

**Historical Architectural Review Board
COA Final Review Sheet**

HDC-2024-00004

Address: 23 N 12th Street

District: Old Allentown Historic District

Owner: Rosa Ramos

Applicant: Alexander Clark

Proposal: Replace roof

Building Description: This structure is a 2 ½ story, semi-detached frame dwelling with a variety of non-original sidings, gable roof with front corner tower-roof with 3 small dormers, rear shed-roofed dormer, rolled metal ridge caps and finial on the tower roof, 2-story front bay, 1 over 1 double hung windows, and shared front entry porch and curved roof. There is a rear 2 story ell with lower sloped shed roof. The ell is not visible from the front and barely visible from the rear. The house dates from the late 19th century and is altered Queen Anne in style.

Project Description:

This application proposes to remove the existing roofing and replace with EPDM rubber and GAF Timberline Slateline shingles in Antique Slate color.



Front of 23 N 12th Street
(applicant)



Current roof condition
(applicant)

Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.1 – Roofs

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Final Review Sheet

3.1.1 Inspect roofing systems regularly. Water infiltration through the roof can ultimately damage historic features throughout a building. Identify any broken shingles, exposed sheathing or substrate, damaged or missing flashing, or areas of ponding water for repair. Inspections can be conducted from the ground using binoculars if roof access is difficult. Inspect building interiors for signs of water infiltration. Clear gutters and drainage systems regularly.

3.1.2 Keep historically painted metal roofs well painted to preserve the metal below. Paint acts as a protective layer to prevent the sheet metal from weathering.

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.4 Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

3.1.5 Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

3.1.8 Replace non-historic roofing materials in-kind or with recommended alternates. If the original material is documented, restoration of the original material is also an appropriate option but is not required. Original roofs may have been replaced long ago, yet asphalt shingles and similar alterations are still considered impacts to the overall appearance. Replacement materials should match the existing in color, pattern, shape, and profile. Greater flexibility is possible with non-historic roofing and using durable high-quality replacements is recommended.

3.1.9 Consider roof ventilation alternatives carefully. Ventilation options are approved on a case by case basis and can include ridge vents, louvered vents, or soffit vents. Proper ventilation may extend the life of a roofing system, but in some cases it can lead to condensation problems with long-term effects on the roofing materials and structural components. Refer to [Chapter 3.8 Mechanical and Utility Equipment](#) for related guidelines about roof vents.

3.1.10 *Recommendation Only:* Proposed repairs or replacement of flat roofs that are not visible from the public right-of-way do not require staff approval or HARB review for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Recommended materials for flat roofs include fluid-applied membranes and modified bitumen membranes.

Observations & Comments: Google Streetview from 2014 shows slate roofing on the gable roof and tower roof but the later satellite views shows replacement shingle roofing. Rolled metal ridge caps are still on the roof. Replacement of existing asphalt shingles on the gable roof and tower roof with new GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color would be historically appropriate. New or refurbished rolled metal ridge caps should be installed on the roof edges of the tower roof and dormers. The existing historic finial must be retained, repaired in needed, and reinstalled. It is recommended to paint the rolled ridge caps and finial in a matching red color (Tinner's Rd)

The rear ell has a lower sloped roof which is not visible from N 12th Street or Court St. Replacement of existing membrane roof with new EPDM on this roof and the shed-roofed rear dormer is appropriate.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval as submitted with the condition that metal rolled ridge caps are refurbished and reinstalled or replacement in-kind. The finial must be retained, repaired, and reinstalled.

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Final Review Sheet

Discussion: There was a discussion of the current inappropriate asphalt shingle roof. It was discovered that there was a COA in 2022 to replace historic slate with new GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Gray color. Clearly the approved Slateline shingle was not utilized. The current proposal was to use the appropriate GAF Slateline shingle in Antique Slate color. The applicant agreed to refurbish the existing rolled metal ridge caps and finial. The discussion also included gutter after the applicants said they would also be replacing gutter. The current gutter installation was poorly done. Mr. Huber asked that the gutter be properly installed with hangers installed on the bottom edge of the sheathing and that half round gutter and round down spout be used. The last items of discussion were the juncture between the new shingle roof and the neighboring slate shingle roof and snow catchers. The applicant proposed to use a shingled cap at the property line which was supported by the HARB. He agreed to reinstall snow catchers.

Actions: Mr. AJ Jordan moved to approve, with conditions, the application presented on February 5th, 2024, to replace the roofing at 23 N 12th St with new GAF Slateline shingles, pursuant to Chapter 3.1. The following conditions were agreed to by the applicant:

- The existing metal rolled ridge caps will be refurbished and reinstalled or replaced in-kind
- The finial will be retained, refurbished, and reinstalled.
- Half round gutter will be installed with hangers appropriately mounted at the bottom of the sheathing
- Snow catchers will be retained and reinstalled
- A shingled cap will be installed at the joint between the neighboring roofs.

Mr. Huber seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.