HDC-2023-00076 Address: 1143 W. Linden Street District: Old Allentown Historic District Applicant: Rick Sherer, Contractor Proposal: Replace non-historic bow window with three double-hung sash windows.

Building Description:

This 3-story brick row house, c. 1895, is Queen Anne in style and features a mansard roof with a large, central dormer. The dormer includes a tripartite window with Queen-Anne detailing in the flanking windows. Brick corbeling exists at the cornice line, and the second story includes three one-over-one double-hung sash windows with decorative segmental arches. The first story has been altered and is clad in aluminum siding with a bow window and recessed entry door. The basement retains two windows and the original metal grilles.

Project Description:

This application proposes to remove the non-historic first-story bay window at the front façade and replace it with three one-over-one double-hung windows in a composite material. The new windows would be installed between six-inch painted wood mullions.



Front façade of 1143 W. Linden Street, 2021. (Google StreetView)

Detail of bow window, 2021. (Google StreetView)



Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.5 – Windows

3.5.7 Repair, restore, and reuse original windows prior to replacing them. Where one component of a window is deteriorated or broken, repair or replace the individual piece rather than replace the entire window unit. Repair or selectively replace in-kind existing hardware to ensure window operability, including sash cords, weights, and pulleys. Repaired windows have been shown to achieve energy performance levels comparable to replacement windows.

3.5.8 Replace windows in-kind if original windows are deteriorated beyond feasible repair. Wood is the preferred material for most replacement windows. Replacement windows should match the original as closely as possible in material, size, type, operation, profile, and appearance. Replicate the existing dimensions of glazing, configuration of muntins, or unique decorative lites. Match sash and frame thickness and window depths. For existing non-original windows, it is preferred to replace with wood windows rather than new alternate windows.

3.5.9 Replace windows with alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Replacement windows must match the original as closely as possible in type, size, operation, profile, appearance, and configuration of lites and muntins. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an appropriate alternate because they can replicate the original appearance and material. Composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exterior surfaces can be appropriate alternates if they match the original appearance, but are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. Vinyl windows are not appropriate due to short lifespan, poor performance, and inability to match historic profiles.

3.5.10 Preserve the ratio of window openings to solid wall surfaces. Increasing or reducing openings can impact the proportions of a façade and can look out of place within the larger streetscape. Changing the size of openings will also require a Building Permit because it changes the amount of enclosed space on a façade.

3.5.11 Retain the historic pattern of window openings (fenestration pattern), especially on primary facades. Avoid inserting new windows into a façade or infilling existing windows. The position, number, and arrangement of windows defines the rhythm of a façade and can be a character-defining feature of an architectural style or a type of building use. If

creating new openings or infilling existing ones is necessary for a project such as an adaptive reuse, locate openings on side or rear facades.

3.5.12 If replacing a single window on a façade, replicate the existing windows of that façade.

Observations & Comments:

The existing bow window is an alteration of the original design, which likely consisted of two one-over-one double-hung sash windows at the first story with a single entryway. The 1932 Sanborn map indicates that the property was a dwelling and likely had not yet been altered from its original residential appearance. Staff presumes that the first-story brick was removed and a storefront was inserted into the ground story at some point in the mid-twentieth century, though no documentation has been found. Staff contends that the existing bow window has no architectural or historical significance and that the proposed configuration would be acceptable and would comply with the guidelines, specifically Guideline 3.5.10.

Regarding the material, staff notes that the proposed windows would be Kolbe Forgent series, which is a composite of fiberglass and a UV stable polymer. The combination of fiberglass and a polymer is not a composite material typically approved. Typical composites include wood and a polymer. Guideline 3.5.9 allows for composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exteriors, and staff asks that the HARB determine whether the Kolbe Forgent windows comply with the guideline as a fiberglass and polymer composite.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval, provided an appropriate wood, aluminum-clad wood, or composite window is installed, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.5 Windows.

HARB Discussion:

The HARB discussed whether the Kolbe Forgent fiberglass and polymer material would comply with the guidelines. Mr. Sherer offered to change the window to an Andersen product, which is a composite of wood and fiberglass, but asked that the HARB consider the Kolbe Forgent window, which is his preference. Ms. Keller added that the HARB may see additional applications for Kolbe Forgent in the near future and would like to understand whether the HARB feels the material complies with the guidelines. The HARB agreed that the material could be approved as a paintable composite under Guideline 3.5.9.

Action:

Mr. Huber moved to approve the application on 11/6/2023 to replace the existing bow window with three composite oneover-one double-hung windows, pursuant to Section 3, Chapter 3.5 Windows. Mr. Lichtenwalner seconded the motion, which carried with unanimous support.