



CITY OF ALLENTOWN

No. 30470

RESOLUTION

R98 - 2022

*Introduced by the Administration on June 15, 2022*

---

Denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness – 617 N. 6<sup>th</sup> Street

---

***Resolved by the Council of the City of Allentown, That***

**WHEREAS** a Certificate of Appropriateness is required under the provisions of the Act of the General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania No.167, June 13, 1961 (P.L.282) known as the Pennsylvania Historic District Act; and City of Allentown has adopted a Historic District Ordinance, Article 1391, under the provisions allowed in the Pennsylvania Historic District Act; and

**WHEREAS** the owner, Manuel Fernandez, applied to the Historical Architectural Review Board (HARB) for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install vinyl windows at the front façade of the property, as described on the attached final report; and

**WHEREAS** the HARB held a meeting on said matter on June 6, 2022, where the applicant was in attendance via a computing device; and

**WHEREAS** based on the statements and evidence presented, the HARB made the following findings of fact, as detailed in the attached case report:


1. The existing windows are vinyl and are a replacement of the building's original windows.
2. HARB members agreed that vinyl is not an acceptable replacement material according to Guideline 3.5.9.
3. A range of appropriate replacement materials for non-original, previously altered windows is allowed by the Guidelines.

**WHEREAS**, based on the above findings of fact, the HARB agreed on the motion not to allow the windows as proposed, and the recommended to City Council denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness as detailed in the attached case report.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** by the Council of the City of Allentown that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby denied for the above referenced alteration.

	Yea	Nay
Candida Affa	X	
Ce-Ce Gerlach	X	
Daryl Hendricks	X	
Natalie Santos	X	
Joshua Siegel	X	
Ed Zucal	X	
Cynthia Y. Mota, President	X	
TOTAL	7	0

***THIS IS TO CERTIFY, That the above copy of Resolution No. 30470 was adopted by the City Council of Allentown on the 20<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2022, and is on file in the City Clerk's Office.***

  
**City Clerk**

**HDC-2022-00023****Address: 617 N. 6<sup>th</sup> Street****Applicant: Manuel Fernandez, Owner****HARB Meeting Date: June 6, 2022****Building Description:**

This building is located in the Old Fairgrounds Historic District. This 3-story brick row house, ca 1911 is a porch house. The 3<sup>rd</sup> floor mansard had shingles, a double dormer with gable roof, 1/1 sash windows and aluminum awning. The 2<sup>nd</sup> floor has a bay with 1/1 sash windows and decorative brick string across the front. The 1<sup>st</sup> floor has a picture window with a stained-glass transom, a single  $\frac{3}{4}$  glazed door and concrete porch with brick knee walls with wrought iron columns and a visible basement window.

**Project Description:**

Provided by Applicant and Staff: Replace 2 vinyl windows in 3<sup>rd</sup> floor front façade with vinyl windows of the same size.

**Primary Façade (Google Street View)****Applicable Guidelines:****3.5 Windows**

**3.5.9** Replace windows with alternate materials if in-kind replacement is not feasible. Replacement windows must match the original as closely as possible in type, size, operation, profile, appearance, and configuration of lites and muntins. Aluminum-clad wood windows are an appropriate alternate because they can replicate the original appearance and material. Composite wood or fiberglass windows with paintable exterior surfaces can be appropriate alternates if they match the original appearance but are not recommended from a sustainability perspective. Vinyl windows are not appropriate due to short lifespan, poor performance, and inability to match historic profiles.



**Observations & Recommendations:**

Installation of new vinyl windows is not consistent with the Guidelines, specifically Guideline 3.5.9. Replacement of existing vinyl windows is appropriate; however, an alternative replacement material—such as aluminum-clad wood windows—would be appropriate.

---

**HARB Discussion:**

No one present for the application.

Discussion among HARB members on replacement of non-original windows, and the definition of in-kind replacement. It was determined that in-kind replacement refers to original and historic material and not what might be present currently. A range of appropriate replacement materials for non-original, previously-altered windows is allowed by the Guidelines.

GL stated vinyl is not an acceptable replacement material according to the Guidelines.

**Action:**

HARB member Glenn Lichtenwalner made a motion to deny the application presented *on 06/06/22* for replacement of 2 vinyl windows on the 3rd floor front façade at *617 N. 6th Street* as submitted and finds the application is not in compliance with Chapter 3, Section 3.5 Windows of the Historic District Design Guidelines. Recommendation is for applicant to comply with in-kind replacement materials and acceptable alternative materials as described in the Historic District Design Guidelines and there are no unique circumstances to this application.

Motion to deny made by HARB member Glenn Lichtenwalner motion was seconded by HARB Chair, David Huber. Motion carried with unanimous support.