

**CITY OF ALLENTOWN
HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
FINAL REVIEW SHEET
August 6, 2018**

Case #HDC-2018-00024– Proposal to replace existing terra cotta garage roof with alternative roofing material

Property located at: 1601 W Turner St.

Agenda # 1

Historic District: West Park

Case # HDC-2018-00024

Meeting date: August 6, 2018

Property Owner: Kassandra Hartford & Katherine Kaiser

Owners Address: 1601 W Turner Street, Allentown, PA 18102

Applicant: same

Applicant's Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 3 story brick and stone end of row house with Flemish gable and Mansard roof, large oriel window on the second floor, full front porch with decorative urns over the brick posts, and windows with stained glass transoms. The house dates from c. 1910 and is Queen Anne/Edwardian in style. The house has a high level of historic integrity. The historic terra cotta roof on the house has been replaced with reddish 3-tab shingles as have most in the long row of homes. The historic brick garage at the rear of the property has a half-hip roof, historic wood bifolding garage doors, and original terra cotta roofing tiles.



Proposed alterations: It is proposed to replace existing terra cotta garage roof with alternative roofing material.

Staff Approvals: n/a

Background: January 10, 2011 - 10-WP-11 – Proposal to remove terra cotta shingles on garage roof and replace with 30-year red architectural shingles. Tabled pending request by HARB for applicant to consider other shingle options. January 13, 2011 – Applicant waived right to 75-day application review period. April 4, 2011 - Application tabled, applicant did not attend meeting. June 27, 2011 - HARB recommended to City Council denial of COA for the project. July 7, 2011 - application for COA for the project withdrawn.

Violations: n/a

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: 5.** Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternate Materials: 3. Roofing **Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations:** This submission and thorough application with supporting documentation illustrates an unfortunate situation for one of the few remaining terra cotta roofed buildings in the West Park Historic District. It is clear the hip roof structure is and was inadequate for the weight of the terra cotta roofing tiles. The structural repair costs plus installation of new terra cotta (\$15,714) is over twice the cost of repair and installation of asphalt fiberglass shingles (\$6,200). The choice of the best alternative material for the roof is not clear. 3-tab shingles do not offer the dimensional appearance of the tiles, but typical architectural shingles seem inappropriate given their tapered square shape. CertainTeed has a shingle, the Grand Manor, in Terra Cotta that, although not square cornered, does have a shape and dimensional quality more similar to the existing terra cotta tiles. It is crucial to maintain the hip roof design and to have the hip and ridge shingles.

CertainTeed Grand Manor in terra cotta:



GAF Timberline Patriot Red (too red):



CertainTeed – Firescreen 3 tab in terra cotta



Discussion: There was a lengthy discussion of the roof replacement. The applicants said they investigated the cost of the Grand Manor fiberglass shingle recommended by the historic consultant. It would cost a small amount more and they said they were willing to incur the extra cost. They thought the shingle would give a more historically appropriate look to the garage. The cost to remove the terra cotta, rebuild the roof structure to adequately support the weight of the roofing and reinstall new terra cotta roofing was over twice the cost of roof repair and installation of fiberglass shingles which they could not afford.

There was a question about the garage doors, and the applicants said the doors had been damaged and removed before they bought the property. Several HARB members were familiar with the property and said the previous owners did not maintain or take care of the property. Mr. Fillman also said the garage roof was leaking many years ago. Two neighbors were at the meeting in support of permitting an alternate roofing material to be approved.

Mr. Huber said he was very concerned about the precedent that would be set if the replacement with alternate material approved. The historic consultant said that, from what could be seen in the submitted photographs, the roof structure had not been constructed adequately to carry the heavy load of the terra cotta roofing tiles. Mr. Brobst agreed. The structural inadequacy was an important extenuating circumstance for this project and the main reason the proposed roof replacement received support from most of the HARB members.

Other miscellaneous items were reviewed. The applicant said they would keep the existing half round gutters or replace them in-kind. Mr. Fillman suggested installing rolled metal ridge caps on the roof hips and ridge. The HARB thought that would be a good solution and better than fiberglass shingled ridges. The color of the ridge caps was debated.

The salvaging of the historic terra cotta roofing tiles was urged. The applicants said they would salvage what they could; they expect many tiles will break in the removal process. It was recommended that the salvaged material be donated to the APL warehouse or kept by the owners for possible reinstallation on the front mansard roof of the house sometime in the future.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Fillman and seconded by Mr. Brobst adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

1. The proposal to replace existing terra cotta garage roof with alternative roofing material at 1601 W. Turner Street was presented by Katherine Kaiser and Kassandra Hartford.
2. The terra cotta roof will be replaced with Grand Manor fiberglass shingles in the terra cotta color.
3. Rolled metal ridge caps will be installed on the hips and ridge.
4. The metal will be painted to match the shingle in color.
5. The existing half round gutter will be reinstalled or replaced in-kind.
6. The HARB approved the terra cotta roofing replacement with alternate material due to the structural inadequacy dating from the garage's original construction, the fact that the roof was on a garage at the rear of the property, and because the terra cotta roofing had already been replaced on the house.

The proposal to recommend a COA was approved. (4-1; motion carried; Brobst, Fillman, Olson, Roberts; Huber-denied)