HDC-2024-00053 Address: 820 Liberty Street District: Old Allentown Historic District Owner: Yorkshire Real Estate Investment Applicant: Carlos Medero, CJ Construction Roofing and Siding Proposal: Repair work at rear of house following a fire.

Building Description: This 3-story row home has been covered with aluminum siding, all details have been covered. There is a Mansard roof with black asphalt shingles on the façade. There is a dormer and the roof-line meets the house with a projecting eave. Sash windows are 1/1. There are 2 basement window grilles visible. There is a metal awning over the front door which is glazed and has a transom above it. Each of the houses in the row has a marble threshold and a brick foundation. There is a grocer's alley leading to the backyard.

Project Description:

In response to a fire, repair work is proposed at the rear of 820 Liberty Street to address damage at roofing and siding, windows, kitchen, and bathroom.



Rear of Property, 2011 (Applicant)



Rear of Property, 2019 (Applicant)



Current Condition at Rear (Applicant)



Fire Damage at Rear (Applicant)



Fire Damage at Building Rear (Applicant)



Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.1 – Roofs

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.4 Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

3.1.5 Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

3.1.8 Replace non-historic roofing materials in-kind or with recommended alternates. If the original material is documented, restoration of the original material is also an appropriate option but is not required. Original roofs may have been replaced long ago, yet asphalt shingles and similar alterations are still considered impacts to the overall appearance. Replacement materials should match the existing in color, pattern, shape, and profile. Greater flexibility is possible with non-historic roofing and using durable high-quality replacements is recommended.

3.1.9 Consider roof ventilation alternatives carefully. Ventilation options are approved on a case by case basis and can include ridge vents, louvered vents, or soffit vents. Proper ventilation may extend the life of a roofing system, but in some cases it can lead to condensation problems with long-term effects on the roofing materials and structural components. Refer to Chapter 3.8 Mechanical and Utility Equipment for related guidelines about roof vents.

3.1.36 Repair and restore gutters whenever possible. Types of repairs include repainting wood or metal surface, installing new fasteners, sealing or soldering cracks and open seams, and relining built-in box gutters with new copper sheet metal.

3.1.37 Replace existing gutters in-kind when replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration. Replicate the original construction method of a historic gutter if feasible.

3.1.38 Replace existing downspouts, scuppers, collection boxes, and other drainage elements in-kind. Appropriate alternates to in-kind replacement are round or rectangular downspouts. Smooth surfaces are encouraged over corrugated metal. In the case of decorative scuppers, replicate the profile and details as closely as possible.

3.1.39 Consider alternate materials for gutters in locations that are difficult to access for maintenance or where original materials have demonstrated a pattern of deterioration over time. A fiberglass gutter is an acceptable replacement material for a wood built-in box gutter if it matches the original in profile, size, appearance, and finish.

3.1.40 Avoid vinyl gutters due to poor durability and non-historic appearance.

3.1.41 Install new downspouts in locations that are sensitive to the architecture and will be minimally visible. Run downspouts at secondary facades and along building or porch corners when possible.

3.1.42 Paint gutters and downspouts to blend in with the building exterior. Matching the existing building trim is usually the most appropriate color selection. Copper and terne-coated stainless steel systems should be left unpainted because they weather naturally and develop a protective patina.

Section 3.2 Wood Siding and Trim

3.2.1 Clean exterior surfaces periodically using the gentlest methods possible. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or stripping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing. Conduct cleaning tests in a small, non-visible area of the building to determine the most appropriate method.

3.2.2 Provide proper drainage so that water does not stand on flat, horizontal surfaces or accumulate in decorative features. Inspecting a building after rain is an easy way to detect standing water or drainage blocks.

3.2.3 Keep wood surfaces well-painted. Paint layers help protect wood from moisture, biological growth, and ultraviolet light. Paint removal should be considered only where there is paint surface deterioration and as part of an overall maintenance program which involves repainting or applying other appropriate protective coatings.

3.2.4 Repair and restore wood siding, cladding, and trim whenever possible. Preserve wood features such as cornices, brackets, window and door moldings, and bay windows. Trim work is an essential part of a building's architectural character. Unique features of a building should be preserved. Repair historic wood features by patching, piecing-in, or Dutchman repairs, consolidating or otherwise reinforcing the wood using recognized preservation methods. Repair may also include limited replacement in-kind of extensively deteriorated or missing parts of wood features.

3.2.5 Replace deteriorated materials in-kind if repair is infeasible. New materials should replicate the original as closely as possible in material composition, size, profile, shape, pattern, and appearance. If historic wood siding or trim was an identifiable or visually distinctive species, it is recommended that the same species be used for the replacement.

3.2.6 Avoid installation of aluminum, vinyl, or synthetic materials that were unavailable when a building was constructed. Aluminum, vinyl, fiber-cement, or other synthetic cladding are not appropriate for historic properties because of their visual impact and because their installation can cause other deterioration problems. It is not appropriate to cap or cover existing wood with these types of materials. It is not appropriate to remove original wood cladding or trim features and replace them with aluminum vinyl, fiber-cement, or synthetic materials.

3.2.7 Consider removal of existing aluminum, vinyl, or synthetic cladding over building features. Historic materials sometimes remain intact below this type of cladding and can be restored. In-kind replacement of existing non-historic siding that was in place before the historic district was designated may be allowed in some cases. Consult with Staff and HARB during early project planning stages. Provide photographs or documentation of existing conditions and wall materials below non-historic siding to help determine the appropriate treatment.

3.2.8 Inspect painted wood thoroughly to determine whether repainting is necessary or if cleaning is all that is required.

3.2.9 Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint to the next sound layer of paint using the gentlest methods possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include hand-scraping and hand-sanding, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers or gentle micro-abrasion methods. Sand blasting, high pressure power washing, and mechanical grinders should not be used to remove paint from any surface. Evaluate the condition of the wood surface (also referred to as the substrate) and address any moisture infiltration and deterioration issues before priming and repainting.

3.2.10 Paint once the surface is clean and dry. Use a paint type that will adhere properly to the wood surface, such as oil-based paint. Marine grade paints are also recommended because they will perform well over long periods of time in wet climates.

3.2.11 Recommendation Only: Repaint with the existing colors, appropriate to the building's period of significance, and compatible with the historic character of the district. Paint color is not reviewed by HARB but it is recommended to select colors sensitive to the historic surroundings.

Section 3.5 – Windows

3.5.1 Retain and preserve historic windows and all associated components whenever possible, including window sash, frame, hardware, lintel, sill, trim, hood, shutters, and glazing (glass). Retain original windows in type, shape, size, operation, and material. Preserve existing glazing including stained glass as a distinctive feature of the window.

3.5.2 Keep historic wood windows in good condition by maintaining sound layers of paint at exterior and interior surfaces. Where wood has been exposed by paint failure, clean with the gentle methods possible and using lead-safe practices prior to repainting. Scrape peeling or flaking paint using hand tools down to the next sound layer of paint and ensure that the surface is clear of dirt and debris before priming and repainting.

3.5.3 Maintain operable windows, which have inherent energy-efficient advantages for air circulation. Remove paint that has sealed a window closed from the exterior and/or interior.

3.5.4 Inspect and test hardware. Ensure sash locks bring sashes together tightly to keep windows watertight.

3.5.5 Consider weatherization improvements that have minimal impact to historic fabric including sealing or recaulking around exterior and interior trim, installing weatherstripping, and installing storm windows (either exterior or interior) to improve energy efficiency.

3.5.6 Install storm windows customized to fit each window frame properly. Wood and aluminum materials are appropriate. The horizontal rails should align with window sashes. Window finishes should match the window trim or blend with the color scheme of the building. Interior storm windows may be recommended for windows with distinctive lites, artistic glazing, or irregular shapes to preserve the exterior appearance.

3.5.7 Repair, restore, and reuse original windows prior to replacing them. Where one component of a window is deteriorated or broken, repair or replace the individual piece rather than replace the entire window unit. Repair or selectively replace in-kind existing hardware to ensure window operability, including sash cords, weights, and pulleys. Repaired windows have been shown to achieve energy performance levels comparable to replacement windows.

3.5.8 Replace windows in-kind if original windows are deteriorated beyond feasible repair. Wood is the preferred material for most replacement windows. Replacement windows should match the original as closely as possible in material, size, type, operation, profile, and appearance. Replicate the existing dimensions of glazing, configuration of muntins, or unique decorative lites. Match sash and frame thickness and window depths. For existing nonoriginal windows, it is preferred to replace with wood windows rather than new alternate materials.

3.5.9 Replace windows with alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Replacement windows must match the original as closely as possible in type, size, operation, profile, appearance, and configuration of lites and muntins. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an appropriate alternate because they can replicate the original appearance and material. Composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exterior surfaces can be appropriate alternates if they match the original appearance, but are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. Vinyl windows are not appropriate due to short lifespan, poor performance, and inability to match historic profiles.

3.5.10 Preserve the ratio of window openings to solid wall surfaces. Increasing or reducing openings can impact the proportions of a facade and can look out of place within the larger streetscape. Changing the size of openings will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a facade.

3.5.11 Retain the historic pattern of window openings (fenestration pattern), especially on primary facades. Avoid inserting new windows into a facade or infilling existing windows. The position, number, and arrangement of windows defines the rhythm of a facade and can be a character-defining feature of an architectural style or a type of building use. If creating new openings or infilling existing ones is necessary for a project such as an adaptive reuse, locate openings on side or rear facades.

3.5.12 If replacing a single window on a facade, replicate the existing windows of that facade.

3.5.13 Replace single-pane glazing in-kind whenever possible. Install double-glazed windows with simulated divided lights only upon consultation with Staff/HARB. Replicate the dimensions, details, and appearance of the original window. Simulated divided light muntins should be attached to the window exterior, not sandwiched between the panes of glass.

3.5.14 Avoid reflective glazing in restored or new windows. Reflective glazing makes a window's lites and muntins difficult to see and alters the visual impact from the street. This change makes alterations in the historic district more conspicuous. Clear (non-tinted) and non-reflective glazing and low-e coatings are appropriate.

3.5.15 Replace deteriorated window trim or decorative elements only as necessary to match the size, profile, and material of the original elements. For window lintels or hoods that project from the facade plane and are vulnerable to water

collection, consider installing of metal drip edges to shed water away from windows. Copper is recommended and should be left to weather naturally; aluminum is acceptable and should be painted to match surrounding materials. Avoid encasing wood sills with metal or vinyl, as this will trap moisture and may cause more damage.

Observations & Comments: It is unclear from the application what the proposed work and materials are. More information is required to review the proposed work, including roof material, siding material, windows, and any exterior doors.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommend the applicant provide additional information for all proposed new exterior materials to be used in the repair work. Staff will then be able to review those materials against the Guidelines and provide further recommendations.

Discussion: The applicant noted he will use the 3-tab shingles on the top, vinyl siding on the side, and rubber torch down on the back of the roof. The applicant will replace everything in kind.

Mr. Jones noted the COA will be e-mailed to the applicant.

<u>Action</u>: Mr. Jordan made a motion to approve, with conditions, the application presented on 7/1/2024 for repair work of siding, roofing, and windows at the rear of 820 Liberty Street with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant following sections of the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 – Roofs, Section 3.2 – Wood Siding and Trim, and Section 3.5 – Windows and find that there are not circumstances unique to the property:

• Conditions that all materials are replaced in kind with their condition prior to the fire.

Mr. Franzone seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.