HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA February 1, 2021

FINAL REVIEW

Case # HDC-2021-00006

Address: 301 N 8th Street

Proposal: Violation correction for new window and wall hanging signage.

Historic District: Old Allentown

Property Owner/Applicant: JB Multiservices, LLC

Address: 10 Park Blvd, Allentown PA 19104

Building description, period, style defining features: The building was constructed ca. 1927 as an auto service garage and is now used as an office. It is located on a corner lot and is set back from N. 8th Street by a parking lot. The one-story building has a chamfered corner entrance and an awning roof with a wide soffit. The primary facades are clad in brick veneer. The roof is clad with fiberglass shingles. There are four 1/1 double hung windows on the south facade and two large plate glass windows at the entrance. The entrance is a plate glass single door with fixed sidelight, accessed from a raised concrete landing and ramp with metal railing. The building's current appearance is the result of alterations in 2010 and 2011.



Proposed alterations:

- 1. Installation of new window and door signs.
- 2. Replacement of existing hanging sign with new sign.
- 3. Replacement of existing wall sign with new sign (same dimensions)

Staff Approvals: N/A

Violations:

- 1. 2020: Installation of signage without HARB review (application in response to NOV)
- 2. 2005: Installation of roof-mounted metal sign

Secretary of Interior Standards: Rehabilitation Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Design Guideline Section(s): 5: Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures: 5.11. Signage

Evaluation of Proposed Project: The proposed replacement signage appears appropriate with minor modifications and will not negatively impact the building. The building was substantially altered in 2010-11 and little to no historic fabric remains. The proposed changes will not impact original material or character-defining features. New signage is proposed to be the same dimensions or similar scale to existing and should not have an increased visual impact on the building. In reviewing this application and the location, it was deemed a serif typeface would be more appropriate and the color palette for the typeface should be white or black, remove any special characters including the dollar signs and the accent details including borders and shading should consist of dark green, black and white.

Historic District Impact: The proposed signage with recommended modifications will not negatively impact the streetscape or architectural character of the surrounding historic district, provided that the new signage is the same or similar in scale to existing signage and no new lighting or illumination is proposed.

HARB Discussion: HARB members reviewed the sign application and felt the existing signage was out of character with the architecture and character defining features of the Historic District related to the modern font used and the introduction of bright colors appearing as an anomaly in the district. HARB members' comments offered suggestions to eliminate the special characters and reduce the number of colors used throughout the signage color palette and introduce a more traditional font to help blend with the character of the surrounding neighborhood.

Recommendation(s): The proposed replacement signage with recommended modifications including using a serif typeface in white or black for lettering with the exception of the logo and the proposed color palette for accent details including borders and shading should consist of dark green, black and white. The proposed changes will satisfy the correction of the violation, is appropriate and is recommended for approval.

Action

Motion to approve the application with HARB recommended modifications was made by HARB member Shane Fillman, motion was seconded by HARB Member Pat Jackson and Michelle Olson. Motion carried with unanimous support.

HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA February 1, 2021

FINAL REVIEW

Case # HDC-2021-00005

Address: 445 N 10th Street

Proposal: Replacement or repair of existing storm door and front door including surround.

Historic District: Old Allentown

Property Owner/Applicant: Linda Rivera

Address: Same as above

Building description, period, style defining features: The building is a two-and-a-half-story, attached, residential row house. It was constructed ca. 1885 and is late Federal in style with Eastlake-influenced details. The building is red brick laid in running bond and has a side-gable roof with a prominent single dormer. The roof and dormer are clad in slate tiles, and there is a bracketed cornice with low-relief decorative frieze panels. There is a side chimney shared with 447 N. 10th Street. The windows are 1/1 sash at the second and attic stories; a ground floor picture window and three-lite transom with thick mullions; and one visible basement window grille. Second story windows have projecting sills and rectangular lintels with incised carving, and are flanked by shutters. The main entry is an 8-lite wood storm door, a partially-glazed wood door with Eastlake-style carved panels, and a louvered transom. The grocer's alley door is wood half-panel, half-slat style. Door openings have pediment lintels with incised carving. There is a raised concrete porch and stairs at the main entry. Despite some alterations, the building retains historic integrity.

Proposed alterations:

- 1. Replacement of existing stormdoor.
- 2. Replacement of existing front door and surround.

Violations: N/A

Evaluation of Proposed Project: Both doors and frames exhibit damage from past hardware replacements. There is peeling paint at both doors, but more severely at the storm door. The wood appears to be in fair condition, except for the poor condition at the lower edge portion of the front door.

The front door appears to be original based on the carved panel details, the ornate hinges, and a matching door at 431 N. 10th Street (located on the same block). The plate glass window is an alteration. It appears feasible to repair the concentrated areas of damage with a Dutchman repair, achieved by cutting away the damaged areas and patching with new wood.

The wood storm door has peeling paint, minor holes in the wood, and non-original hardware. The door and frame could similarly be repaired, gaps filled with a wood patching compound, loose paint removed with hand tools, and then primed and repainted. However, the proposed full-light storm door is acceptable per the Guidelines, which states that full-light storm doors are preferred to make the historic door visible.

Historic District Impact: The building is one of a continuous row of similar buildings between Liberty Street and North Street. All of the building have the same massing, dormers, incised lintels, and decorative cornices that allow the block to be read as a united group. The facade organization is consistent, except for the altered ground floor window of the subject building. Various minor alterations have been across the block and there are numerous types of doors and combinations of storm doors/main

entry doors. The proposed door repair and/or replacement would not impact the character or significance of this cohesive streetscape.

HARB Discussion: HARB members discussed the merits of retaining the original historic fabric of both doors since they retain so much of their original detailing. The applicant was open to retaining and restoring both doors and welcomed suggestion from HARB for appropriate contractors to undertake the work. The applicant expressed her desire to retain the doors, appreciating their architectural character and beauty and expressed her desire to replace the glass with something shatter proof and to change the color of the main door.

Recommendation(s): The ideal preservation approach is to retain and repair both doors. The front door has unique original architectural detail and can be repaired with select area Dutchman repairs and period appropriate hardware including door knob and deadbolt. The storm door can be repaired in a similar fashion. The applicant requested the ability to change the glass to something shatterproof and HARB recommended using either laminated or tempered glass, both options are appropriate and deemed acceptable for this application. HARB consultant to recommend contractors for repair and restoration of the doors and appropriate hardware manufacturers.

Action: Motion to approve the application with HARB recommended modifications stated above was made by HARB Chair David Huber, motion was seconded by HARB Member Michelle Olson. Motion carried with unanimous support.

HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD CITY OF ALLENTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA February 1, 2021

FINAL REVIEW

Case # HDC-2021-00007

Address: 529 Liberty Street

Proposal: Replacement of existing roof with new 3-tab shingles, replacement of existing beam with new

2" x 8", new fascia and decorative trim **Historic District:** Old Fairgrounds **Property Owner:** Josh Isaak

Applicant: On Top Roofing c/o Cynthia Rivera

Building description, period, style defining features: The building is a three-story, attached residential row house. The building was constructed ca. 1893 and has Queen Anne style influences. The building is red brick laid in running bond and features a front porch. The mansard roof has asphalt shingles, a chimney shared with 531 Liberty Street, and a center dormer with two windows. The windows are 1/1 sash and 3-lite basement windows below the porch. First and second story windows have segmentally-arched brick lintels. The main entry is a wood, partially-glazed double door with a single transom. The front porch has a concrete deck and entry stairs, turned wood balustrade railing, and turned wood posts supporting a low slope roof clad with asphalt shingles and metal gutter with downspouts. Facade details include decorative woodwork at second story window surrounds, cornice, and dormer; brick soldier course with accent bricks; and brick corbelling at cornice.

Proposed alterations:

- 1. Removal of existing roofing material and installation of new 3-tab shingles in charcoal.
- 2. Installation of new 2x6 rafters
- 3. Replacement of existing new beam and ledger board.
- 4. Installation of new hidden gutter and fascia with decorative trim.
- 5. All work painted to match.

Evaluation of Proposed Project: The proposed rehabilitation approach is appropriate. Existing wood framing members and substrate should be repaired and reused wherever possible. Where wood is in sufficiently deteriorated condition, in-kind replacement is appropriate. The spacing of existing and new rafters should be clarified: the existing rafter spacing appears wider than 16" on center. The proposed moldings are simple in profile and compatible with neighboring porches and should match in dimension and profile. However, wood molding should be considered instead of a PVC product. In-kind replacement of asphalt shingles is acceptable per the Guidelines and will match the non-original mansard roof shingles. The proposed work will not negatively impact the building's character-defining features.

Historic District Impact: Rehabilitation of the front porch is a desirable action to preserve a character-defining feature of the streetscape. The north side of this block has a well-defined sequence of front porches. The proposed work is consistent with the architectural character of the historic district.

HARB DISCUSSSION: HARB members requested clarification from the applicant regarding replacement of the existing underlayment as it was not called out for on the application. The applicant confirmed full replacement of the underlayment with plywood. Upon discussion with the HARB, the applicant agreed to use tongue and groove decking to match the existing. Further clarification was sought by HARB pertaining to the size and spacing of new wood members, remove or reuse of the existing (non-original) half round gutter and the treatment of the underside of the porch ceiling. The applicant proffered an explanation on each item that the wood members were proposed to meet code, the existing half round gutter would be removed and the built-in gutter restored and the underside of the porch would be clad with vinyl covering. HARB suggested maintaining the original design intent of the porch roof, including matching the size and spacing of the existing members, using tongue and groove decking and leaving the underside exposed and painted to match the existing. The applicant also confirmed the fascia molding would be wood and match the neighboring building at 531 Liberty Street in profile and dimension.

Recommendation(s): The proposed work is recommended for approval upon the clarification of the following items:

- 1. Match existing historic condition of rafter member size and spacing.
- 2. Provide wood moldings instead of proposed PVC molding and new molding to match existing on neighboring building in profile and dimension.
- 3. The existing half-round gutter and downspout will be removed and existing recessed gutter to be repaired and retained.
- 4. Underlayment to be replaced in kind, new to match existing tongue and groove decking.
- 5. The asphalt roofing material proposed is appropriate.
- 6. NOTE: HARB recommendation is to match the existing wood framing members in size and spacing, should the City of Allentown code official determine sizes and spacing are required to change to meet code, HARB would approve as an appropriate.

Action

Motion to approve the application with HARB recommended modifications stated above was made by HARB Chair David Huber, motion was seconded by HARB Member Ellen Roberts. Motion carried with unanimous support.