Historical Architectural Review Board COA Preliminary Review Sheet

HDC-2025-00053

Address: 427 N. Lumber Street

District: Old Allentown Historic District

Owner: Andrew Ginsburg

Applicant: Owner

Proposal: Replace front first floor window.

Building Description: The building is a two and one-half story red painted brick row house and is a composite street vernacular or Federal Victorian with Eastlake lintels. It has a gable roof with asphalt shingles and dentilated cornice. There is a single dormer, and the chimney is shared. The windows are two over two sash on the second floor and the dormer. The first floor has a large window with jalousied sides. There is a basement window grille. The main entry is single with three small squares of glass and a transom. The grocer's alley has a plain transom. The concrete stoop has a marble threshold. There is a wrought iron railing, and an Allentown bell roof. There is a garage in the rera. The modern front door and first floor window are not in keeping with the style.

Project Description:

The proposed work is to remove the existing metal louvered window and change to a vinyl picture window which will more closely match the surrounding properties. Additionally, the metal window is poorly insulated and driving up heating costs for tenants and/or future homeowners as I am considering the sale of the property as well. All the existing windows at the property are already vinyl replacement windows. Additionally, many of the buildings along Lumber Street have vinyl replacement windows.

I own a fire damaged property we are restoring right now at 1021 Linden and because all the existing windows are vinyl a replacement in kind was granted or the few windows that need to be replaced and I would seek the same approval here for the reasons stated above.



Current Front Elevation (Applicant)



Current Window Proposed to be Replaced (Applicant)



Nearby Property similar to what Applicant is proposing(Applicant)

Applicable Guidelines:

Section 3.5 – Windows

- **3.5.1** Retain and preserve historic windows and all associated components whenever possible, including window sash, frame, hardware, lintel, sill, trim, hood, shutters, and glazing (glass). Retain original windows in type, shape, size, operation, and material. Preserve existing glazing including stained glass as a distinctive feature of the window.
- **3.5.2** Keep historic wood windows in good condition by maintaining sound layers of paint at exterior and interior surfaces. Where wood has been exposed by paint failure, clean with the gentle methods possible and using lead-safe practices prior to repainting. Scrape peeling or flaking paint using hand tools down to the next sound layer of paint and ensure that the surface is clear of dirt and debris before priming and repainting.
- **3.5.3** Maintain operable windows, which have inherent energy-efficient advantages for air circulation. Remove paint that has sealed a window closed from the exterior and/or interior.
- 3.5.4 Inspect and test hardware. Ensure sash locks bring sashes together tightly to keep windows watertight.
- **3.5.5** Consider weatherization improvements that have minimal impact to historic fabric including sealing or recaulking around exterior and interior trim, installing weatherstripping, and installing storm windows (either exterior or interior) to improve energy efficiency.

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Preliminary Review Sheet

- **3.5.6** Install storm windows customized to fit each window frame properly. Wood and aluminum materials are appropriate. The horizontal rails should align with window sashes. Window finishes should match the window trim or blend with the color scheme of the building. Interior storm windows may be recommended for windows with distinctive lites, artistic glazing, or irregular shapes to preserve the exterior appearance.
- **3.5.7** Repair, restore, and reuse original windows prior to replacing them. Where one component of a window is deteriorated or broken, repair or replace the individual piece rather than replace the entire window unit. Repair or selectively replace in-kind existing hardware to ensure window operability, including sash cords, weights, and pulleys. Repaired windows have been shown to achieve energy performance levels comparable to replacement windows.
- **3.5.8** Replace windows in-kind if original windows are deteriorated beyond feasible repair. Wood is the preferred material for most replacement windows. Replacement windows should match the original as closely as possible in material, size, type, operation, profile, and appearance. Replicate the existing dimensions of glazing, configuration of muntins, or unique decorative lites. Match sash and frame thickness and window depths. For existing nonoriginal windows, it is preferred to replace with wood windows rather than new alternate materials.
- **3.5.9** Replace windows with alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Replacement windows must match the original as closely as possible in type, size, operation, profile, appearance, and configuration of lites and muntins. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an appropriate alternate because they can replicate the original appearance and material. Composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exterior surfaces can be appropriate alternates if they match the original appearance, but are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. Vinyl windows are not appropriate due to short lifespan, poor performance, and inability to match historic profiles.
- **3.5.10** Preserve the ratio of window openings to solid wall surfaces. Increasing or reducing openings can impact the proportions of a facade and can look out of place within the larger streetscape. Changing the size of openings will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a facade.
- **3.5.11** Retain the historic pattern of window openings (fenestration pattern), especially on primary facades. Avoid inserting new windows into a facade or infilling existing windows. The position, number, and arrangement of windows defines the rhythm of a facade and can be a character-defining feature of an architectural style or a type of building use. If creating new openings or infilling existing ones is necessary for a project such as an adaptive reuse, locate openings on side or rear facades.
- **3.5.12** If replacing a single window on a facade, replicate the existing windows of that facade.
- **3.5.13** Replace single-pane glazing in-kind whenever possible. Install double-glazed windows with simulated divided lights only upon consultation with Staff/HARB. Replicate the dimensions, details, and appearance of the original window. Simulated divided light muntins should be attached to the window exterior, not sandwiched between the panes of glass.
- **3.5.14** Avoid reflective glazing in restored or new windows. Reflective glazing makes a window's lites and muntins difficult to see and alters the visual impact from the street. This change makes alterations in the historic district more conspicuous. Clear (non-tinted) and non-reflective glazing and low-e coatings are appropriate.
- **3.5.15** Replace deteriorated window trim or decorative elements only as necessary to match the size, profile, and material of the original elements. For window lintels or hoods that project from the facade plane and are vulnerable to water collection, consider installing of metal drip edges to shed water away from windows. Copper is recommended and should be left to weather naturally; aluminum is acceptable and should be painted to match surrounding materials. Avoid encasing wood sills with metal or vinyl, as this will trap moisture and may cause more damage.

Section 3.6 – Doors

3.6.5 Repair and restore historic doors whenever possible rather than replace them. Historic doors include front doors, rear doors, and grocer's alley doors. Original materials should not be discarded. If repair and reuse is not possible, salvage may be an option and the existing feature used as a template for replication.

- **3.6.6** Repair, restore, and reuse existing door frames, jambs, threshold, fixed transoms, and similar components. Existing components are usually historic wood. Replace in-kind if existing materials are severely deteriorated. Replicate the profile and width of door frames, jambs, and transoms in order to preserve the solid-to-void ratio of the entrance.
- **3.6.7** Repair, restore, and reuse hardware whenever possible. Replace hardware in-kind if necessary. New hardware should match the original hardware as closely as possible if the original hardware remains. If not, hardware that is compatible with the era of construction and style of the building is recommended. Avoid replacing historic hardware with digital locks, combination locks, keypads, or similar technology.
- **3.6.8** Replace doors in-kind if repair is not feasible. Replacement doors should duplicate the original in material, design, size, profile, and operation. Original doors may be used as a template for replication. Wood is the most appropriate material for residential doors. Paneled wood doors should have the same number, size, and profile of panels as the historic door. If the original design is unknown, the building's style and date of construction should inform the appropriate replacement.
- **3.6.9** Replace with durable alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Composite wood doors and fiberglass doors are acceptable replacements if new doors match the original in size, style, configuration, detail, and appearance. However, these products are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. They have shorter lifespan and deteriorate when exposed to moisture, weathering, and temperature variation. For replacement doors, avoid metal doors (including metal doors that imitate paneled wood), as they do not have the same appearance and texture of historic wood. Avoid pre-hung doors (doors that are purchased already installed in a frame) when replacing a door, because these require the removal of historic fabric and can change the size of the opening.
- **3.6.10** Preserve the size of the existing door opening. New doors should be custom sized if necessary. Avoid enlarging or filling in original door openings to fit new stock sizes. This alteration will impact the historic character of the building. This action will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a façade.
- **3.6.11** Consider replacement of a previously altered door with a historically appropriate wood door.
- **3.6.12** Avoid replacing of a historic door solely for the purpose of improving thermal performance. This intervention is not appropriate for historic material. Install weatherproofing or a storm door prior to replacement.
- **3.6.13** Avoid creating new door openings on the primary façade. New side or rear doors should be minimally visible from the street. The size and location of new openings should be compatible with the rest of the façade. This type of work will also require a Building Permit.
- <u>8/4/2025 Observations & Comments:</u> The current existing first floor window is a metal framed window with two jalousie sashes. It is not an appropriate window per the Guidelines in materiality and operation. The applicant is proposing a fixed vinyl picture window, similar to other picture windows on the block. The applicant states that that all other windows on the house had been previously replaced with vinyl windows, and this is the only one that is not vinyl and is also not original.

While vinyl windows are not appropriate per the Guidelines, there is a unique circumstance in that all other windows on the front elevation were previously replaced with vinyl windows, and the proposed window configuration is in better keeping with other picture windows in the area than the current window

Product information showing the proposed window profiles is required for further review.

<u>8/4/2025 Staff Recommendation:</u> Pending window product information review to be submitted by applicant, staff recommend approval.

Historical Architectural Review Board COA Preliminary Review Sheet

8/4/2025 Discussion:

Mr. Jordan noted that vinyl is rarely approved in historic districts. Mr. Ginsburg stated that he wants to make the building look more historic, and that the proposed vinyl window appears more historic than the current metal window. The Board discussed that materiality is important, and appreciates the desire to create a more appropriate appearance for the window.

Mr. Ginsburg agreed to price alternative windows that meet the Guidelines. Mr. Jordan suggested that a simple picture window is appropriate, and that other lite configurations can be considered as well. The Board agreed that the configuration of the current non-historic window does not have to be matched in the replacement. Mr. Jordan suggested the applicant review the Guidelines and explore window options made of wood, aluminum-clad wood, or fiberglass.

8/4/2025 Action:

Mr. Hammond moved to table the application submitted on 8/4/2025 for the replacement of the first floor window at 427 N. Lumber Street so that the applicant can submit additional alternate windows.

Mr. Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support and no abstentions.

10/6/2025 Update: No updated materials have been submitted.

10/6/25 Discussion:

Applicant provided additional information during the 10/6/2025 HARB Meeting. The applicant is proposing a custom window with a 1 5/8" thick aluminum sash. Mr. Knee stated he was generally open to moving forward with this proposal, including conditions. Mr. Huber inquired about the finish of the window; the applicant stated that it would be a black factory-finish and would be a single fixed sash. Mr. Huber suggested that this applicant presents a unique condition in that the current window is an existing aluminum window.

<u>10/6/26 Action:</u> Mr. Huber moved to approve with conditions the application presented on 10/6/2025 for the first-floor window replacement at 427 N. Lumber Street, with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant, and found circumstances unique to the property in that a nonconforming window is being replaced:

- That it is a fixed aluminum picture window that is to be factory-finished and may be black, and needs to not decrease the sightline of the existing window
- That the final window is subject to staff approval.

Mr. Hart seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support and no abstentions.