

HDC-2022-00019**Address: 1446 W. Linden Street****Applicant: Owner, Joan E. Nyemscek; Matthew Del Prado present at meeting****HARB Meeting Date: May 02, 2022****Building Description:**

This building is in the West Park Historic District. This 3-story brick house, ca 1900 is a porch house. The mansard roof has fish scale shingles with parapet wall half the way up the roof and a projecting cornice. There is a triple dormer with a gable roof that has fish scale shingles and a finial. The 2nd floor has a triangle bay with two 1/1 sash windows with wood lintels and vignette over each window, the windows have ornate frames and there are smaller casement windows on either side with stone lintels. The 1st floor has a two 1/1 sash windows with brick lintels and a single glazed door with transom. The wooden porch has classic columns with turned wood balustrade and railing; there are concrete steps with wrought iron railings and a basement window. There is a fire escape on the side of the building.

Project Description:

As Provided by Applicant: Removal of soffit to expose header. Replacement of structural header. Install new wood (HB+G) column. Build new soffit with pine lumber to match HARB criteria.

Primary Façade (Applicant)**Existing Header (Applicant)****Applicable Guidelines:****Chapter 3.7 - Porches & Steps**

3.7.3 Repair and restore existing porches and steps whenever possible. Salvage, repair, and reuse existing components including deck floorboards, railings, balusters, posts, and decorative trim. Repair and restore basement level windows or metal grates that are part of the porch base.

3.7.4 Replace individual deteriorated components in-kind with new materials matching the original in material composition, size, shape, profile, dimension, appearance, and finish. Custom fabrication is encouraged and may be necessary to provide an exact match. Where an exact match of the historic element cannot be found or fabricated, the new element should match the original as closely as possible.

Observations & Recommendations:

The header repair and new soffit is appropriate. The soffit and wood trim around the structural header should match the existing appearance. All wood elements should be painted to match the existing trim and to protect the wood material. The proposed use of a new wood column to replace the missing original material is appropriate. The proposed tapered wood column with new capital and base to match existing historic elements is appropriate in material, size, shape, and

profile. Staff has recommended that the Applicant and neighbor at 1444 W. Linden coordinate about their respective repair projects because the missing column is a common structural feature between the two porches.

HARB Discussion:

MD asked, following the preliminary review of the application, to amend the application to propose using an alternative material to wood- permacast for the posts. No information was presented as part of the application packet to evaluate the substitution request.

SO added that the HARB approved a wood column for this property as part of a previous application.

JS clarified that the approval of this application and the neighboring property (next agenda item) should be consistent.

LE stated that Guidelines were written with consideration of alternative materials advocated with concern for sustainability. The permacast product is fiberglass and does not qualify as a sustainable material.

HARB members discussed the appropriateness of approving a fiberglass product as an acceptable alternative material. GL stated fiberglass is not a sustainable material and therefore not in line with the recommendations set forth in the Guidelines.

AJ stated the HARB can approve the application as presented with wood posts or HARB can table the application if the applicant would like to proceed with a substitution.

GL referenced page 21 of the Guidelines which identifies the information needed for the HARB to consider the alternative material.

JS noted the neighboring property at 1444 W. Linden St. last meeting was approved with wood.

Action:

HARB member Glenn Lichtenwalner made a motion to approve the application presented on 05/02/22 for removal and replacement of the structural header with new wood header, install new wood column and rebuild soffit in wood to match existing at *1446 W Linden Street* as submitted.

The application is in compliance with the following sections of the Guidelines for Historic Districts Chapter 3.7 Porches & Steps, Sections 3.7.3 and 3.7.4 and there are no circumstances unique to the property.

Motion to approve made by HARB member Glenn Lichtenwalner, motion was seconded by HARB member Alex Encelewski. Motion carried with unanimous support.

Therefore, the Approved Alterations for the purpose of writing and issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness are:

1. Removal and replacement of the structural header with new wood header, as submitted.
2. Install new wood column, as submitted. The new column shall match the historic in appearance, material, and profile.
3. Rebuild soffit with new wood to match existing soffit and trim, as submitted.