

HDC-2022-00005

Address: 38 N. 15<sup>th</sup> Street

Applicant: Owner, Francis Bickel

HARB Meeting Date: May 2, 2022

**Building Description:**

This building is in the West Park Historic District. This 2½-story single stone/stucco house, ca 1905 is a Colonial Revival. The hip roof has slate shingles, dormers, spires and projecting eaves. The windows are 1/1 sash with stone lintels on the 1st floor and a visible basement window grille. The main entry is a ¾-beveled glass door with a transom. There is a stone porch and an enclosed 2nd floor porch.

**Project Description:**

Provided by Applicant: Remove existing slate roof and install new shingles. Repair or replace roof finials.

Summarized from Submitted Materials:

- Option 1: Install architectural asphalt shingles (GAF Slateline shingles in Weathered Slate color). Install new heavy-duty aluminum wall and valley flashing and new aluminum drip edge, in “dark bronze” color.
- Option 2: Install synthetic slate shingles (Eco-Star Lifetime Synthetic Slate). Install new heavy-duty aluminum wall and valley flashing and new aluminum drip edge (drip edge to be white).

Primary Façade (Google Streetview)



Roof and Finial Detail (Applicant)



**Applicable Guidelines:**

**Chapter 3.1 – Roofs**

**Roof shingles:**

**3.1.3** Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

**3.1.7** If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

**Roof flashing and finials:**

**3.1.4** Repair and replace deteriorated flashing or fasteners with materials that are compatible with the roofing material. Roof problems are often caused by failure of these components rather than the historic roofing material.

**3.1.5** Preserve architectural features that give the roof its unique and building-specific character—such as dormers, turrets, chimneys, cornices, rolled ridge flashing, cresting, and finials. Repair and restore features; replace in-kind only when necessary.

**Observations & Recommendations:**

The proposed shingle *types* are consistent with the Guidelines as acceptable alternate materials: an architectural shingle with rectangular cuts and even exposure; and a synthetic slate with similar thickness, size, and shape of natural slate. Repair and reuse of the existing slate, or in-kind replacement, are the most appropriate treatments but alternate materials can be appropriate on a case-by-case basis.

The proposed architectural shingle is a brown/grey color, which differs from the existing red slate. The submitted work summary for these Slateline shingles indicated that the garage roof will also be replaced; the Applicant should confirm if only the house shingles are proposed for replacement.

Color, size, and product line were not specified for the proposed synthetic slate. The most appropriate replacement would match the existing red slate color as closely as possible. The size and profile of the selected synthetic slate product line should match the original as closely as possible.

New flashing is appropriate to keep the roof watertight. Proposed metal would be an in-kind replacement and therefore appropriate. The most appropriate treatment of the historic roof features (finials and rolled ridge caps) is restoration and reuse, or replaced in-kind, to be consistent with Guideline 3.1.5.

---

**HARB Discussion:**

Following the preliminary review presentation by SO, AJ asked owner if there was anything to add to the presentation, DF replied there is limited availability of the Slateline product and it is the preferred option by the applicant.

GL noted there are two different colors on the original roof. Applicant noted there are no red shingles currently available, therefore the closest color available is the weathered slate (gray) color.

SO noted that HARB has jurisdiction over color when integral to a product that is part of a permanent repair and that HARB has the ability to determine under unique circumstances, an approval of an alternate color may be warranted.

AJ asked the status of the finial replacement. Applicant noted the neighbor sourced replacement units which he will pursue.

GL asked applicant to clarify what replacement materials would be used at the metal gable hip and ridge flashings, DF replied they will be replaced in kind.

AJ prefers the Eco-Star, however both materials are appropriate according to the Guidelines.

Applicant requested HARB mention specific manufactures in Guidelines to make process clearer, AJ clarified that the HARB cannot advocate for specific brands of products.

**Action:**

HARB member Alex Encelewski made a motion to approve the application presented on 05/02/22 for replacement of slate roof shingles with an alternative shingle material at 38 N. 15th Street as submitted. The application is in compliance with the following sections of the Guidelines for Historic District: Chapter 3.1-Roofs; Roof Shingle Sections 3.1.3 and 3.1.7 along with the Roof Flashing and Finials Sections 3.1.4 and 3.1.5 and there are no circumstances unique to the property.

Motion to approve made by HARB member Alex Encelewski, motion was seconded by HARB member Glen Lichtenwalner. Motion carried with unanimous support.

Therefore, the Approved Alterations for the purpose of writing and issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness are:

1. Replacement of slate roof shingles with an alternative shingle material, as submitted. Approved replacement architectural asphalt shingles shall match those submitted to HARB.
2. Roof finials, gable hip and ridge flashings shall be replaced in kind.
3. Roof replacement shall include new heavy-duty aluminum wall and valley flashing and new aluminum drip edge as submitted.