

HDC-2022-00047**Address: 402 N. 6th Street AKA 611 and 615 W. Gordon Street****District: Old Fairgrounds Historic District****Applicant: Joel Alpha, Joel Alpha Home Improvements, LLC****Proposal: Replace slate roof with asphalt shingles**

Building Description:

This 3-story brick row house, c. 1841, is a commercial and residential structure. There is a flat roof with a dentilated cornice and single chimney. The 2nd and 3rd floor have 2/2 sash with flat lintels. On the 1st floor there are several entries; the large main double glazed door entrance has diamond shaped windows on both sides and above the front door, it also has a gable roof with Tutor wood pieces between the roof and door, decorative wood brackets, scroll-sawn ends and asphalt shingles. The 2nd front entry is a single door covered by an Allentown porch roof with cyma-curve profile, open roof ends, decorative wood brackets, scroll-sawn rafter ends and asphalt shingles. There are two basement window grilles and a concrete stoop/step with railing at both entries.

A side entry/porch has been enclosed with a bank of windows with 6/1 sashes and transoms. The Allentown porch roof is a cymna-curve profile, with closed ends, hidden rafters and asphalt shingles. The side entries have concrete stoop/steps with metal railings with a combination of a metal awning, half-circle awning and Allentown porch roof with cymna-curve profile, closed ends, hidden rafters and asphalt shingles. There is a fire escape and garage on the side of the building.

Project Description:

This application proposes to replace the slate of the gable roofs at 402 N. 6th Street (AKA 611 and 615 W. Gordon Street) with a dimensional asphalt shingle, such as GAF Timberline shingles. The roofing work appears to have been started by another contractor without permits or a COA and stopped at the request of a building inspector. In its current state, the building retains some slate, has some areas with replacement asphalt shingles, and has some areas where slate has been removed and no shingles have been installed. These areas are tarped and require immediate action.

The applicant is proposing to retain the roofing work began by the previous contractor and to move forward with removal of the remaining slate and installation of asphalt shingles. On September 6, 2022, staff approved the replacement of the adjacent flat roofs only.



402 N. 6th Street showing gable roof replacement, September 2022.
(Applicant)



402 N. 6th Street remaining slate. (Applicant)

Applicable Guidelines:

Chapter 3.1 – Roofs

3.1.3 Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

3.1.6 Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

3.1.7 If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

Observations & Comments:

The applicant contends that the existing slate requires replacement, because the fasteners have disintegrated and are not currently holding the slate shingles on the roof. The applicant is proposing to install GAF Timberline shingles in the pewter color to match the asphalt shingles that were installed by a previous contractor without a permit.

The staff suggests replacing the slate with a product that more closely matches the historic slate in dimension, shape, profile, color, exposure, and overall appearance, such as GAF Slateline. Replacement asphalt shingles are recommended to have straight cuts and even exposures to resemble historic slate. The staff requests that the HARB consider whether the owner may retain the asphalt shingles that were installed without a permit or COA, or if the shingles should be replaced with a more appropriate product.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, provided that the roofing material matches the historic slate in dimension, shape, profile, color, exposure, and overall appearance.

HARB Discussion:

Vice Chair AJ requested clarification of roof areas proposed for replacement of shingles and requested the applicant present findings warranting the replacement versus repair of the existing slate that remains.

Applicant JA stated the previous contractor removed sections of slate and replaced select areas with asphalt shingles and left areas of the roof tarped, with no waterproofing or finished shingle or slate. The proposed approach is to add asphalt roof shingles to match the existing using gray Timberline replacement shingles. GL and Vice Chair AJ stated the material is not in keeping with the Guidelines.

JA stated the existing tarped locations are actively leaking and in need of a permanent repair.

JA proposed an alternate material to slate, StormMaster Slate asphalt shingles, manufactured by Atlas. AJ and PH concur the product proposed is compatible in shape, texture and color to the original slate and is more appropriate than the Timberline product in locations of replacement.

AJ recommended replacing the entire roof with the replacement material proposed for consistency and aesthetic continuity.

Discussion took place regarding the legal recognition of 402 N. 6th St. as one tax parcel with AKA addresses of 611 W. Gordon Street.

Action:

HARB Vice Chair AJ Jordan made a motion to approve the application presented on *09/12/2022* for the roofing replacement at *402 N. 6th Street (AKA 611 W. Gordon Street)* with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant to use the alternative slate material presented and that all roofs be replaced with this material and finds that the application is in compliance with the following sections of the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, and finds that there are not circumstances unique to the property. HARB member Glenn Lichtenwalner seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.