2 simulated divided lights as was historically seen on the building and is seen on adjacent buildings. He explained to the HARB that the storm door had been approved by an earlier approval and that the storm door had mini blinds in between the glass layers. He also said the blinds can be raised to the top and that usually they are in that position. The applicant indicated he intended to install windows with a beige color. He also said he would paint the storm door to match the new windows. The HARB explained that was not appropriate; the storm door should be painted to match the trim. After some discussion it was decided that the windows and painting of the storm door would need to be completed by May 1, 2019. Mr. Huber informed that HARB that he had a conflict of interest with the case and would abstain from voting.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to replace current windows in front of the house which are a violation with vinyl windows to fit the original openings at 415 N Lumber Street was presented by Michael Irwin.
2. Aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided lights in a 2 over 2 configuration will be installed on the front of the house.
3. Each window must fit the exact size of its masonry opening without blocking.
4. The existing storm door will be painted to match the trim color (and not the window color) as required by the earlier COA.
5. The above work will be completed by May 1, 2019.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (6-0; motion carried; Fillman, Jackson, Olson, Renaut, Roberts, Sell; Huber abstained due to a conflict of interest)

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
FINAL REVIEW SHEET
February 13, 2018**

ITEM #1 – Case #HDC-2019-00002– Proposal to replace deteriorated original lintels and other wood trim with Fypon to match original as close as possible.

Property located at: 317 N 8th Street
Agenda #1
Historic District: Old Allentown
Case # HDC-2019-00002
Meeting date: February 4, 2019

Property Owner: Bruce Beers
Address: 122 E State St, Coopersburg, PA
18036
Applicant: same
Applicant's Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 2 ½ story, 3 bay attached brick dwelling with a gable roof with slate shingles, single roof dormer, 1 over 1 vinyl windows (originally 2 over 2), front door with arched Italianate surround, and original grocer alley door. The windows have character defining eyebrow lintels typical of the Italianate style. The house dates from c. 1874 and is Federal in style with Italianate details.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to replace deteriorated original lintels and other wood trim with Fypon to match original as close as possible.

Staff Approvals: n/a

Background: n/a

Violations: June 15, 1993 – Window removed from 3rd floor dormer window – abated.

May 16, 2011 – Satellite dish installed near 3rd floor dormer window – abated.

September 25, 2018 – Lintels over windows are falling off.

Guideline Citation: **SIS 6** Deteriorated features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 4. Walls, Siding and Trim

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The existing historic wood lintels and applied moldings are character defining features of the existing building. Most of the lintels and moldings are in repairable condition. It is also likely that the one lintel that has become detached from the façade is repairable. It is recommended that the lintels be retained, repaired, properly flashed and caulked at the joint between the flashing and brick, and painted. All wood features and trim should be scraped and painted to preserve them from further decay.

The proposed Fypon lintel and molding features are not historically accurate and may not fit the existing windows properly. Fypon is a rigid foam material and not an appropriate alternative to historic wood and moldings on primary facades.

Discussion: After hearing the Consultant's recommendations the applicant changed course and said he could repair the existing lintels. There was a brief discussion of the repainting of the wood work. The Consultant recommended painting the window trim, sills, and lintels all the same color. The applicant said he would do that. There was also a recommendation from the HARB to replace or remove the existing inappropriate style storm door. The Consultant recommended removing it for the most historically appropriate appearance.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Huber and seconded by Mr. Fillman adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to replace deteriorated original lintels and other wood trim with Fypon to match original as close as possible at 317 N 8th Street was represented by Bruce Beers.
2. The existing wood lintels and trim will be repaired in kind and not replaced with Fypon rigid foam materials.
3. When the building's woodwork is repainted it is recommended to paint the window trim, sills, and lintels all the same color.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (6-0; motion carried; Fillman, Huber, Olson, Renaut, Roberts, Sell)