



Allentown

435 Hamilton Street
Allentown, Pa. 18101

Minutes - Final

City Council

Wednesday, November 15, 2017

6:30 PM

Council Chambers

Contract Approval Meeting

Call to Order: Council President O'Connell

Present: 6 - Ray O'Connell, Daryl Hendricks, Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, David McGuire, and Cynthia Mota

Excused: 1 - Julio Guridy

RESOLUTIONS FOR FINAL PASSAGE (To be Voted On):

[15-1980](#)

R183

Authorization for Engagement of Professional Services with the Cultural Coalition of Allentown in the amount of \$9,000 for administration, management & monitoring of the Artist-in-Residency Program

Attachments: [R183 Request for Council Approval - Cultural Coalition of Allentown](#)

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked Mr. Hartzell to introduce the staff.

Mr. Brent Hartzell introduced Judy Snyder and Hannah Hart.

Ms. Judy Snyder stated that this is a contract with Cultural Coalition of Allentown. They had a management program - professional service for over \$3,999.99. As required, there were two quotes obtained. They did an RFP and scored them. They had the Artists in Residency criteria and the Cultural Coalition of Allentown received more points.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked any comments from his colleagues.

Dr. David McGuire stated that the city has a program funding artists in residency.

Ms. Hannah Hart stated that this program is the Artists in Residency Program. The Cultural Coalition of Allentown will be doing the management of the program. The program is one in the Arts Commission.

Dr. David McGuire stated that somewhere there is \$50,000 associated with Artists in Residency.

Ms. Hannah Hart stated that the \$9,000 is taken out of that line item. It is arts in economic development.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if there were any other questions from Council or the public.

Yes: 6 - Ray O'Connell, Daryl Hendricks, Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, David McGuire, and Cynthia Mota

Absent: 1 - Julio Guridy

Enactment No: 29574

15-1920

R177

Authorization for a three year contract with Centerra Integrated Services, LLC, in the amount of \$7,048,490 over three years (2018-\$2,322,170; 2019-\$2,349,260; 2020-\$2,377,060) for Municipal Fleet Maintenance Services with an option of two additional three years agreements – 2 bids.

Attachments: [R177 Request for Council Approval - Centerra](#)
[RFP No. 2017-08 Municipal Fleet Maintenance Services -Final](#)
[Addendum No. 1](#)

Ms. Judy Snyder stated that it was released as a bid and advertised on September 13th. The public opening was held on October 16th. There were two bidders: First Vehicle and Centerra. Centerra was the lowest and recommended by the contract administrator.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if there were any comments from his colleagues. He stated that he and Mr. Hendricks had an informational meeting with SEIU and the entire Council had a meeting with Mr. Messenger and his staff in an Executive Session. He and Mr. Hendricks met with representatives from SEIU local and 32BJ and they met with Mr. Messenger.

Mr. Craig Messenger stated that they met to go over the facts to show how personnel is put in the budget.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked Mr. Messenger what is the difference in dollars between Centerra proposed contract and the SEIU representatives.

Mr. Craig Messenger stated that the budget they gave to you during the Executive Session is the budget he stands on. They wanted to make sure that any possible non-target would be something that would not be involved and it is a very miniscule amount of money. He stated that he stands by the numbers that he showed them in the Executive Session.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if they saw the numbers. He asked what is the difference.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated yes, they saw it on the screen and they went over personnel costs. He stated \$1,400,000. He is not sure if they are still sticking with minus 420 or not.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked what is the drop dead date.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated that we are at it now. We have a contract and an RFP out. We have to act in a certain amount of time or the RFP is no longer valid and we will have an emergency contract which is not good situation.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked are we way off or are we getting closer.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated that his numbers don't change.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if they gave him their numbers.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated not an overall cost. It is still \$1,056,000.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if there were any questions from his colleagues.

Mr. Taylor Harless, Research Analyst with SEIU - 1515 Market Street, Philadelphia, stated that he has a different take on the meeting last week from Mr. Messinger. He thought it was positive. He thought after meeting with the staff the fundamental of our proposal was sound and bringing the work in-house will save the city money. We were only able to look at the document last Monday. We received the document late this afternoon. He stated that the city scenario budget that was discussed was that the assumption for bargaining unit employees were too high. We provided Mr. Messinger with accurate numbers. It was actually in line with our projections. The city's budget scenario was added one new employee to the department and it was an executive who will be compensated over \$100,000 a year. We don't necessarily see the need to have three managers. If you strip away some of the things you were talking about and compared the city's draft budget to our proposal it is less than an \$80,000 difference. The union is committed to working with the city to do what it takes to make that happen.

Mr. Ray O'Connell stated that Centerra 2018, \$2,322,178. He asked what can SEIU do it for?

Mr. Taylor Harless stated that the number they submitted at the last Council meeting is the same number that they have. For labor that will be \$1,056,000 for the first year. We believe all the other cost will remain the

same because they are commodities. The change in cost is the end of this \$200,000 management fee that the city pays to Centerra per year.

Mr. Ray O'Connell stated you are talking about an \$80,000 difference. He asked if there were any questions from his colleagues.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated that the actual rates that they were going to propose for the mechanics to be paid doesn't match the 2018 budget book. They stated a rate that is not either stated here. The numbers that we went over. He stated that he did an LSR and they said it would be handled through a Right to Know. There is no way that it matches with the sheet. It doesn't make sense.

Mr. Taylor Harless stated that these are new positions with the city and subject to bargaining if the city does decide to bring this work back in-house. I cannot commit to specifics right now, but we are ready to work with the city to make this a cost saving initiative, subject to bargaining.

Mr. Ryan Hunsicker, SEIU Chapter Leader, stated that he has been working diligently on this along with Taylor. We had the pleasure meeting Mr. Messinger and his staff. He stated that it was a productive meeting. The overall cost in this contract has to play a role in this. We did Right To Knows and asked for non-targeted costs from 2014 - 2017 at \$155,000 which is a savings. The city would not absorb that as a cost. From 2014 - 2017 you paid them \$8.4 million and that was non-targeted work and targeted work total. He suggested that Council consider a no vote tonight, come back in-house and you reap the savings.

Mr. Craig Messinger stated that the \$8.4 million was for the entire budget for fuel and everything.

Mr. Gregory Hoffman, 1420 W. Gordon Street - Assistant Chapter Leader SEUI 32BJ, asked how can a company that wants to make a profit come in cheaper than the city itself who is just sustaining. There is something there. It has to come down on somebody's back. Some of the workers said that they did not get a raise in three years because they used all their money up during the overtime during the winter. As a citizen, I feel when an employee is taken care better. He stated that is where the money discrepancy is. How does that company make money, if they come in cheaper than us?

Mr. Michael Kaminiski, 779 Benton Street, stated that here we are again. We are trying to sub out something to have our own personal oversight of and make sure everything is done the right way. The definition of insanity is doing the same thing and expecting a different result. We talked about leasing the Golf Course and said that was a bad idea. To me, it is the

same type of deal. It makes no logistical sense to me.

Mr. Glenn Hunsicker, 844 S. 11th Street, stated that he was looking at some numbers. For nine years, you had two supervisors and nine workers. Why in this moment, they would say we need another supervisor. Mr. Messinger should be looking to do the best thing and do it in-house. He talked about the value of the pay. Their pay comes over the same. There is no difference.

Mr. Ray O'Connell stated that you are speculating. Mr. Messinger is a straight shooter. He asked if there were any other comments from the public. He asked Mr. Hanlon who is the Solicitor for this evening and to get a hold of her.

Mr. Michael Hanlon stated that Ms. Fran Fruhwirth is the Solicitor.

Mr. Tom Hahn, 2016 E. Highland Street, asked if Council received the email on the questions to be reviewed. He asked how was the extensions of the contracts done, what were the addendums that were added, how were the audits completed, what was this contract rated on renewal, was Council ever updating on the issues of the contract, the rules on how the contract was updating and asked about Mr. Glazier's report that he said was half finished and the repairs that were not done in a timely manner. Council can change this in an instant and take complete control.

Mr. Ray O'Connell stated that he read them.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks stated that he read them.

Mr. Ray O'Connell asked if there were any other comments from the public. He stated that at this time Council will go into Executive Session.

Mr. Daryl Hendricks stated that he in no way would put the safety of the city's fire department, police department, EMS or any other city employee in danger. As what was pointed out, he believes Craig's numbers were correct and there were only two entities that submitted a proposal. It is difficult in this late point in time to consider a third. I am voting yes.

Mr. Roger MacLean stated ditto and yes.

Yes: 5 - Daryl Hendricks, Candida Affa, Roger MacLean, David McGuire, and Cynthia Mota

No: 1 - Ray O'Connell

Absent: 1 - Julio Guridy

Enactment No: 29574

ADJOURNED: 7:03 PM