CITY OF ALLENTOWN HISTORIC ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD FINAL REVIEW SHEET February 5, 2018

Case # HDC-2018-00002 Proposal to maintain the front door hardware and trim on façade.

Property located at: 329 N. 9th St. Agenda # 4 Historic District: Old Allentown Case # HDC-2018-00002 Meeting date: February 5, 2018 Property Owner: MK Barreto Real Estate Holding, LLC Owners Address: 322 Grandview Blvd., Bethlehem PA 18018 Applicant: same Applicant's Address: same

Building description, period, style, defining features: This structure is a 3 story, 3 bay attached brick dwelling with a mansard roof covered with siding, a unique tower-roofed dormer with triple 1/1 windows, Eastlake carved lintels, stone foundation, non-original front door, and concrete steps (previously had a concrete porch with decorative panels). There is a grocer's alley of original design with a transom and an overhead light. The house dates from c. 1885 and is Eastlake Queen Anne in style.



Proposed alterations: Maintain the front door hardware and trim on facade **Staff Approvals:** Staff Approval Per COA 2002-30:

- 1. Demolish existing front stoop back to existing structure
- 2. Install concrete steps and stoop with bull-nosed edging
- 3. Install black wrought iron handrails. Balusters to be square stock.
- 4. Repair brick behind demolished porch stoop. Separate Staff Approval required for stucco treatment if brick repair not feasible

Background:

HARB Case #HDC-2013-00031: Proposed to demolish front porch stoop and install brick and blue stone stoop. Also, restore wall and basement windows behind existing stoop. RESULT: Application withdrawn. Received a COA to replace the "Allentown" porch stoop w/a brick and blue stone stoop back in 2002 (#2002-30) Staff approval based on plans submitted for building permit.

HARB Case #2002-30 – Approved December 2, 2002; approved by City Council December 18, 2002

Approved Alterations: Remove Allentown porch roof; replace concrete porch with either bull nosed concrete steps or brick and slate steps; install plain black wrought iron railings to the

steps; <u>remove the plastic grid from existing door or install a six-panel wood or metal door;</u> replace the missing basement window grille to match the existing grille.

Violations: December 26, 2017 – Replaced door hardware and repaired hand rail. **Guideline Citation: SIS 9**. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. **Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts: Allentown Guidelines for Historic Districts:** 5. Guidelines for Existing Buildings and Structures, 1. Repairs, Replacement and Alternative Materials, 6. Doors

Evaluation, effect on historic district, recommendations: The new door entry lock set is not historically appropriate; it replaced an inappropriate entry knob. The existing door was required to be either modified or replaced in 2002. The door should be replaced to be in compliance with a half light door with 2 panels or a solid 4 panel door. The need for ADA compliant hardware is understandable since this is now a multi-unit residential property; however keyless systems are not required or necessary and are not appropriate in style for the historic district. Ideally, a new, historically appropriate door and new entry set should be installed. A historically appropriate lockset would be a deadbolt above a lever, either with a single back plate, or separate. If a keyless deadbolt is a necessity, then a historically appropriate design should be utilized similar to below.

Regarding trim, it appears that new 2 x 4 blocking was installed at the metal handrails. If properly anchored into the concrete stairs, attachment to house shouldn't be needed as seen at neighboring property. The blocking should be removed and existing trim repaired and repainted. *Example: Schlage Touch Keyless Touchscreen Deadbolt with Camelot trim paired with Accent Lever with Camelot trim in Aged Bronze*





Discussion: The discussion focused on the type of hardware that would automatically lock. The option suggested by the Historic Consultant did not function that way. Ultimately it was agreed that the most problematic aspect of the lock installed without approval was the metal color. The applicant said he would look for a similar lock in a dark bronze color.

The door replacement required by the COA in 2002 was addressed. The applicant agreed to replace the existing inappropriate door with a smooth fiberglass 1/2 light door with 2 lower panels or a 6 panel door.

Lastly the 2 x 4 blocking and handrails were discussed. The HARB agreed that the 2 x 4s would have to be removed. It was noticed that the handrails installed did not match each other and did not have the appropriate configuration to mount into the concrete. The HARB requested new handrails be installed with straight balusters, traditional top rail, and posts mounted into the concrete stoop. The handrails could be powder coated steel or aluminum.

Motion: The HARB upon motion by Mr. Brobst and seconded by Ms. Roberts adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work described herein:

- 1. The proposal to maintain the front door hardware and trim on façade at 329 N 9th Street was presented by Kenneth Barreto.
- 2. New keyless entry hardware will be installed that is dark bronze in color. The new locks must have staff approval.
- 3. The existing door will be replaced with a new smooth fiberglass door with ½ light and 2 lower panels or 6 panels. The new door must have staff approval.
- 4. The 2x4 wood blocking must be removed.
- 5. New handrails with straight balusters, traditional top rail, and posts drilled and mounted into the concrete stoop. The railings can be powder coated aluminum or steel. The new handrails must have staff approval.

The proposal to recommend a COA was unanimously approved. (7-0; motion carried; Berner, Brobst, Huber, Jackson, Renaut, Roberts, Sell)