

**HDC-2022-00068****Address: 433 N. 11th Street****District: Old Allentown Historic District****Applicant: R. Joshua Weber, East Penn Roofing****Proposal: Replace slate roof with asphalt shingles****Building Description:**

This 2½-story brick row house, ca 1897, is a Federal/Victorian house. The gable roof has a dormer, dentilated cornice, slate shingles and a single shared chimney with drip ledges. The windows are 2/2 sash with flat wood lintels. The main entry is a single glazed door with a transom and an aluminum storm door. There is a concrete stoop and a visible basement window grille. There is a shared grocer's alley door. The back yard (1½ lots) has a cyclone fence and an addition with sliding glass doors.

**Project Description:**

This application proposes to replace the slate roof at 433 N. 11<sup>th</sup> Street with Owens Corning Duration dimensional asphalt shingles in the color Colonial Slate. The front slope and dormer cheek walls are visible from N. 11<sup>th</sup> Street. The scope of work includes the front and rear gable, but not the vertical slope at the rear that is currently clad in slate shingles. The rear roof is not visible from Howard Street, owing to vegetation.



Existing slate roof at 433 N. 11th Street, 2019.  
(Google StreetView)



Existing slate roof at 433 N. 11th Street.  
(Applicant)



Existing slate roof at 433 N. 11th Street.  
(Applicant)



Existing rear slate roof at 433 N. 11th Street.  
(Applicant)



Existing rear slate roof at 433 N. 11th Street.  
(Applicant)



Owens Corning Duration shingles in Colonial Slate

### Applicable Guidelines:

#### **Chapter 3.1 – Roofs**

**3.1.3** Repair and restore original and historic roofing materials whenever possible. Evaluate the condition and cost of repair of original materials before removing and replacing them. Targeted areas of repair or localized in-kind replacement may be the most effective and low-cost solution.

**3.1.6** Replace historic roofing materials in-kind whenever possible if severe deterioration makes a full replacement necessary. Replacement material should match the original in material, dimension, shape, profile, color, pattern, exposure, and overall appearance.

**3.1.7** If in-kind replacement is not feasible, replace historic roofing materials with alternate materials that resemble the original as closely as possible. Roof replacement should be sensitive to the original appearance. Replacement materials should match roof slopes or shape.

**Observations & Comments:**

The applicant contends that the existing slate requires replacement because the slate is highly deteriorated. Staff notes that the condition photos show that several areas of slate are broken, missing, and displaced and the condition of the roof is generally poor. The applicant is proposing to install a dimensional asphalt shingle with exaggerated tapering that would differ in shape and color from the existing slate. The proposed shingles do not comply with Guideline 3.1.6. Staff recommends using a shingle that more closely replicates the existing slate in dimension, shape, profile, color, exposure, and overall appearance, such as GAF Slateline or a synthetic slate.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Approval, pursuant to Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, provided that the new roofing material matches the historic slate in dimension, shape, profile, color, exposure, and overall appearance.

---

**HARB Discussion:**

HARB Vice Chair AJ agreed with the staff recommendation and clarified he opposed the multi-colored, shake design proposed in the application.

AT, contractor present for the application requested leniency for cost reasons to allow use of 3-tab singles instead of Slateline series. GL asked if other manufacturers were researched for alternative, more cost-effective solutions. MK stated the HARB has previously approved the use of Atlas StormMaster Slate asphalt shingles to replicate slate which was cheaper than Slateline. AT agreed to look into using this alternative product.

**Action:**

HARB Vice Chair AJ Jordan moved to approve w/conditions the application presented on 11/7/2022 for the roofing replacement at 433 N. 11th Street with the following conditions agreed to by the applicant: the slate replacement material be of a type/manufacture previously approved by the HARB and must be submitted for staff review and approval in a color that replicates the original as closely as possible, and finds compliance with the following sections of the Guidelines for Historic Districts: Chapter 3, Section 3.1 Roofs, and finds that there are not circumstances unique to the property. HARB member Phillip Hart seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.