

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN  
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
FINAL REVIEW SHEET  
December 11, 2018**

**Case #HDC-2018-00036**– Proposal to renovate the façade

**Property located at:** 409 N 10<sup>th</sup> Street  
**Agenda #2**

**Historic District:** Old Allentown

**Case #** HDC-2018-00039

**Meeting date:** December 3, 2018

**Property Owner:** Richard Sodke

**Owners Address:** 2377 Dewey Ave,  
Northampton, PA 18067

**Applicant:** Heidi Westerman

**Address:** 435 Hamilton St, Allentown, PA  
18101

**Building description, period, style, defining features:** This structure is a 2 bay, 3 story painted brick row home with Mansard roof, gabled wall dormer with paired doubled hung windows, corbelled and decorative brick at the cornice and window heads, 1 over 1 double hung windows, and decorative and incised wood porch with original turned posts and unique porch railing. The house dates from c. 1893 and is Queen Anne in style. The house has a high level of historic integrity and is located in a row of homes showing integrity.



**Proposed alterations:** It is proposed to renovate the façade:

1. Chemically strip paint from brick façade. Repoint as needed, leave unpainted.
2. Remove front section of porch railing and construct new railing to match as close as possible.
  - A. Side rails and balusters to be wet scraped and painted.
3. Wet scrape loose paint from porch ceiling- enclose by installing new bead-board material over existing ceiling.
4. Remove and replace existing wood fascia board in-kind, paint.
5. Stabilize all paint on existing columns, headers, trim, window sills and casings, door trim, header and casing.
6. Wet scrape porch floor and seal with masonry paint
7. Remove existing 3<sup>rd</sup> floor wood windows and replace with vinyl windows to match windows on 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Storm windows to remain.

**Staff Approvals:** N/A

**Violations:** 8/31/2018 – Parts of decorative railings removed.

**Background:** HARB Case # 1985-18;

Proposed alterations: Install aluminum siding over asphalt shingles on concrete block garage. Replace chain link fence with wood privacy fence. HARB recommended approval on 4/29/1985. Approved by City Council Resolution # 25502, May 15, 1985.

HARB Case # 1985-34; Proposed alterations: Request to use vinyl siding on garage instead of aluminum previously approved. HARB recommended approval on June 3, 1985. Approved by City Council Resolution # 25519, June 19, 1985.

**Guideline Citation: SIS 9.** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternate Materials, 2. Historic Masonry 5. Windows 7. Porches and Stoops

**Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:** The proposed alterations are mostly historically appropriate with some modifications and clarifications:

1. Any paint removal and repointing of masonry work should follow Preservation Brief # 1 Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings, and Preservation Brief #2 Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings. Cleaners should be gentle and proper disposal of removed paint and cleaner must be performed. Repointing should be done by a professional utilizing appropriately soft, lime-based mortar formulated as prescribed in the Brief.
2. Reconstruction of a new railing in wood is appropriate if milled to match. The design is not that complicated, and replication should be feasible.
3. It is recommended to simply scrap and paint the porch ceiling instead of covering with bead board, which is not the historic appearance.
4. Replacement in-kind of fascia is appropriate but it is not clear which fascia is intended. Removal of the aluminum capping on the porch entablature and soffit is recommended.
5. Not sure what is meant by “stabilizing paint”. Trim should be scraped, sanded, and painted.
6. Porch floor should be scraped, sanded, and painted with appropriate flooring paint, not masonry paint.
7. Removal of existing wood windows should only occur if windows are beyond repair. If maintaining the storm windows, repair of existing windows, fitted with weather stripping, might be more cost effective and would be energy efficient in combination with the storms. If windows are beyond repair, new wood windows, or aluminum-clad wood windows would need to be installed - vinyl is not approvable for front facades. Ideally existing vinyl windows would eventually be replaced with wood or aluminum-clad wood windows.

**Discussion:** The applicant gave further information to the HARB about the project and about the materials of some of the features of the building. She said the project was a lead abatement project. There was a child living there with high lead levels, and there was a limited budget for the work. The applicant explained that the porch floor was concrete with a bullnose detail and that the windows were wood on the first and third floors. She explained that the cost to properly remove the paint from the third floor sashes and casing was much higher than the cost to replace the windows. The options discussed for replacement included aluminum clad wood windows and fiberglass windows.

A longer discussion ensued about the porch ceiling. Again, the applicant explained some of the particulars of lead paint abatement. She said the scrape and paint approach was only temporary and that on-going repainting would be needed. Given the ownership of the building, maintenance could not be expected. Given this problem the HARB decided to permit the beaded board installation since the appearance was historically appropriate and because of the lead paint abatement issue. The HARB requested the bead board to be installed so that the beads were parallel to the street.

Paint removal technique was reviewed and verified to be an appropriate non-abrasive stripping method.

At the end the HARB asked if the non-historic aluminum awning on the third floor could be removed. The applicant said she would if possible.

**Motion:** The HARB upon motion by Mr. Brobst and seconded by Ms. Jackson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to renovate the façade at 409 N 10<sup>th</sup> Street was presented by Heidi Westerman.
2. Existing lead paint will be removed from the front façade using non-abrasive methods.
  - a. Prosoco stripper will be used to strip paint from brick façade.
  - b. Repointing will be done as needed with soft, lime-based mortar to match the existing in color and joint style.
  - c. The façade will remain unpainted natural red brick.
3. One missing section of the porch railing will be milled to match the historic as close as possible.
4. Remaining historic sections of the porch railing will be wet scraped and painted.
5. The existing open rafter porch ceiling will have loose paint removed and new bead-board material installed perpendicular to the existing rafters to enclose the lead paint.
6. The installation of the bead-board ceiling was approved only because of the need to enclose the lead paint.
7. The existing wood fascia board on the front porch will be removed and replaced in-kind and painted.
8. All paint on existing columns, headers, trim, window sills and casings, door trim, header and casing will be scraped and repainted.
9. The existing painted concrete porch floor will be scraped and repainted with durable, garage floor type paint.
10. The existing 3<sup>rd</sup> floor wood windows will be removed and replaced with fiberglass or aluminum clad wood 1 over 1 double hung windows to match existing. Storm windows may be retained if desired. Windows must fit the existing openings without blocking.
11. The third floor non-historic aluminum awning will be removed, if necessary.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (8-0; motion carried; Brobst, Fillman, Huber, Jackson, Olson, Renaut, Roberts, Sell)