CITY OF ALLENTOWN HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD FINAL REVIEW SHEET February 5, 2018

Case # HDC-2018-00004 Proposal to maintain the aluminum first floor windows and aluminum wrapped wood. Remove brickote and expose original brick. Front door will be replaced to resemble original. Replace windows on second and third floor.

Property located at: 1147 W. Turner St.

Agenda # 6

Historic District: Old Allentown Case # HDC-2018-00004

Meeting date: February 5, 2018

Property Owner: Aspiring Investments,

LLC - Frank Bickel

Owners Address: 3583 Sand Spring Rd.

Schnecksville, PA 18078

Applicant: Same

Applicant's Address: Same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 3 story, 3 bay, brickoted brick dwelling with a mansard roof with gabled roofed dormer, paired first floor windows joined with a segmental arch, a shed roof over the entry door, and an original grocer alley door. The house dates from c. 1870 and is Eastlake Queen Anne in style. All windows are 1/1 double hung. The original wood windows on the first floor have been replaced with new vinyl windows smaller than the original. The trim and brick between the windows have been covered with coil stock aluminum.





Proposed alterations: Maintain the aluminum first floor windows and aluminum wrapped wood. Remove brickote and expose original brick. Front door will be replaced to resemble original. Replace windows on second and third floor.

Staff Approvals: n/a

Background:

HARB Case #85-69; Applicant proposes to replace a door on his property (first floor, front façade). Further details to be supplied at meeting. – TABLED. WITHDRAWN 12/9/85.

Violations: December 15, 2017: Replaced two original wood first floor windows with vinyl windows. Capped windows with aluminum.

Guideline Citation: SIS 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5. Guidelines for

Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 5. Windows

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The vinyl windows and aluminum wrapping of woodwork do not meet the historic district design guidelines and are not historically appropriate. Aluminum-clad wood windows would be an acceptable replacement window and should be sized to more appropriately fit the opening. Though the brickoted dividing post was not original, it was historically appropriate and should be uncovered (most likely was one larger window with transom above). The sill should be left exposed; it should be repaired as needed, sanded and repainted. Any additional windows should be reviewed for restoration; if they cannot be salvaged, new wood windows or aluminum-clad wood double hung windows that fit the existing opening would be appropriate.

Removal of the brickote should be done carefully to limit damage to underlying brick. Upon removal, conditions should be inspected prior to any repair/repaint/re-pointing to determine the best restoration approach.

A new door would be appropriate since the existing is not historically appropriate; the door should be a wood door, ½ lite above multiple panels.

Discussion: The applicant explained what he had done, but was agreeable to redoing the work to be historically appropriate. Historically appropriate options were discussed with him. The Historic Consultant sketched an appropriate configuration for the living room window, and all agreed that would be the best. Trim details, width and materials, were reviewed with the applicant. It was agreed that a no-rot material such as Azek could be used instead of wood. The use of aluminum clad windows or smooth fiberglass windows was discussed. The second floor windows would also be replaced and the applicant agreed to return the center window to full size.

The applicant said he wanted to remove the inappropriate metal siding on the Mansard roof. The HARB was happy to hear this. The proposed shingle was appropriate. Other items reviewed were the replacement of the inappropriate front door, the repointing of the historic brick under the brickote, and the possible replacement of the existing front entry porch.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Sell and seconded by Mr. Brobst adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

- 1. The proposal to maintain the aluminum first floor windows and undertake other renovations at 1147 W Turner Street was presented by Frank Bickel.
- 2. The living room vinyl windows will be replaced with larger aluminum clad wood or fiberglass windows per sketch. There will be a 6"-8" mullion between the new windows and the trim will be 2"-3" on either side. The trim may be a no-rot material such as Azek. No aluminum capping is permitted.
- 3. The second floor windows will be replaced with new aluminum clad wood or fiberglass windows to match the size of the existing. The center window will be returned to full size. No aluminum capping of the trim is permitted.
- 4. The existing Mansard roof siding material will be replaced with Certainteed Carriage House shingles in a slate gray color.
- 5. The existing modern style entry door will be replaced with a new wood or smooth fiberglass ½ light door with 2 lower panels, a 4 panel door, or an historic door.
- 6. The entry roof may be replaced to match the neighboring roof.
- 7. The existing failing brickote will be removed and the historic brick repointed according to Preservation Brief #2 guidelines. Soft lime-based mortar must be used.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (7-0; motion carried; Berner, Brobst, Huber, Jackson, Renaut, Roberts, Sell)