

**HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
CITY OF ALLENTOWN
November 1, 2021
FINAL REVIEW**

Property located at: 28 N 11th Street

Agenda Item: #3.a.

Historic District: Old Allentown

Case: HDC-2021-00013

Meeting date: April 5, 2021/ June 7, 2021/ October 4, 2021/ November 1, 2021

Property Owner/Applicant: Chelsea Capital Group LLC

Building description, period, style defining features:

This 2½-story brick row house, ca 1888, is a Queen Anne Porch house with Eastlake influences. The slate gable roof displays a single dormer, snow catchers, and a bracketed, denticulated cornice with an extensively stenciled frieze board. The dormer has a 1/1 sash replacement window. There is a single shared chimney.

The 1st and 2nd floor windows are 1/1 sash set into openings topped with incised Eastlake lintels. The main entry is a glazed single door with a transom. The porch was previously altered with the replacement of the turned balustrades with a smooth board façade. Turned wood balustrades were reinstalled. There is a grocer's alley door with a transom and an incised Eastlake lintel. There are concrete steps.



Proposed alterations:

Applicant submitted application for review in April 2021 at which time the HARB granted a 60-day extension (see April meeting minutes for full details) An additional 60-day extension was granted in June and a final extension granted in August.

The applicant has decided to pursue only the replacement of the inappropriate support that was installed as a response to a housing violation until a coordinated effort is made to reconstruct the porches on the block.

The October 4th submission also includes replacement of windows that were changed previously without HARB approval. The HARB granted a one-month extension for the applicant to pursue a custom column as well as windows of an appropriate color.

Applicant submitted a custom porch column quote, scope of work and two window options (on aluminum and one aluminum clad)

Staff Approvals:

1. None

Violations:

1. 2004: Replacement of front porch balustrade-reversed

Prior COA(s): None

Secretary of Interior Standards:

Standard #2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Design Guidelines Section 5-Windows:

Replacement: The Replacement of a window refers to the installation of a new custom sized wood window sash into the existing window frame. Window replacement is recommended only for windows with irreparable deterioration. If the repair of a window is not possible and replacement is required, the replacement window unit should match the historic window unit in design, dimension and pane configuration. The replacement of an historic wood window with a new wood, aluminum clad wood, smooth fiberglass, or wood composite window requires staff approval. In all cases, the appearance of true divided lights on an historic window must be retained through the use of simulated divided lights (SDL) on the new window. All other requests for window replacement require HARB approval.

- Replacement of historic wood windows on a primary facade with a new wood, aluminum clad wood, smooth fiberglass, or wood composite windows may be acceptable depending on the condition of the existing historic wood windows.
- Replacement of historic windows on secondary facades with alternate materials requires staff approval. Specifications of new window must be provided to staff for approval.
- Replacement windows must match the size of the existing historic windows. Reducing the size of the window opening is not typically permitted.
- Improvements in thermal performance can be achieved through repairing historic windows and installing interior or exterior storm windows. The replacement of historic window units with new window units to improve thermal performance is not recommended. (See energy efficiency)

Design Guideline Section 7-Porches, Stoops and Steps:

If features of porches and stoops require replacement, the component used for replacement should replicate the historic material, configuration, dimension, detail and design.

- Use of vinyl railing systems and unpainted pressure treated lumber is typically not appropriate.

Evaluation of Proposed Project:

The existing 6x6 post is an inappropriate alteration and requires reversal. The lumber post does not match the existing historic porch features and is not consistent with the Design Guidelines. The replacement of the lumber post with a new custom turned wood post that replicates the historic post is appropriate. The proposed custom post is to be fabricated to match the existing middle porch column in size, profile, dimension, and appearance. The custom in-kind replacement is an appropriate treatment.

The poor condition of the porch roof and base has been noted in past reviews. The replacement of the lumber post with a new wood post will not address all existing structural and appearance issues.

The proposed replacement of the inappropriate replacement windows appears to be appropriate. The window openings are proposed to be returned to their original dimensions and new frames will be installed. The proposed window options are double-hung aluminum or aluminum-clad wood windows. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an acceptable alternate according to the Guidelines. The proposed windows are 1-over-1 and will match the original windows and existing windows at this facade.

Historic District Impact:

The replacement of the lumber post with a new historically appropriate wood post will have a positive impact on the surrounding historic district. The existing lumber post negatively impacts the surrounding district as a highly visible inappropriate repair and replacement. The correction of the inappropriately altered windows will have a positive impact on the historic district by returning the openings to their original dimensions.

Recommendation(s):

It is recommended to replace the existing lumber post with a new wood post. The proposed custom turned wood post that replicates the historic turned wood post in size, dimension, profile, appearance, material, and finish is the preferred treatment. The design of the post should match the existing turned wood post at middle of porch. When replacing the column, retain all existing surrounding historic porch material, including but not limited to wood balustrades, intermediate full-height post, and newel post.

The proposed window replacement appears to be appropriate by correcting the windows altered without HARB approval. The new aluminum-clad wood windows are consistent with the Guidelines and the window openings will be returned to their original dimensions. New wood frames, brick molds, and trim should match the original. Aluminum-clad wood windows are recommended over aluminum windows due to their better performance and appearance.

The repair and restoration of the porch base and steps is still recommended. Previous recommendations and HARB discussion should be considered.

HARB Discussion

- Part 1: Porch Repairs, the applicant proposed a like-for-like replacement which the HARB unanimously approved.
- Part 2: Window Replacement, the applicant proposed aluminum clad windows, custom sized to fit the original masonry openings and provide necessary repairs to surrounding masonry and wood trim. The windows meet the Guidelines and were unanimously approved by HARB.

Action

- Part 1-Porch Repairs: A motion to approve the custom turned yellow pine column fabricated to match the original in profile and dimension.
- Part 2-Window Replacement: A motion to approve aluminum clad Majesty line windows manufactured by Harvey, to replicate the original size and one over one configuration. The color will be almond and the one existing window to remain will be painted to match.

The Motion (Parts 1 & 2) was made by HARB chair David Huber, motion was seconded by HARB member AJ Jordan. Motion carried with unanimous support.