

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
FINAL REVIEW SHEET
February 13, 2018**

ITEM #3 – Case #HDC-2019-00004– Proposal to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house.

Property located at: 32 N Howard Street

Agenda #3

Historic District: Old Allentown

Case # HDC-2019-00003

Meeting date: February 4, 2019

Property Owner: George Nameh

Owners Address: 229 Clover Ln,
Whitehall, PA 18052

Applicant: Karim Nema

Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 3 story, 2 bay semi-detached brickoted dwelling with mansard roof, wall dormer with paired double hung windows and front facing gable, a full-front porch with replacement posts and guard. The house dates from c. 1890 and is Eastlake Queen Anne in style.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house.

Staff Approvals: 7/30/2003 - Repair of rear porches and railings.

5/4/2005 - Replace shingles on front porch roof, replace vinyl soffit on front porch ceiling, replace posts on existing rear deck, replace gutters & downspout

Violations: n/a

Background: n/a

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternate Materials, 3. Roofing

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The existing porch roof slope appears to be of sufficient slope for shingles. The historic roof would have been either slate or metal flat seamed. The roof shingles are difficult to see from the street due to the narrow street dimension and the raised level of the porch. The roof shingles installed without HARB approval are brown architectural fiberglass shingles. The color and texture are not historically appropriate, but the roof is difficult to see.

Instead of requiring the shingles to be replaced it might be more beneficial to require the front guard/railing to be replaced with a historically appropriate guard/railing. There should be a traditionally detailed top and bottom rail and 1 ½" – 2" square balusters. All painted wood work should be scraped and painted. The door should also be painted a single color (white grid should match the door color).

If the Mansard shingles are replaced in the future, they must be replaced with a slate look shingle such as GAF Slateline fiberglass shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Discussion: Ms. Jackson said she did not support the idea of allowing the inappropriate roof shingle to remain even though she liked the idea of improving the porch guard/railing. She thought it important to follow the rules; the Design Guidelines do not allow "architectural" type roof shingles. Mr. Renault and Mr. Huber also agreed with Ms. Jackson on the importance of replacing the non-compliant roofing shingles. Mr. Sell said he thought the existing shingles could remain because it was very hard to see them. Mr. Fillman liked the idea and upgrading the front porch guard/railing, but in the end agreed the Guidelines needed to be followed. Ms. Olsen expressed concern about new roof shingles being different from all the other shingles on the house and neighboring house. Mr. Kimmerly said the roof material that was previously on the roof was 3-tab asphalt shingle. It was decided the applicant could use 3-tab shingles in dark gray or black which would meet the Design Guidelines and be less expensive than GAF Slateline shingles. After discussing options for dates by which the work would need to be completed, it was decided that the work must be completed by May 30, 2019.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to continue installation of brown architectural shingles which match the shingles on the neighbor's house at 32 N Howard Street was presented by George Nameh.
2. The "architectural" style shingles installed without HARB were not approved.
3. The existing non-compliant shingles must be replaced with new 3-tab shingles in black or dark gray color.
4. The new roof must be installed by May 30, 2019.

The proposal to recommend a COA was approved. (6-1; motion carried; Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Renault, Roberts, Sell: Olson opposed the replacement because the new shingles would not match the rest of the house or the neighboring house.)