

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Preliminary Review Sheet**

HDC-2024-00029

Address: 519 Liberty Street

District: Old Fairgrounds Historic District

Owner: Rudy R Jiminian

Applicant: Rudy R Jiminian

Proposal: Chimney Repair

Building Description: This 3-story brick row house, ca 1892 is a porch house. The gable roof has asphalt shingles, a shared chimney, projecting eaves and a single dormer. The windows are 1/1 double hung sash with brick lintels and the dormer window has 10/2 with a Queen Anne-stained glass upper sash with stained glass inlays. The windows have ornamental frames, and the basement windows have grilles. The main entry is a single door with a closed transom and a grocer's alley door. The front porch is wood with a wooden balustrade railing.

Project Description:

This application proposes to repoint and replace missing bricks at the chimney.



Current Chimney (Applicant)



Current Chimney (Applicant)



Current Chimney (Applicant)

Historical Architectural Review Board

COA Preliminary Review Sheet

Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.1 – Roof Features: Chimneys

3.1.22 Repair and restore historic chimneys. Repoint mortar joints with a compatible and historically appropriate mortar that matches the original in composition, strength, hardness, and color.

3.1.23 Rebuild chimneys if necessary to address structural concerns. Disassemble the masonry, carefully salvage and store the masonry units, and rebuild to the original profile and dimensions.

3.1.24 Repair and restore existing stucco or cementitious coatings to protect the masonry underneath. Although removal of coatings may be desirable to restore the appearance of the chimney, removal is likely to be costly and potentially harmful to the brick because the coating has adhered to the surface. The brick may be in such a deteriorated state that it cannot be repaired which will require face brick replacement or reconstruction of the chimney.

3.1.25 Retain and repair historic masonry chimney caps and terra cotta chimney pots. Replace in-kind if repair is infeasible. Replacement with a low-profile copper chimney cap may also be appropriate.

3.1.26 Avoid shortening or removing chimneys. Altering a chimney can detract from the roof appearance and the overall architectural style. Chimneys that are no longer operable should be capped and retained in place, regardless of any interior alterations.

3.1.27 Avoid adding new stucco or cementitious coatings to historically exposed brick masonry.

Section 3.3 – Masonry

3.3.2 Repair and restore brick masonry whenever possible. Attempt to repair deteriorated or damaged areas prior to replacement. Appropriate repairs include repointing (repairing mortar joints), crack repair, brick stitching, and select area replacement. Avoid removing excess material or a larger area than is required to complete the repair. New bricks should match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties.

3.3.3 Repair and restore existing stone masonry. Attempt to repair deteriorated or damaged areas prior to replacement. Appropriate repairs include repointing, crack repair, Dutchman repairs (in-kind localized patching), and patching with compatible compounds. New masonry unit should match the existing in type of stone, color, profile, dimensions, and surface texture.

3.3.4 Repoint brick and stone masonry with a compatible and historically appropriate mortar that matches the original in composition, strength, hardness, and texture. Match new mortar joints to surrounding areas in width, tooling profile, and color. Cut back and repoint mortar joints using hand tools only; mechanical grinders and similar power tools are not recommended as they can lead to excessive damage.

3.3.5 Replace or rebuild exterior masonry walls or features with in-kind materials if repair is not feasible. Replacement masonry units should match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties. Replicate the existing brick bond (how the bricks are laid).

3.3.6 Preserve and restore decorative masonry elements that are important character-defining features, such as brick corbels and patterned brick courses. Avoid altering, concealing or covering, or removing decorative masonry.

3.3.7 Avoid painting, sealing, or coating historically unpainted brick masonry. Adding exterior coatings can trap moisture and cause deterioration of masonry walls. It also detracts from a building's architectural character.

3.3.8 For existing painted or coated exterior walls, maintain and repair the painted surface rather than attempt removal. Removal is not recommended due to the likelihood of damaging the masonry substrate. Avoid removing paint or coatings

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Preliminary Review Sheet

that are firmly adhered to the masonry. Consider removal of non-historic coatings only if they are demonstrated to be causing or exacerbating other types of deterioration.

Observations & Comments: Repairing the chimney is appropriate per the design guidelines. Areas where the chimney requires rebuilding should match the existing bonding pattern of the chimney and the replacement units should match the color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition of the existing bricks. The mortar used should be compatible with the brick units and match the original in composition, strength, hardness, color, and texture, and should be tooled with the same profile as the original.

Staff Recommendation: It is recommended to approve this application with conditions:

- The chimney is rebuilt to the original profile and dimensions, utilizing the existing bonding patterns.
- The replacement brick masonry units match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties.
- Mortar used for repointing matches the original in composition, strength, hardness, and color. It should be tooled with the same profile as the original.

Draft Motions:

Discussion: It was questioned why this was not a staff approval; but staff noted there are still questions about the staff approval process. HARB members were in agreement with the staff recommendation. The applicant noted that this is a safety issue, and the chimney is missing the hood, but the chimney does have a flue. Ms. Stuck noted the guidelines have guidance on chimney caps that are appropriate.

Action: Mr. Huber made a motion to approve, with conditions, the application presented on May 6, 2024, for the chimney repair at 519 Liberty Street with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant following sections of the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 – Roof Features: Chimneys and Section 3.3 – Masonry and find that there are no circumstances unique to the property:

- The chimney is rebuilt to the original profile and dimensions, utilizing the existing bonding patterns.
- The replacement brick masonry units match the existing in color, profile, dimension, surface texture, and composition and physical properties.
- Mortar used for repointing matches the original in composition, strength, hardness, and color. It should be tooled with the same profile as the original.

Mr. Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.